



---

Theses and Dissertations

---

2005-07-05

## Research on Minority-girl Education in China: Critique and Recommendations

Jiesu Luo  
Brigham Young University - Provo

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/etd>



Part of the [Educational Leadership Commons](#)

---

### BYU ScholarsArchive Citation

Luo, Jiesu, "Research on Minority-girl Education in China: Critique and Recommendations" (2005). *Theses and Dissertations*. 594.

<https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/etd/594>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by BYU ScholarsArchive. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of BYU ScholarsArchive. For more information, please contact [scholarsarchive@byu.edu](mailto:scholarsarchive@byu.edu), [ellen\\_amatangelo@byu.edu](mailto:ellen_amatangelo@byu.edu).

RESEARCH ON MINORITY-GIRL EDUCATION IN CHINA:  
CRITIQUE AND RECOMMENDATIONS

by

Jiesu Luo

A thesis submitted to the faculty of

Brigham Young University

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Education

Department of Educational Leadership and Foundations

Brigham Young University

April 2005



Copyright © 2004 Jiesu Luo

All Rights Reserved



BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY

GRADUATE COMMITTEE APPROVAL

of a thesis submitted by

Jiesu Luo

This thesis has been read by each member of the following graduate committee and by majority vote has been found to be satisfactory.

April 7, 2005  
Date

E. Vance Randall  
E. Vance Randall, Chair

April 7, 2005  
Date

Donald B. Holsinger  
Donald B. Holsinger

April 7, 2005  
Date

Macleans A. Geo-JaJa  
Macleans A. Geo-JaJa



BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY

As chair of the candidate's graduate committee, I have read the thesis of Jiesu Luo in its final form and have found that (1) its format, citations, and bibliographical style are consistent and acceptable and fulfill university and department style requirements; (2) its illustrative materials including figures, tables, and charts are in place; and (3) the final manuscript is satisfactory to the graduate committee and is ready for submission to the university library.

April 7, 2005  
Date

E. Vance Randall  
E. Vance Randall  
Chair, Graduate Committee

Accepted for the Department  
Educational Leadership and Foundations

E. Vance Randall  
E. Vance Randall  
Department Chair

Accepted for the College  
David McKay College of Education

K. Richard Young  
K. Richard Young  
Dean, David McKay College of Education





## ABSTRACT

### RESEARCH ON MINORITY-GIRL EDUCATION IN CHINA: CRITIQUE AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Jiesu Luo

Department of Educational Leadership and Foundations

Master of Education

Minority-girl education in China is a new field of research. This study seeks to explore into this field through reviewing and analyzing the available studies that have been done. The literature has been collected through searching library holdings, Computer Assisted Research Search, and online searching. The criteria against which the literature is to be reviewed and analyzed are in the form of questions and are divided into six categories of introduction, theoretical framework, method, results, discussion (conclusion/recommendations), and abstract or summary; so that all the aspects of a



study can be examined. The research field of minority-girl education in China is found to be improving. A summary of the current educational practices concerning minority-girl education in China and the challenges the minority girls face when it comes to education is made after the literature collected has been reviewed. Recommendations on future research orientations are made based on the findings.



## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to say thanks to:

Dr. E. Vance Randall, for your fatherly guidance and patience;

Dr. Donald B. Holsinger and Dr. Macleans A. Geo-JaJa, for your willingness to work around my schedule;

My parents, for sending me to school even though I am a minority girl, and more;

My sister and friend Qianlai, for she never failed to answer my call of help.



---

TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| ABSTRACT .....   | v   |
| ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .....                                      | vii |
| TABLE OF CONTENTS .....                                    | ix  |
| CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION .....                            | 1   |
| PRELUDE: SIGNS OF THE PROBLEM .....                        | 1   |
| <i>Story (1)</i> .....                                     | 1   |
| <i>Story (2)</i> .....                                     | 2   |
| <i>Story (3)</i> .....                                     | 3   |
| INTRODUCTION .....   | 5   |
| CONCEPTUALIZING MINORITY GIRLS .....                       | 5   |
| MINORITY-GIRL EDUCATION IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES .....      | 5   |
| SITUATING THE PROBLEM IN CHINA .....                       | 9   |
| STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM .....                             | 18  |
| PURPOSE OF THE STUDY .....                                 | 19  |
| RESEARCH QUESTIONS .....                                   | 19  |
| METHODOLOGY .....  | 20  |
| OUTLINE OF THE STUDY .....                                 | 22  |
| SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY .....                            | 23  |
| SUMMARY .....  | 25  |
| CHAPTER TWO: METHODOLOGY .....                             | 26  |
| INTRODUCTION .....   | 26  |
| LITERATURE COLLECTION .....                                | 26  |
| <i>Library Holdings</i> .....                              | 26  |
| <i>Computer Assisted Research Search (CARS)</i> .....      | 28  |
| <i>Online Searches</i> .....                               | 30  |
| <i>International Organization Websites Searching</i> ..... | 31  |
| <i>Course Materials Searching</i> .....                    | 32  |
| LITERATURE CLASSIFICATION AND TRANSLATION .....            | 32  |
| GUIDELINES FOR ANALYSIS .....                              | 33  |
| <i>Introduction</i> .....                                  | 34  |
| <i>Theoretical Framework</i> .....                         | 34  |
| <i>Method</i> .....  | 36  |
| <i>Results</i> .....                                       | 36  |



|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)</i> .....      | 36        |
| <i>Abstract or Summary</i> .....                              | 36        |
| CRITERIA.....   | 36        |
| <i>Group I, Practice</i> .....                                | 37        |
| <i>Group II, Speculations</i> .....                           | 39        |
| <i>Group III, Research Reports on Specific Problems</i> ..... | 41        |
| SUMMARY .....   | 46        |
| <b>CHAPTER THREE: RESULTS</b> .....                           | <b>47</b> |
| INTRODUCTION .....  | 47        |
| SEARCH RESULTS.....   | 47        |
| LITERATURE CLASSIFICATION .....                               | 48        |
| RESULTS (1): CRITERIA APPLIED .....                           | 49        |
| <i>Table 3-1</i> .....  | 50        |
| <i>Discussion (Table 3-1)</i> .....                           | 53        |
| <i>Table 3-2</i> .....  | 55        |
| <i>Discussion (Table 3-2)</i> .....                           | 58        |
| <i>Table 3-3</i> .....  | 61        |
| <i>Discussion (Table 3-3)</i> .....                           | 62        |
| DISCUSSION .....  | 65        |
| RESULTS (2).....  | 68        |
| SUMMARY .....   | 79        |
| <b>CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....       | <b>81</b> |
| INTRODUCTION .....  | 81        |
| FINDINGS.....   | 82        |
| <i>Finding (1)</i> .....                                      | 82        |
| <i>Finding (2)</i> .....                                      | 82        |
| <i>Finding (3)</i> .....                                      | 83        |
| <i>Finding (4)</i> .....                                      | 84        |
| <i>Finding (5)</i> .....                                      | 84        |
| <i>Finding (6)</i> .....                                      | 84        |
| RECOMMENDATIONS .....   | 85        |
| <i>Recommendation (1)</i> .....                               | 85        |
| <i>Recommendation (2)</i> .....                               | 86        |
| <i>Recommendation (3)</i> .....                               | 86        |
| <i>Recommendation (4)</i> .....                               | 87        |
| <i>Recommendation (5)</i> .....                               | 87        |
| SUMMARY .....   | 88        |

---

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| REFERENCES.....  | 90  |
| APPENDIX 1: FIFTY-SIX ETHNIC GROUPS IN CHINA.....                  | 108 |
| APPENDIX 2: FIVE AUTONOMOUS REGIONS IN CHINA.....                  | 110 |
| APPENDIX 3: PICTURE OF THE TWO YI GIRLS IN STORY #3.....           | 111 |
| APPENDIX 4: THE MINORITY AUTONOMOUS PREFECTURES IN CHINA.....      | 112 |
| APPENDIX 5: THE MAP OF CHINA WITH MARKED WEST CHINA.....           | 114 |
| APPENDIX 6: URBANIZATION OF MINORITIES AND HAN.....                | 115 |
| APPENDIX 7: PER PUPIL EXPENDITURE IN URBAN AND RURAL AREAS.....    | 118 |
| APPENDIX 8: STUDIES IN GROUP I.....                                | 119 |
| APPENDIX 9: STUDIES IN GROUP II.....                               | 131 |
| APPENDIX 10: STUDIES IN GROUP III.....                             | 144 |
| APPENDIX 11: DETAILED RESULTS.....                                 | 150 |
| A11-1: GROUP I-INTRODUCTION.....                                   | 150 |
| A11-2: GROUP I-METHOD.....   | 161 |
| A11-3: GROUP I-RESULTS.....  | 167 |
| A11-4: GROUP I-DISCUSSION (CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS).....    | 176 |
| A11-5: GROUP I-ABSTRACT OR SUMMARY.....                            | 185 |
| A11-6: GROUP II-INTRODUCTION.....                                  | 187 |
| A11-7: GROUP II-METHOD.....  | 200 |
| A11-8: GROUP II-RESULTS.....                                       | 206 |
| A11-9: GROUP II-DISCUSSION (CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS).....   | 214 |
| A11-10: GROUP II-ABSTRACT OR SUMMARY.....                          | 222 |
| A11-11: GROUP III-INTRODUCTION.....                                | 225 |
| A11-12: GROUP III-METHOD.....                                      | 229 |
| A11-13: GROUP III-RESULTS.....                                     | 232 |
| A11-14: GROUP III-DISCUSSION (CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS)..... | 235 |
| A11-15: GROUP III-ABSTRACT OR SUMMARY.....                         | 238 |



---

## CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

### *Prelude: Signs of the Problem*

*Story (1).* In the 1990s, Yusong Zhou served as a volunteer teacher on the team of youth volunteers from Beijing to minority areas in Guangxi. He taught English in a high school in Daleng Township (“*Daleng Xiang*” in Chinese), a minority village in Baise Prefecture, Guangxi Zhuang<sup>1</sup> Minority Autonomous Region<sup>2</sup>. There was a girl in Grade 8 who always ranked number one in the grade he taught. She was very interested in what was going on outside her hometown, so she often came to Mr. Zhou to ask about such things. But from the beginning of the second semester, the girl no longer came to school. The girl’s home room teacher (“*Ban Zhu Ren*” in Chinese) told Zhou that her family could not afford her schooling anymore. Zhou did not want this student to have to stop her schooling, so he walked seven hours (just as the girl would do every week when she came to school) in the rain to the girl’s home. His thought of “bringing the girl hope” helped him with the seven-hour walk. In her home, he found the girl, who used to dress quite neat, wearing very shabby clothes that barely covered her body. She had been crying for two weeks at not being able to go to school. He generously offered to pay for her school fees and living expenses. The parents finally said that they would send her

---

<sup>1</sup> Zhuang is the name of a minority ethnic group in China. See details in the list of all the ethnic groups in Appendix 1.

<sup>2</sup> Guangxi is one of the five minority autonomous regions in China. See details in the list of minority autonomous regions in Appendix 2.

---

back to school again. Hearing this, the girl cried, saying that she had thought she would never have this chance again. On their way back to school, they smiled at each other for the hope they saw ahead (L. Sha, 1998).

*Story (2).* The Miao<sup>3</sup> girl, Sushuang Long, was a 14-year-old dropout. She told the reporter, “I would come here and see my old classmates and schoolmates coming back home from school every Friday. I would also see them going to school again every Sunday.” She was a top student in her class, which was a key class of the school. In her home, the reporter was attracted to the walls full of certificates and prizes she had received from all sorts of school activities. She told the reporter that when she received her first certificate, she was so excited and proud that she told everyone she saw on her way home that day. Later, when she understood her family’s economic situation, she realized that she might have to drop out of school one day. All the Longs made a living on a very small piece of rice field. The dad was sick and had to stay in bed year round. The whole family depended on the mom, who went deep into the mountains to find herbs to sell at market. Sushuang also said that if all she had to pay were school fees, she could have stayed in school. The family had to pay nearly ¥700 (US \$84.68<sup>4</sup>) for boarding fees in addition to the school fees. After dropping out, Sushuang usually made breakfast for the family, fetched pig food<sup>5</sup>, watched the kids studying and playing in the primary

---

<sup>3</sup> Miao is the name of a minority ethnic group in China. See details in the list of all the ethnic groups in Appendix 1.

<sup>4</sup> This number is converted based on the exchange rate between Chinese currency and U.S. currency of May 1, 2003, the date this story was first published.

<sup>5</sup> The Chinese people in rural areas usually cultivate pigs in addition to growing crops, in order to get some extra

---

school nearby, and then came back home. Time went by like this day after day. She said that she would like to leave the mountains to find a job and make some money to send to her parents, so that they could enjoy life a little. When asked about finding a job with the skills she had, she choked with emotion. In front of the reporters, this 14-year-old tried really hard to hide her tears. She told the reporters that she missed the teachers, her friends at school, and the school itself (Y. Wang, 2003).

*Story (3).* Qianlai Luo, a master student at Harvard School of Public Health, went to Liangshan Yi Minority Autonomous Prefecture<sup>6</sup> in August, 2003, to do her research on the public health situation there. She had the chance to observe many households while she was staying in Kaiyuan Township (“*Kaiyuan Xiang*” in Chinese), a village in rural Xichang, the capital city of Liangshan. All of the residents there were Yi<sup>7</sup>. She interviewed the family of the leader of a production team (“*Sheng Chan Xiao Zu*” in Chinese) leader. Compared with other families in the village, this family was pretty well off. They lived in lower part of the mountain; had a nice watch dog in front of their iron door gate; had a TV and a VCD player in the house; lived separately from their stock animals; had separate bedrooms for parents, the daughters, and the son in the house; and dressed in Han clothes. There were four children in the family, three girls and finally a boy. The father said that if he sent any of his girls to school, he would send all three of

---

income.

<sup>6</sup> This story is from personal communication with Qianlai Luo. See the picture of the two girls and their father in Appendix 3. Liangshan Yi Autonomous Prefecture is located in Sichuan Province in southwest China. See details in the list of minority autonomous prefectures in Appendix 4.

<sup>7</sup> Yi is the name of a minority ethnic group in China. See details in the list of all the ethnic groups in Appendix 1.

them. However, he could not afford to, so he let them finish elementary school and did not provide any further education for them. But he let his son stay in school. The eldest daughter got married. The other two girls stayed home and helped the family income by working in the field and selling fried sliced potatoes at the nightly market at the bottom of the mountain. This family seemed to have a very good atmosphere in terms of the relationships between family members. These two girls, 18 and 16 respectively, were already considered “intellectual” in the village because they knew basic literacy and numeracy (this also made it possible for them to help with family income).

These stories offer a basic view on minority-girl education in China. We need to remember that these girls are not alone. Minority girls’ equal access to quality education is made hard by poverty, parental expectations, family decisions, girls’ own expectations, and other factors which lead to dropping out of school. It is usually intertwined with issues of school fees (including other fees associated with school), school environment, gender roles, school availability (i.e., distances between schools and households), teacher availability, teacher quality, etc. The inequality in educational opportunity might affect the future of these girls as well as that of their families. For example, Sushuang’s wish to find a job outside the mountain to help with the family income might have become reality had she received sufficient skills from her schooling to obtain a job. This reflects the need for a change in the current school curriculum in order to make the current education system work better for minority girls.

### *Introduction*

This study is going to talk about research in the field of education for minority girls in China. First, the concept of minority girls will be given. Then a brief discussion on the status of minority-girl education in developing countries will be offered. Then there will be a detailed background introduction of minority-girl education in China. After this, the statement of research problems, the purpose of the study, the research questions, the methodology, the outline of the study, the significance of the study will be introduced one by one.

### *Conceptualizing Minority Girls*

The concept of ethnic groups in this study is the groups of people that share common geographical locations, common languages, common economies, and common ways of thinking. Minority ethnic groups are the ones that make up smaller percentages in the national population. Minority girls are the girls from minority ethnic groups. They bear in themselves the characteristics that are innate within their minority ethnic groups, in addition to the gender roles that have been assumed onto them beyond their own choice.

### *Minority-girl Education in Developing Countries*

The phenomenon of gender disparities in education is confronted across societies and levels of development (G. P. Kelly, 1987; Stromquist, 1990). It might result from



---

political, economic, social, and cultural reasons. Bearing all distinct characteristics from all these aspects, minority girls are to face barriers in educational opportunities because they are females and they are from certain social or ethnic groups, both of which are found to be heavily affected by change in policies, family decisions, institutionalized power relations in the community, socioeconomic development, and so on, particularly in developing countries (Fox, 2003; E. Hannum, 2003; Hyde, 1999; UNESCO Bangkok Principal Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific, 2000). Access to education has profound implications not only for quality of life but also for one's very survival in developing countries (Hyde, 1999). It is also articulated that access is merely the first hurdle and that educational opportunities for girls are further reduced in the form of low school performance due to institutionalized influences from the school administration and pedagogy (Burbridge, 1991; Hyde, 1999). Yet, there are tremendous barriers, especially for girls, to access to education in developing countries (Arnot, 2000; Fox, 2003; Hyde, 1999). Minority girls become the dual recipients of discrimination in terms of educational opportunity. They are discriminated against their minority status, within their own racial and socio-economic groups, and by predominantly male policy formulation (Cardenas, 1994; Hyde, 1999). An unconscious ignorance on the gap between minority girls and the rest on educational opportunity, investment, achievement, etc. is often spotted.

An extreme literacy gap between males and females has been found in Nepal, the

Lao People's Democratic Republic, India, and so on (UNESCO Bangkok Principal Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific, 2000). There are three to four literate men for every two literate women in these countries. An even wider gap between the majority males and the minority females has been found in the Chinese data (Rong & Shi, 2001).

Enrolling more minority girls is pivotal in closing gender gaps. It can be reasonably argued that more than half of the school-aged children that are not in school in many developing countries are girls (Rong & Shi, 2001; UNESCO Bangkok Principal Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific, 2000). Among these children, ethnic disparities are acute. In some minority areas, over 50% of ethnic minority girls never attend school. School enrollment was also found to be correlated with the geographical and economical situations internationally. Better serviced areas have more equitable school enrollment rates in all the sub-groups; better-off families are more likely to send their girls to school. This holds true in a good number of countries in Asia, Africa, and Latin America (Akande, 1987; Alderman, Orazem, & Paterno, 2000; Glewwe & Jacoby, 1993; E. Hannum, 2003; Jackson, 2000; Rong & Shi, 2001; Stromquist, 1989, 2001). However, the minority girls most likely reside in the areas other than the better-off ones.

Expanding access to school is not yet enough (Bellow & King, 1993). School achievement is what keeps the girls up with school. In many cases, they make up almost half of the primary enrollment but only one third of secondary and one fifth of university enrollment (UNESCO Bangkok Principal Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific, 2000).

A gap in school achievement between male students and female students has been found even in a developed country like United States, where it is assumed to be closer to equality (Lucidi, 1994). Secondly, girls' choices of field of study reveal some further problems. Even though women's enrollment surpasses men's by a few percentage points in some Latin American countries, female students are found to be concentrated on certain fields of study (Colley, 1998; Stromquist, 1996, 2001). Schools become the agencies where the stereotyped gender ideology and mechanism are reproduced. Are schools to be liberating or suppressing for girls?

Education quality plays another important role in minority-girl education. Under this umbrella, there are problems concerning school curriculum, language of instruction, investment in education, the status of teachers, the physical capital of the schools, etc. In Lao PDR, a national curriculum is found to be contradictory and problematic when minority-girl education is taken into account. The rights or practice of ethnic minority cultures or languages and an assumed equality for males and females are two major problems there (Fox, 2003). In Burundi, language of instruction remains one big issue when it comes to minority-girl education; the sudden change of the instruction language into French in the fifth grade discourages many girls to continue in school. The status of teachers in Burundi has also been found fallen sharply while the school enrollment of the girls was lower (Jackson, 2000). China has been known for very low investment in education for a long time (Rong & Shi, 2001).

---

Gaining access to education and doing well in school does not guarantee a good future for females. Some chances to find jobs are still secretly reserved for the males. Women must have more years of education than men to earn the same salary in Latin America and in Cote d'Ivoire (Stromquist, 1996; Vijverberg, 1992).

The state can help with this by making specific policies as suggested below:

1. schools to be made available and accessible to women;
2. policies that provide conditions that will enable women to attend school;
3. linking education to work-force opportunities for women (G. P. Kelly, 1987; Stromquist, 1995).

### *Situating the Problem in China*

There are 55 officially designated ethnic minority groups in China<sup>8</sup>. According to the fifth national census in 2000, the total population of these minority groups is 104,490,735, accounting for 8.41% of the total population (2002). Although small in percentage, the absolute number of these groups is large enough to require that any issues regarding them be considered with care. The Chinese constitution and government policies entitle every ethnic group the freedom to develop its own culture. But research and statistics have shown that the actual situation of minority education calls for attention. Overall, minorities have lower school enrollment rates, have higher dropout rates, have

---

<sup>8</sup> See details in the list of all the ethnic groups in Appendix 1.

---

higher illiteracy rates, have lower educational attainment levels, are less urbanized<sup>9</sup> and the extent of school availability in their areas is lower (Mackerras, 1995).

Mackerras (1995) says that “children of most of the minorities tend to go on to junior secondary school, let alone senior or university, much less than do those of the Han<sup>10</sup>” (p. 139). According to Palmer (Palmer, 2000), Chinese State Education Commission reports that the gross enrollment rate of school age minority children is about 20 percentage points lower than the national mean; the dropout rate for minority students also far exceeds the national average; the years of schooling in the five minority autonomous regions averages 6.5 for Inner Mongolia, 5.94 for Guangxi, 1.92 for Tibet, 5.4 for Ningxia, and 6.2 for Xinjiang, all lower than the nation’s average of 8.36. The report also shows that most of the minority areas have a lower level of school enrollment, education attainment level, and literacy rates (Johnson & Chhetri, 2000; M. Zhou, 2000, 2001a, 2001b).

Still, these numbers do not give the true picture of minority education. There is a difference between the education in minority areas and minority education (Postiglione & Teng, 1996). Since there is a Han population in each and every one of the five minority autonomous regions, education in minority areas automatically includes Han education in those areas<sup>11</sup>. The minorities are therefore not necessarily the sole beneficiaries of the

---

<sup>9</sup> The level of urbanization of minority ethnic groups is calculated according to the 2000 census. See Appendix 6 for the calculations.

<sup>10</sup> Han is the name of the majority ethnic group in China. See details in the list of all the ethnic groups in Appendix 1.

<sup>11</sup> According to the 2000 census, 93.8% of the population in Tibet is minorities and 59.4% in Xinjiang. The other three

---

educational facilities located in the minority areas (Kwong & Xiao, 1989). Generally, education for the Han in minority areas is better than that for the minorities, since minorities are considerably less urbanized than the Han in minority areas and schools in urban areas have better facilities in China (Mackerras, 1995; Y. Wang, 2003). According to Wang's report in 2003, the ratio between per pupil expenditure in urban and rural areas is 7:1<sup>12</sup>.

Minority ethnic groups are further disadvantaged in a geographical sense. China has enjoyed the highest growing economy in the world for more than a decade now. At the same time, the gap between regions is also increasing. West China<sup>13</sup> has a far lower economic growth rate and less social development compared to East China<sup>14</sup>. West China makes up 56% of the nation's land area and 22.99% of the population. The majority of the population under the national poverty line lives in West China. All the 55 different minority ethnic groups are found in this part of China and more than 40 of them reside mainly in West China<sup>15</sup> (W. Zhou, Zhang, & Liu, 1995).

Cultural distinctions between the ethnic groups also affect the status of minority education to a great extent. Not all the ethnic groups in China belong to the same race (Y. Ma, 1984; Y. Ma & Chen, 1981). They all have different languages. Even within the

---

minority autonomous regions all have Han as their majority population.

<sup>12</sup> This ratio is obtained using the numbers given in this report. See Appendix 6 for the method of calculation.

<sup>13</sup> West China includes Shannxi, Gansu, Qinghai, Ningxia, Xinjiang, Sichuan, Chongqing, Yunnan, Guizhou, Tibet, Guangxi, and Inner Mongolia. The rest part is considered East China. See map of China in Appendix 5.

<sup>14</sup> These factors, coupled with the desire to better utilize the rich natural resources in West China, are the major reasons for the new policy of West Exploration in 1999.

<sup>15</sup> The concept of West China employed by these authors excludes Inner Mongolia and Guangxi from the list in note 13.

same ethnic group, there might be more than one languages spoken (Y. Ma, 1984; Y. Ma & Chen, 1981). The 55 different groups speak more than 80 different languages (M. Zhou, 2001a). Like the Han, they are found throughout the country geographically. To analyze China's national minorities as a single entity becomes virtually impossible (Postiglione, 1992) because great cultural, regional, and developmental differences exist among them. The issue of minority education goes beyond the designated minority areas, and thus becomes more complicated and diverse.

Location of residence and sex are shown to be highly correlated with school enrollment and completion rates (Connelly & Zheng, 2003; E. C. Hannum, 1998; J.-Q. Liu, 1998; Rong & Shi, 2001). In China, rural girls are being especially disadvantaged in terms of both enrollment and graduation rates (Connelly & Zheng, 2003; E. C. Hannum, 1998). Bearing all the problems mentioned above, minority women face additional barriers when it comes to education. Generally, minority-girl education is worse than general minority education (Postiglione & Teng, 1996). This can be seen in Mackerras (1995), as well. He writes:

Girls and boys normally attend the same schools under the PRC. Literacy is certainly beneficial for women, as for men, and though some educational theorists favor the retention of some schools especially for girls, most would favor a general pattern of coeducation. Despite the great advances for girls under the PRC, gender equality in education is neither a reality nor on the horizon. (p. 146)

---

It is also noted that in China, women's status and educational level are higher only compared to their lower status and educational level in the past, and there is still a great discrepancy between the two genders (J.-Q. Liu, 1998; Niu, 1993; X. Yang, 2000). Especially in poor areas, "education seems to be a privilege exclusive to sons; daughters must stay at home to help their parents" (China Daily, November 28, 1990, p.4, as cited in Mackerras, 1995, p.147). According to the 2000 census, among the 86,992,069 illiterate population in China, 63,204,457 are women, which accounts for 73% of the total<sup>16</sup>. But although most of the minorities prefer sons over daughters, they do so to a lesser degree than do the Han (Mackerras, 1995). This suggests the need of exploring other reasons for minority girls' lack of access to education, which are probably different from those for the Han girls.

The education of minority girls deserves still more attention. First, women have their agency. Material and ideological, visible and invisible, women have their roles in production and reproduction processes (Chua, Bhavnani, & Foran, 2000). It will affect the whole economic and social development process if their roles are neglected or underestimated, i.e, if there is inequality or discrimination against women (Hill & King, 1993; Persson & Tabellini, 1994; Summers, 1994). Women's own recognition of their agency frames their self-concept and creates a foundation of their self-development, thus a foundation for economic growth, higher standards of living, better health, and a more

---

<sup>16</sup> According to the 2000 census, females account for 48.5% of the total population.



informed citizenry (Sperling, 2001). The extent to which women understand their agency depends on the education level of the women concerned (W. Liu, 2000). In trying to understand and fulfill their agency, minority women go through struggles. They deal with their struggles with whatever they have, whether it be inherited skills and knowledge, learned skills, or even ignorance. How well they deal with struggles will determine how well their agency might be fulfilled. How well their agency is fulfilled will determine how they participate in the development process of the nation, which will affect the whole development process. The cycles of passing skills and knowledge from mothers to daughters can be vicious if mothers do not have skills to teach their daughters (F. Guo, 2000; Summers, 1994). Education for minority women serves as the tool to cut into the vicious cycle and ensure that skills and knowledge will be passed on to the girls (Brown & Park, 2002), saving them from ignorance about their own agency and enabling them to better fulfill their roles in the development process.

Second, it is the constitutional right that every citizen of the People's Republic of China, including women from minority ethnic groups, have equal opportunity to participate in the national political, economic, cultural, and social life. The right is meaningless until the right itself and what is going on in the world are understood well enough by the right owners (Hill & King, 1993). Education serves as the major way for people to get the tool to a better understanding of all sorts of rights and what is going on in the world. Therefore, unequal opportunities in obtaining education will affect the level

of participation in all aspects of life. As a result, the equal rights entitled to minority women in China in social, economic, political, and cultural life will be restricted if the unequal situation of minority-women education continues. These entitled equal rights will not be in place until education is equally spread among all related participants and the tool is mastered by them. With the current coverage of minority-girl education in China, the minority women are not likely to be able to enjoy their constitutional rights.

Third, the human resources which lie in minority women need to be recognized, cultivated, and utilized. Investing in girl education has many high payoffs (Summers, 1994). Some of these payoffs are found in social aspects, such as improved quality of life (Hill & King, 1993). Minority-women education has a significant role to play in economic and social development. Education helps enhance women's economic productivity in economic sectors both inside and outside the house. Their education has a greater effect on family welfare than does the man's. This includes their own health and their families' health. A mother's schooling also increases the educational attainment of her children, especially of her daughters. This will help to cut off the vicious cycle of having uneducated women with few alternatives (Summers, 1994). Education enhances women's ability to exercise their rights and responsibilities. The fact that minority girls are constantly called back home from school to attend household chores and other responsibilities suggests the need for helping them to exercise their rights and responsibilities (Guan, 1994; Hill & King, 1993; L. Liu, 1994b; Postiglione & Teng,

1996; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; Xi, 2002; Xiao, 1994; Zheng, 2003; W. Zhou et al., 1995).

Fourth, the girls, as future mothers, are the ones who carry on the individual cultures and identities of different minority ethnic groups as established by their gender roles (Kiluva-ndunda, 2001; Stromquist, 1994). The minority girls in China are also educated into certain roles in keeping with the traditions of their own ethnic groups. The more educated these women and girls become, the more they will learn the PRC's nationwide uniformed curriculum and, above all, the Chinese language, which will inevitably integrate them better into the life of the PRC. That would lead to a decline in a sense of national identities among women even if they retained the use of their own languages indefinitely (Mackerras, 1995). The Chinese constitution entitles every minority ethnic group to develop its own culture and minority parents with the desire of keeping their own identities will hesitate to send their girls to schools preaching some alternative values.

Because of the roles minority women should and need to play which they cannot play fully right now and because education could help them fulfill those roles, minority-women education deserves to have more importance attached to it. The issue of minority-girl education in China manifests itself in the issues of literacy rates, school enrollment ratio, dropout rates, educational attainment, school curriculum, school management system, language policy, teacher quality, availability of female teachers, family decisions, parental expectations, minority women's self-esteem, and so on (Guan,

1994; E. Hannum, 2003; Hill & King, 1993; Wenpu Liu, 1994; Stromquist, 2002; Tao, 1936; Xi, 2002). These issues are made more complicated when intertwined with various concerns from aspects of race and ethnicity, gender, poverty, rural and urban gap, East China and West China, overall national development, etc. (Bi & Wang, 1999; Hill & King, 1993; L. Liu, 1994b; Wenpu Liu, 1994; Mackerras, 1995; Summers, 1994; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; World Bank, 1992; Xiao, 1994, 1995; W. Zhou et al., 1995).

Meanwhile, minority women, with such little preparation for life they have from education, are still expected to carry out their agency and responsibilities. With their participation in their own life being limited due to lack of education, their involvement in national development is made practically not very probable. However, education does not automatically solve this problem. It has to be the right kind of education with valid content. Many minority parents call their daughters back home from school for various reasons, including that the girls have poor school performance; they are not able to make more money after they graduate than their peers who have never been to school; they are not able to find a job after they graduate; they might not be able to get married at a “proper age”; they are needed for housework; schools are not safe enough for them; schools are too far away from households; parents do not hold the same expectations toward their daughters as they do toward their sons, so they stop their girls from getting further education after a certain grade; and parents are also afraid that the more their daughters stay in school, the more they will forget their ethnic identity (H. Chen, 1994;

Duo, 1994; Guan, 1994; A. Guo, 1994; L. Liu, 1994a, 1994b; Wencong Liu, 1994; Wenpu Liu, 1994; W. Ma, 1994; Y. Ma, 1994; Z. Ma, 1994; Yugui Ren, 1994a; Stromquist, 2002; Sun & Guo, 1994; G. Wang, 1994; Z. Wang & Liu, 1994; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; Xi, 2002; Y. Zhou & Mao, 1994). These reasons call for further investigation into the current education system in China and its impact on minority-girl education.

### *Statement of the Problem*

The education of minority girls in China involves issues concerning gender roles, women status, access to schooling, educational attainment, family decision, investment and return, language policies, school curriculum, education system, school management, and so on. This study is going to look at the available research on minority-girl education in China and to identify the challenges facing minority girls in terms of education. It is hoped that our understanding of such challenges will be expanded. Methodologies employed by different researchers and research areas covered in previous research will be identified, as well. By providing an analysis of these challenges and methodologies, this study is proposing to address future research areas and research methodologies.

Research on girl education in China did not gain recognition until the late 1980s. This is partly because by law, women enjoy equal rights to men, and it is easy to presume that women have gained equal status to men. The same presumption also applies to minority ethnic groups. Consequently, the rights or practice of ethnic minority cultures or

languages are easily excluded. As a result, scholarship in minority-girl education remains far from sufficient. Due to the urgency and significance of having greater scholarship in minority-girl education, it is necessary to review current available research on this topic.

### *Purpose of the Study*

This thesis aims to contribute to a better understanding of China's education system, from the perspective of women in the minority ethnic groups. This study endeavors to achieve its goal by doing an analysis of available research on education for ethnic minority women in China, hoping to find some innovative ways to conduct future research in this field.

This study aims at expanding our understanding of the educational challenges facing minority women. It also hopes to bring together the current research on minority-women/girl education in China and to explore what minority-women/girl education in China looks like. In doing so, this study is aiming at helping to improve the quality of research and quality of education in this field.

### *Research Questions*

The key questions this study seeks to answer are:

1. In what ways does the literature present information or insights which will contribute positively towards the development of relevant, effective, sustainable,

appropriate policy and practice concerning minority-girl education in China?

2. What does the literature contribute to our knowledge about the education of minority girls in China?

3. What are the possible future research orientations in minority-women education in China?

### *Methodology*

This study is a review and analysis of current research reports on minority-women education in China. It is going to look at the available research on the topic against criteria under six categories: introduction, theoretical framework, method, results, discussion/conclusions and recommendations, and abstract or summary. The criteria will be general but the questions asked to evaluate the research will be specific to the individual research report being evaluated. The general criteria will be listed later in this section. After the criteria are applied, an analysis on the experience and lessons gained from the research reports will be made. Based on the analysis, conclusions on reliability of previous research reports will be drawn. Recommendations on future research orientations regarding minority-women education in China will be made.

The procedures include collecting data, obtaining results, analyzing results, and drawing conclusions. In this study, the critical steps lie in collecting the necessary literature and preparing the criteria. These steps are going to lay the foundation of

validity and reliability of this study. The bilingual ability allows the researcher to use research reports of this field in both Chinese and English, which make the biggest research sources concerning this topic. The literature will be located through the Computer Assisted Research Search (CARS); through searching holdings of some libraries; through internet search engines; through searching relevant websites of some international organizations; and through personal communications with some researchers in this field. The literature to be evaluated in this study may be limited due to the limitations innate in these sources. This includes the current scholarship in this field, the supply of the libraries, accessibility of the websites, personal perspectives held by the researchers contacted, etc.

When evaluating the literature, questions against the general criteria and specific to each and every research report being discussed will be asked and answered. These criteria will be divided into five categories. The first category is introduction. Questions under this category will be concerning whether there is a problem, whether this problem is researchable, and why. Whether the problem is researchable will be determined mainly by the availability of the data and qualifications of the researcher. Background information, related literature, and hypotheses will be examined. The second category is theoretical framework. The use of some major theories in education and development, human capital theory, nation-building theory, and social/cultural theories will be looked at. Questions under this category will be about which theory perspective the study uses



and what the perceptions about the research problems are. The third category is method. Questions regarding the participants, instruments, and designs and procedures will be asked. A look into whether the method is appropriate will be provided, too. The fourth one is results. The major criteria here will be about the logic used to produce the results and the method used to produce the results. Is the logic used valid or reliable? Are the results easy to understand? The fifth category is discussion or conclusions and recommendations. Consistency between the hypotheses and results will be examined in this part. It will also examine whether recommendations are made and whether they are feasible. The last category to be evaluated is the abstract or summary part. The questions will be whether there is an abstract or a summary; whether the problem is restated; and so on.

Based on the application of these criteria, this study will go further into summarizing the major challenges facing minority-women education in China and how these challenges have been addressed in previous research endeavors. Then experiences and lessons gained in these previous research activities will be drawn. Conclusions on the current situation of minority-women education research in China and recommendations concerning future research areas and research methodology will be made as well.

### *Outline of the Study*

The purpose of this thesis is to contribute to a better understanding of

minority-women education in China. This study endeavors to achieve its goal by doing an analysis of available research reports on minority-women education in China and proposing future research orientations in this field.

Four chapters comprise this work. Chapter One introduces the issue of minority-women education in China. It also gives the statement of the research problem, explains the purpose of the study, poses research questions, outlines the procedures of methodology, and rationalizes the significance of the study. Chapter Two provides methodology employed in this study to answer the research questions proposed in Chapter One. Criteria on evaluating research reports are articulated. Questions against the criteria are asked according to every research report group. Chapter Three focuses on results obtained from applying the criteria made in the previous chapter. It provides the foundation on which the research questions are to be answered. Chapter Four serves as conclusion. Personal thoughts and suggestions to the research of Chinese minority-women education, in the form of presenting findings and making recommendations, are given in this chapter. All the research questions will also be answered at the same time.

### *Significance of the Study*

This study seeks to improve quality of both research and education concerning minority women/girls. Minority education is an indispensable component in China's

national development strategy. Issues concerning minorities are significant in economic, political, social, and cultural senses. The 55 minority ethnic groups reside on over 60% of the country's territory, much of it containing China's richest mineral and timber deposits and most productive meat- and wool- raising areas (Lee, 2001) (p. 22).

Minorities live on 90% of China's borders (Lin, 1997). Better education for minorities would help better utilize these resources so that the economic development in minority areas could be facilitated. Their responsibilities as citizens could be strengthened via education so that the political stability in border areas may be maintained. Appropriate educational content will also help with cultural development of different minority ethnic groups, which is entitled as a constitutional right for all the ethnic groups. Women, once involved in education, will continuously contribute to education and are important in this process (Summers, 1994). Minority-women education is of great strategic significance thereby.

Minority girls still suffer from lack of access to education and lower educational attainment levels in general. Many minority girls finish their primary school or junior high school without acquiring the necessary skills to find jobs to support themselves. This affects other parents in deciding whether or not to send their girls to school (G. Wang, 1994), which shows that they have doubt about school quality. This study, by analyzing current research reports, will provide a summary on practices of minority-women education in China, with the goal of improving education quality.

Built upon the socialist ideals, which do not recognize gender and ethnic differences as long-lasting differences (Tsai, 2002), research concerning minority women in China did not receive recognition until very recently. Since the problems about minority-girl education in China have been identified as problems, the silence or actions taken afterwards may perpetuate relationships that contribute to these problems and unequal power relations in society (Reyes & Capper, 1991). There is a great need for “actions” in this field. More research is one of them. At this point, there is a great need for a review of the research that has been done so that a reference about future research orientations can be made. Serving as a critique of what has already been done, this study is going to help improve the quality of research in this field. It will also contribute to expanding the knowledge on minority education through the perspective of minority-women education in China.

### *Summary*

The issue of minority-girl education in China was proposed in this chapter. A better knowledge about the field is needed if it were to develop to a higher level. This study is about research that has been done in this field. This is a new field of research in China and some research has been done. It is time to do a review and analysis of the previous research in the field and provide recommendations on future research orientations.

## CHAPTER TWO: METHODOLOGY

### *Introduction*

This study is a review and analysis of published literature on minority-women education in China. The criteria against which this literature is to be reviewed and analyzed are based on the types of the studies in the light of the research questions. The located research studies will be grouped according to their content and approaches. This chapter deals with how the literature search was conducted, where the literature was obtained from, how the studies were organized into groups, and what criteria were used to classify, to review and to analyze the studies.

### *Literature Collection*

Both English and Chinese literatures on this topic were included in the search. The literature was located through searching library holdings, utilizing Computer Assisted Research Search (CARS), utilizing online search engines, and searching websites for some big international organizations that deal with education and development in developing countries. Part of these was done with the help gained from other researchers in this field. The materials that I have used in the courses on education and development that I have taken were also browsed.

*Library holdings.* Harold B. Lee Library (HBLL) at Brigham Young University,

interlibrary loan service at Brigham Young University, Harvard-Yenching Library, Cheng Yu Tung East Asian Library at the University of Toronto, and the National Library of China were utilized in searching library holdings for literature.

Brigham Young University is the place where I go to school. The HBLL has a nice English collection of more than six million items. The interlibrary loan service is made available to every student on campus. This further extends the collection capacity of the library and students have access to much more than the library's own collection. Harvard-Yenching library is the biggest among all the East Asia Study Centers' libraries in the western world. It is devoted to Chinese-language academic material in all formats, and mainly in the fields of humanities and social sciences. Work published in China, Taiwan, and Hong Kong, and other areas are collected. The collection at this library is strong in many fields including the history of contemporary China. Cheng Yu Tung East Asian Library at the University of Toronto is another major resource in East Asian studies in North America. It has a good collection of Chinese statistics and censuses. Both of these helped with the background information. The National Library of China is the biggest and most comprehensive library in China. It was possible for me to do catalog search online. The available catalog search did not include periodicals, so I asked a friend of mine, also a researcher, to help me do a periodical article browsing manually.

Keywords such as "minority", "minority education", "minority women", "minority women education", "gender issues education", "gender education China", "minority

education China”, etc. were used in catalog searching. Chinese Pinyin terms for these words such as “*minzu*”, “*shaoshu minzu*”, “*minzu jiaoyu*”, “*shaoshu minzu jiaoyu*”, “*shaoshu minzu funu/v*”<sup>17</sup>, “*shaoshu minzu funu/v jiaoyu*”, “*shaoshu minzu nuzi/nvzi jiaoyu*”, etc. were used where Chinese Pinyin search was possible.

*Computer Assisted Research Search (CARS)*. CARS is established based on a series of databases. Since this study is about education, the CARS searching is limited to the databases on education. Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) (EBSCO), ERIC (WebSPIRS), Educational Full Text (Wilson Web), International ERIC, Digital Dissertations (ProQuest), Journal Citation Reports (ISI), Social Sciences Abstracts (Wilson Web), and “Social Sciences Citation Index (SSCI): Web of Science” are the ones that have been searched.

ERIC (EBSCO) is the U.S. Department of Education Resource Information Center databases. It contains indexing and abstracts from thousands of research and technical reports in the Resources in Education Index (RIE) and from more than 750 education and education-related journals in the Current Index to Journals in Education (CIJE). In addition, selected full text articles are available for thousands of ERIC digest records. This database is updated quarterly.

ERIC (WebSPIRS) contains indexes and abstracts over 750 education journals and

---

<sup>17</sup> “Nv” is how it is typed on the keyboard in Pinyin to yield the right Chinese character for “female/girl/woman”. But “nu” is how it is typed in common writings. Therefore, both “nv” and “nu” are used when conducting the search in order to include as many relating results as possible.

thousands of education related documents. It combines CIJE and RIE. It is updated quarterly.

Educational Full Text (Wilson Web) includes indexes and abstracts from a core group of 430 international periodicals, yearbooks, and selected books in education. The abstracting coverage begins with January 1994 and the full-text coverage begins in January 1996.

International ERIC combines two international education research databases: Australian Education Index (AEI) and the British Education Index (BEI). These databases provide information on a wide variety of sources, including journal articles, reports, theses, and monographs. Each database extensively covers educational research in, and relating to, its country.

Digital Dissertations (ProQuest) is the database that represents the work of authors from over 1,000 graduate schools and universities. It includes abstracts for dissertations beginning in 1980 and for master's theses beginning in 1988. Full text for dissertations published after 1997 is also available. This database is updated monthly.

Journal Citation Reports (ISI) presents quantifiable statistical citation data that provides a systematic, objective way to evaluate the world's leading journals and their impact and influence in the global research community. It covers more than 7,000 of the world's most highly cited, peer-reviewed journals in approximately 200 disciplines. It includes Science Edition and Social Science Edition.



Social Science Abstracts (Wilson Web) includes indexes from 400 core periodicals in the social sciences. It is updated monthly.

Social Sciences Citation Index (SSCI): Web of Science accesses the Science Citation Index (SCI), Social Science Citation Index (SSCI), and Arts and Humanities Citation Index (AHCI) databases, gathered from over 8,500 scholarly journals. Searches for records can be performed by topic, author, source title, author address, cited author, cited work, and cited year, both separately or combined. Articles are linked to other articles of the same topic.

The combination of all these databases provided a comprehensive source for literature on minority-girl education in English. Since many of the times the titles for the articles did not really reflect the focuses of research and it was possible to search words in abstracts in all these databases, the English keywords used in the library catalog searching were searched in abstracts. Because some of the databases were updated periodically and there were a few updates during the course of my research, the searching was conducted in a repetitive manner.

*Online searches.* Online search was conducted through Google search engine. I chose Google because it took the shortest time (3 days) to list a site on the engine while the other major search engines such as MSN, America Online Search (AOL), Overture, About, Infoseek, and so on, would take from 2 to 8 weeks. That meant the search results from Google engine would be the latest. The second reason it was chosen was because of its power of automatic Chinese keyword conversion from Chinese Pinyin. For example,

when I used Pinyin terms to search, it was possible for me to get results both in English and Chinese. Furthermore, it was also possible to search by keywords directly in Chinese characters on Google. This made a good list of results in both English and Chinese possible.

Besides the terms used in library holdings searching, another way of composing the keywords was also adopted. Since “Tibetan girls” is “*Zang Zu nu tong*” in Chinese, “Mongolian girls” is “*Meng Gu Zu nu tong*”, etc., the formula of “*\_zu nu/v tong jiaoyu*” was also used, trying to cover the studies about education for girls from specific minority ethnic groups.

*International organization websites searching.* Websites of some major international organizations in education, World Bank (WB), Asian Development Bank (ADB), Research Triangle Institute (RTI), Academy for Educational Development (AED), and Oxfam, were searched.

The same keywords used in previous searches were used to conduct the searches on WB, ADB, and RTI under their “Publications” and “Documents & Reports” sections. World Bank search revealed some results on minority women, but they were about the issue of economic development instead of education. Asian Development Bank revealed 500 results on all the three keywords used. They were about the ongoing education projects in Laos, Cambodia, and Vietnam respectively. The fund distribution in these

countries was discussed in there. Reports on these projects have not been located via the searches. RTI revealed 8 results on “minority women education”. All of them turned out to be dealing with health issues.

On AED website, “Tools & Publications” was looked to locate some literature on this topic. Two lists were available to browse the publications of this organization, one by topic and the other by approach. “Education-International” in the “by topic” list and “Gender” in the “by approach” list were looked at. No articles on minority-women education were revealed.

Oxfam website has a section “Policy & analysis” where “publications” can be found. Nothing concerning minority-women education was found.

The materials obtained this way may serve as the background information.

*Course materials searching.* Some course materials used in the classes on education and development the author has taken also served as a possible source from which literature could be obtained. These materials did not necessarily provide sources for minority-girl education, but they did give articles dealing with theories in the field of education and development. Two articles were found to be good for preparing the criteria.

#### *Literature Classification and Translation*

After collecting all the literature from the searches, each article was carefully read

and the major ideas identified. The major ideas were reviewed and grouped according to the similar ways in which the authors approached the research problems. For the literature in Chinese, the author asked two other Chinese students to look at the translations she had made to make them more accurate and objective.

### *Guidelines for Analysis*

Since there was not a literature available on review methodology, some basic critique techniques of education research were employed to evaluate every single research located according to the characteristics it had. For example, studies in Group I would be about current educational practices so they were expected to give the rationale behind the practices and the effectiveness and efficiency of the practices. For studies in Group III, if they were about gender differences, it would be expected to find in them what the gender differences were and what the implications of these gender differences would be. It was also my goal to identify the perception or theoretical perspectives the researchers had employed in their studies. These could be recognized by applying critique techniques in the order of the general categories studies would have: introduction, theoretical framework, method, results, discussion, and abstract.

By having criteria from all these six categories, it could be guaranteed that all parts of the studies would be evaluated thoroughly. A full range of criteria about all the categories except the theoretical framework could be borrowed from Gay & Airasian

(2000). I have tested the questions on a few of studies from each and every group. Therefore, I would employ these criteria to review and analyze the literature on minority-girl education in China.

It was important to clarify what the theoretical perceptions the researchers had when they went out for the research. This would help the author to determine the researchers' values and see what needs to be done to make the research of this field work better to improve the situation of minority-girl education. Human capital theory, nation-building theory, and social & cultural theories were the ones that would be used to evaluate the studies. The studies would be looked at to see which theoretical perspective was employed to approach the research questions.

The guidelines for questions under each and every category were listed below.

*Introduction.* Introduction in a study was the section which identified the research problem, presented a literature review, and brought in hypothesis. An introduction may include all these elements or any one or two of them. To make sure the questions asked under this category would be covering all these three elements, the questions would be concerning whether there was a problem; what was the problem; whether this problem was researchable; and what were possible outputs. Whether the problem was researchable would be determined mainly by the availability of the data and qualifications of the researcher. Background information, related literature, and hypotheses would be examined in answering the questions where applicable.

*Theoretical framework.* Theoretical framework concerned the theory perspective the

researcher adopted in the research. It might be a clear presentation of theory or the value held by the researcher that had been revealed between lines. It determined where the researcher stood. It also determined what limitations the study might have. Questions would be concerning whether any theory perspective was used in the study, what the theory was if there was any, what would be the strengths and weaknesses using that perspective, and so on.

Human capital theory was conceptualized to focus on the economic benefits brought by schooling, whether it was private or social. Criteria concerning this theory would be whether the studies discussed the relationship between education and enhanced human capital in the case of minority girls in China. Nation-building theory was conceptualized to assume that what was good for the nation also benefited all of society (G. Kelly & Altbach, 1986). Studies adopting this perspective asked either how education functioned to maintain the social fabric or how it could be made to function. In the case of minority-girl education, they asked how education for minority girls could be made to function to develop a nation-state generally along the models set by the Han and male domination. Social/cultural theories in this study were conceptualized in the form of inequality and difference that lay in gender and ethnicity. Minority girls were shouldering on them the differences resulted from their ethnic backgrounds and their gender, other than the dominant Han and male cultures. These were also one of the sources for the inequality in educational opportunities they faced. Only questions under this category are the same across the three groups of literature to be reviewed and analyzed.

*Method.* Research methodology showed how the research was carried out. It entailed questions regarding the participants, instruments, and designs and procedures. Criteria under this category should help to examine and evaluate these three main concerns. A look into whether the method was appropriate would be provided too.

*Results.* The questions asked within this category were about the presentation and description of the results. It ought to be made sure that all the hypotheses and problems are tested and the results are presented. The results ought to be appropriate, clear, and easy-to-understand.

*Discussion (conclusion and recommendations).* Discussion provided logical reasons for the relationship between the research problems and results. It was the consistency between the hypotheses and results that counted. Recommendations would also be examined on the same basis.

*Abstract or summary.* The last category to be evaluated was the abstract or summary part. The questions would be whether there was an abstract or a summary; whether the problem was restated; and so on.

### *Criteria*

Gay & Airasian (2000) provided a comprehensive and coherent set of critique techniques in their book *Educational Research: Competencies for Analysis and Application*, which best fitted the needs for this study. Therefore, criteria to review the

literature would be mainly based on their techniques and tailored to each group's characteristics (Gay & Airasian, 2000). These criteria will be presented below in the format of questions, group by group, category by category.

### *Group I, Practice*

#### *Introduction.*

1. Does the title indicate a focus of the study? What is it?
2. Is there a statement of problem? What is the statement?
3. How does the researcher confirm this is a problem?
4. Is background information on the problem presented?
5. Is the educational significance of the problem discussed?
6. Are most of the sources primary ones?

#### *Theoretical framework.*

1. Is the study conducted under human capital theory?
2. Is the study conducted under nation-building theory?
3. Is the study conducted under the social/cultural theories?
  - a) Inequality theories
  - b) Difference theories
4. No clear theory was employed.
5. The strengths and weaknesses of the theory adopted?



*Method.*

1. Are the size and major characteristics of the population studied described?
2. What are the procedures?
3. Do procedures logically relate to each other?
4. Are data coding strategies described and examples of coded data given?
5. When necessary, is a point of reference given?
6. None of the above has been done in the study.

*Results.*

1. Are appropriate descriptive statistics presented? What are they?
2. Does the researcher specify the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results?
3. Are the results generalized to the appropriate group?
4. No separate section is dedicated to presenting results.

*Discussion (conclusion and recommendations).*

1. Are theoretical and practical implications of the findings discussed?
2. Are recommendations for future action made? What are they?
3. No clear theoretical and practical implications or recommendations for future action are made.

*Abstract or summary.*

1. Are the problem/problems restated in the abstract?

2. Are the procedures described?
3. Are the major results and conclusions restated?
4. No abstract was presented.

*Group II, Speculations*

*Introduction.*

1. Is there a statement of the problems or a qualitative topic of study?
2. Does the problem or topic indicate a particular focus of study? What is the focus?
3. Can the problem be investigated through the way the author is proposing?
4. Is background information on the problem presented?
5. Is the educational significance of the problem discussed? How?
6. Is there a literature review? Does it educate the reader about the problem or topic?

*Theoretical framework.*

Questions to be asked under this category are the same with the ones from Group I.

*Method.*

1. Are the size and major characteristics of the population studied described?
2. What are the procedures? Do procedures logically relate to each other?
3. Are the data collection strategies used appropriately, given the purpose of the

study?

4. No methodology has been clarified in the study.

*Results.*

1. Are appropriate descriptive statistics presented? What are the major results?
2. Is the inductive logic used to produce results made explicit?
3. Are the results generalized to the appropriate group?
4. Results are not appropriate, clearly presented, or both.

*Discussion (conclusion and recommendations).*

1. Does the discussion provide logical reasons for the relationship between the research problems and results?
2. Is each result discussed in terms of its agreement or disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies?
3. Are generalizations consistent with the results?
4. Are theoretical and practical implications of the findings discussed?
5. Are recommendations for future action made? What are the recommendations or suggestions for future actions based on?
6. No clear theoretical and practical implications or recommendations for future action are made. No consistency is identified in the study.

*Abstract or summary.*

1. Is there an abstract or summary?

2. Is the problem restated?
3. Are the major results and conclusions restated?
4. No abstract was presented.

*Group III, Research Reports on Specific Problems*

*Introduction.*

1. Does the topic to be studied describe a general sense of the study focus?
2. Is there a literature review? Is the review comprehensive? Is it well organized? Does it educate the reader about the problem or topic? Does the review conclude with a summary and interpretation of the literature and its implications for the problem investigated? Do the implications discussed form an empirical or theoretical rationale for the hypotheses that follow?
3. Are references cited completely and accurately? Are all cited references relevant to the problem under investigation? Is the relevancy of each reference explained? Have the references been analyzed and critiqued, and the results of various studies compared and contrasted?
4. Are specific questions to be answered listed or specific hypotheses to be tested stated? Does each hypothesis state an expected relationship or difference? Is each hypothesis testable?

*Theoretical framework.*

Questions to be asked under this category are the same with the ones from Group I.

*Method.*

1. Are the size and major characteristics of the population studied described?  
Are the accessible and target populations described?
2. Is the rationale given for the selection of the instruments used? Is each instrument described in terms of purpose, content, validity, and reliability? Is the correct type of instrument used for data collection? Are data coding strategies described and examples of coded data given?
3. Does the researcher examine the possibility of personal bias in the study analysis and conclusion? Does the researcher use the most reliable, unbiased method of recording responses that could have been used? Is there a description of how any unexpected ethical issues were handled?
4. Are the procedures described in sufficient detail to permit them to be replicated by another researcher? Do procedures logically relate to each other?
5. If a sample was selected, is the method of selecting the sample clearly described? Does the method of sample selection suggest any limitations or biases in the sample? Are the size and major characteristics of the sample described? Does the sample size meet the suggested guideline for minimum sample size appropriate for quantitative analyses?

6. Are control procedures described? Did the researcher discuss or account for any potentially confounding variables that he or she was unable to control? Are the variables carefully selected? Is the rationale for variable selection described?
7. Are questionnaire validation procedures described? Is the questionnaire pretested? Are directions to questionnaire relate to one of the objectives of the study? Does each questionnaire item deal with a single concept? When necessary, is a point of reference given for questionnaire items? Are leading questions avoided in the questionnaire? Are there sufficient alternatives for each questionnaire item?
8. What is the percentage of returns, and how does it affect the study results? Are follow-up activities to increase returns described? If the response rate was low, was any attempt made to determine any major differences between responders and nonresponders? Does the researcher specify how the responses to semistructured and unstructured items are quantified and analyzed?
9. Are the interview procedures pretested? Does each item in the interview guide relate to a specific objective of the study? When necessary, is a point of reference given in the guide for interview items? Are leading questions avoided in the interview guide? Is the language and complexity of the

questions appropriate for the participants? Does the interview guide indicate the type and amount of prompting and probing that was permitted? Are the qualifications and special training of the interviewers described? Is the method used to record responses described?

10. No clear methodology has been illustrated.

*Results.*

1. Is every hypothesis tested? Is every question asked and answered in the results?
2. Are appropriate descriptive statistics presented clearly? Are the tables and figures (if any) well organized and easy to understand? If qualitative, are the data in each table and figure described in the text? If quantitative, are tables clear and pertinent to the research results?
3. Is the report of the study an integrated, synthesized, chronological presentation of the results? Is the inductive logic used to produce results in a qualitative study made explicit? Are the tests of significance interpreted using the appropriate degrees of freedom?
4. Results are not clearly, appropriately, or both presented.

*Discussion (conclusion and recommendations).*

1. Is each result discussed in terms of the original hypothesis or topic to which it relates? Is each result discussed in terms of its agreement or disagreement

with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies? Are generalizations consistent with the results?

2. Are the possible effects of uncontrolled variables on the results discussed?
3. Are theoretical and practical implications of the findings discussed? Are recommendations for future action made? Are the suggestions for future action based on practical significance or on statistical significance only?
4. If qualitative research, are conclusions supported by data? If quantitative, are conclusions and recommendations based on values of correlation coefficients corrected for attenuation or restriction in range? Do the conclusions avoid suggesting causal relationships between the variables investigated? Are causal relationships found discussed with due caution? Are plausible alternative hypotheses discussed?
5. No clear theoretical and practical implications or recommendations for future action are made.

*Abstract or summary.*

1. Is the problem restated?
2. Are the number and type of participants and instruments described?
3. Is the design used identified?
4. Are procedures described?
5. Are the major results and conclusions restated?



6. No abstract was presented.

### *Summary*

The literature was collected through searching library holdings, CARS searching, online searching, and searching for international organizations. Interlibrary loan service was also exploited to expand the access to library collections. A comprehensive search for literature on minority-girl education was thus achieved.

The methodology to review and analyze the literature obtained was also specified in this chapter. A full range of criteria on introduction, theoretical framework, method, results, discussion (conclusions/recommendations), and abstract or summary about the studies were prepared. The guidelines for these criteria were articulated and the specific questions to ask against these criteria were listed. Since the literature was to be classified into groups with different characteristics in terms of the ways they approach to the research problems, different criteria would be applied to different groups of studies. The questions were thus listed in the order of groups.

## CHAPTER THREE: RESULTS

### *Introduction*

This chapter presents the results obtained from applying the criteria that have been discussed in the previous chapter. The criteria are applied category by category, in the order of groups. In discussing the results, this chapter provides a foundation on which the three research questions asked in Chapter One will be answered. This chapter will first show what the groups of the literature are, then what the results are, and there will be a discussion of the results.

### *Search Results*

The searches revealed one book which consists of 17 relevant studies on minority-girl education, 13 articles from the searches conducted in the National Library of China, 10 articles from Google search. All of these articles were in Chinese. One English article on minority-girl education was located through CARS searching and it was found to be a translation of the summary of the study covered by the book located. So this article was used as a reference instead of an independent study to be reviewed and analyzed. Concerning background, 69 sources on gender roles, gender differences, educational inequality, minority education, minority-girl education, and statistics have been revealed. Some of them have both English and Chinese versions. In this case, only

one version was counted in the number of references although both have been used as references to each other. Altogether, there were forty studies to be reviewed and analyzed. All of them were in Chinese. English translation was used as references if available.

### *Literature Classification*

The located literature on minority-girl education turned out to be diverse in terms of style. This field also turned out to be new in that the earliest study was published in 1994. These studies had different characteristics. The majority of the studies asked how current education system could be made to function to develop a nation-state generally along the models expected by the government, taking minority-girl education as a perspective. Among these studies, some focused on summarizing the current practices and the others focused on articulating personal opinions. It would be more reasonable to apply different criteria to two different groups like this when reviewing and analyzing them. The rest of the literature discussed some specific problems such as gender difference in learning process, gender difference in decision making, and so on. These studies made the third group. Some criteria other than the ones for the first two groups should be used to review and analyze them. These three groups made the literature to be reviewed and analyzed. The fourth group of studies was about background information. They were used in providing background information and they would not be reviewed and analyzed like the other three groups.

---

Some local educational workers from minority areas have found that it is more difficult to enroll minority girls into school. It was also found to be more difficult for those enrolled minority girls to stay at school to finish basic education (L. Liu, 1994b; Postiglione & Teng, 1996; Suga & Moshi, 1998; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; Xu, 1998). In some highly minority-concentrated communities, it was not rare to see classes or even schools with boys only (Wencong Liu, 1994; Pan & Wu, 1999; Z. Sha, 1997; Suga & Moshi, 1998; Wu, 2000). They have put down their thoughts and experiences, hoping to contribute to finding ways to deal with this issue. These reports were practical and they made Group I: Practice.

Some institutional researchers were also attracted to research into this topic. The ways they carried out their research varied. Some of them focused on certain topics while the others provided some personal opinions on some issues arisen in the field. The ones dealing with personal opinions were classified into Group II: Speculations. The ones dealing with specific problems constructed Group III: Research Reports on Specific Problems. To make it easier to understand, tables will be used to show the articles in different groups by title, author, year of publication, and content<sup>18</sup>.

### *Results (I): Criteria Applied*

The first three groups of studies will be reviewed and analyzed. The results obtained

---

<sup>18</sup> These tables are available in the appendix 8, 9, and 10, for Group I, II, and III respectively.

will be shown in tables, indicating which questions have been answered by using the number assigned to each question asked in the previous chapter. The tables will be group by group. The titles will be abbreviated due to the limited space in the table, but the author and the year will be provided. The numbers in the tables are correspondent to the numbers in front of the questions asked in the previous chapter. Listing of the numbers means that these studies have satisfied the criteria associated with the numbers.

Table 3-1 shows the results of studies from Group I. This is the group of articles on educational practices concerning minority-girl education in China.

*Table 3-1.*

| Study                                      | Introduction | Theoretical framework | Method | Result  | Discussion | Abstract |
|--|--------------|-----------------------|--------|---------|------------|----------|
| Wu Lan...,<br>Chen, H.<br>(1994)           | 1, 2, 3, 6   | 2                     | 1      | 1       | 2          | 4        |
| Qinghai<br>Sheng...,<br>Liu, L.,<br>(1994) | 1, 2, 3      | 2                     | 6      | 1, 3    | 1, 2       | 4        |
| Hualong...<br>Liu, W.<br>(1994)            | 1, 2, 3      | 2                     | 1      | 1, 2, 3 | 2          | 4        |
| Menyuan...<br>Ma, W.<br>(1994)             | 1, 3         | 2                     | 1      | 3       | 1, 2       | 4        |
| Hu Zhu...<br>Ma, Y.<br>(1994)              | 1, 2, 3      | 2                     | 1, 2   | 1, 3    | 1, 2       | 4        |

| Study  | Introduction | Theoretical framework | Method | Result | Discussion | Abstract |
|--|--------------|-----------------------|--------|--------|------------|----------|
| Zai Gai Ge<br>He Tan<br>Suo<br>Zhong...<br>Wang, Z.<br>&<br>Liu, Z.<br>(1994)  | 1            | 2                     | 6      | 4      | 2          | 4        |
| Xun<br>Hua...<br>Wang,<br>Z. &<br>Ma, J.,<br>(1994)  | 1, 3         | 2                     | 1      | 1,3    | 1, 2       | 4        |
| Tan Tan...<br>Ma, Z.<br>(1994)   | 1            | 2                     | 2      | 1      | 3          | 4        |
| Zhong Guo<br>Xi Bu Nu<br>Tong Jiao<br>Yu De Kun<br>Jing Yu<br>Chu Lu...<br>Zhou, W.,<br>Zhang, T.<br>&<br>Liu, W.,<br>(1995) | 1, 3         | 2                     | 1      | 1      | 2          | 4        |
| Lian He<br>Guo...<br>Huang, M.,<br>(1996)  | 1, 2, 3      | 4                     | 2      | 4      | 3          | 4        |

| Study  | Introduction | Theoretical framework | Method | Result | Discussion | Abstract |
|--|--------------|-----------------------|--------|--------|------------|----------|
| Zai Gai Ge<br>He Tan<br>Suo Zhong<br>Fa Zhan...<br>Cai, X.<br>(1996)           | 1, 2, 3      | 2                     | 6      | 1      | 3          | 4        |
| Cong Kun<br>Jing<br>Zhong...<br>Ren, Y.,<br>(1996)                             | 2            | 2                     | 6      | 1      | 3          | 4        |
| Jie Jue...<br>Xu, L.,<br>(1998)  | 1            | 2                     | 6      | 1      | 3          | 4        |
| Pin Kun Di<br>Qu...<br>Wang, Z.,<br>(2000)                                     | 1, 2, 3      | 2                     | 1      | 1      | 3          | 1, 3     |
| Zai Gai Ge<br>He Tan<br>Suo Zhong<br>Fa Zhan<br>Shao...<br>Wang, Z.,<br>(2001) | 1, 2, 3      | 2                     | 1      | 1      | 3          | 1        |

*Discussion (Table 3-1)*

Referring to the questions asked in the previous chapter about the studies of Group I, the tables can be understood better.

*Introduction.* Under this category, 1 means that a focus of study is indicated; 2 means that there is a statement of problem; 3 means the research problem is confirmed; 4 means that background information on the problem is presented; 5 means that educational

significance of the research problem is discussed; 6 means that most of the sources are primary.

It can be seen from the table that every study has a focus indicated. Nine of these fifteen studies have a statement of problem. Eleven of them have confirmed the research problem or the focus. Only one study has discussed the educational significance of the research problem. One has mentioned that most of the sources are primary. With the ones that have not mentioned this, there is not a literature review available.

*Theoretical framework.* Among the results presented under this category, 1 means that the study is approached through human capital theory; 2 means that it is through nation-building theory; 3 means it is through social/cultural theories; 4 means that no clear theory is employed. A discussion will also provide the strengths and weaknesses of the theory adopted in these studies.

All the studies in this group approach the issue of minority-girl education through nation-building theory. It is stated in these studies that it is vital to universalize education among minority girls if the government goal of universalizing nine-year compulsory education is to be achieved. It is assumed that the goal is good for minority girls if it is good for the nation. These studies ask the question of how to make the education function better to maintain the social fabric.

*Method.* Under method, 1 means that the size and characteristics of the population studied are described; 2 means that the procedures are clearly listed; 3 means that the



procedures logically relate to each other; 4 means that the data coding strategies are described; 5 means that a point of reference is given when necessary; and 6 means none of the above has been done in the study.

From the numbers shown in the table, it can be seen that most of the studies stop after size and characteristics of the groups studied are given. Only three studies in this group are found to have listed procedures. It is still difficult to see whether these procedures logically relate to each other. There are five studies in this group that do not have any sort of methodology mentioned anywhere in the studies.

*Results.* In this category, 1 means that appropriate descriptive statistics are presented; 2 means that the researcher specified the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results; 3 means that the results are generalized to the appropriate group; 4 means that no separate section is dedicated to presenting results.

Three out of these fifteen studies are found not having appropriate descriptive statistics presented. Only one has made the logic applied to produce results explicit. Five studies are found to have results generalized to the appropriate group. This means that two thirds of the studies do not generalize results to the appropriate group. Two studies are found to have not presented results by any means.

*Discussion (conclusions and recommendations).* Under discussion, 1 means that theoretical and practical implications of the findings are discussed; 2 means that recommendations for future action are made; 3 means that no clear theoretical and

practical implications or recommendations for action are made.

Seven studies do not provide theoretical and practical implications or recommendations for future action. Four studies have both the implications and recommendations made clear. The remaining four have one of these two.

*Abstract or summary.* Under abstract, 1, 2, and 3 all mean that there is an abstract available; 4 means that there is no abstract presented. The number 1 makes sure that the problems are restated in the abstract; 2 means that the procedures are described; 3 means that the major results and conclusions are restated.

The majority of these studies do not have abstract available. Only two of these fifteen studies have abstracts. Both of these abstract have the problems restated and one has the major results and conclusions restated.

Table 3-2 shows the results of studies from Group II. This is the group of speculations.

*Table 3-2.*

| Study                             | Introduction | Theoretical framework | Method | Result | Discussion | Abstract |
|-----------------------------------|--------------|-----------------------|--------|--------|------------|----------|
| Gonghe...<br>Guo, A.,<br>(1994)   | 1, 2, 4      | 2                     | 4      | 4      | 4, 5       | 4        |
| Guan Yu...<br>Wang, G.,<br>(1994) | 2, 3, 4      | 4                     | 4      | 1, 3   | 3, 4       | 4        |

| Study   | Introduction | Theoretical framework | Method | Result  | Discussion | Abstract |
|---|--------------|-----------------------|--------|---------|------------|----------|
| Ti Gao...<br>Guan, G.,<br>(1994)  | 1, 2, 3, 4   | 4                     | 1      | 3       | 6          | 4        |
| Hui Zu...<br>Duo, T.<br>(1994)  | 2, 3, 4, 5   | 4                     | 4      | 1, 2, 3 | 3, 4, 5    | 4        |
| Quan<br>She...<br>Liu, W.,<br>(1994)                                      | 3            | 4                     | 4      | 1       | 2, 4       | 4        |
| Min Zu...<br>Ren, Y.,<br>(1994)   | 1, 2, 4      | 2                     | 4      | 1, 2, 3 | 6          | 4        |
| Zhong Guo<br>Shao<br>Shu...<br>Fang, S.,<br>(1995)                        | 1, 2, 3, 4   | 2                     | 4      | 3       | 2, 3, 4, 5 | 4        |
| Xi Bu<br>Shao<br>Shu...<br>Ren, Y.,<br>(1996)                             | 1            | 4                     | 4      | 4       | 6          | 4        |
| Meigu...<br>Sha, Z.,<br>(1997)  | 1, 4         | 4                     | 4      | 1       | 6          | 4        |
| Shan Qu...<br>Suga, L. &<br>Moshi, G.,<br>(1998)                          | 2            | 4                     | 4      | 1, 2, 3 | 6          | 4        |
| Qinghai<br>Shao Shu<br>Min Zu<br>Di...<br>Ma, L. &<br>Wang, Q.,<br>(1998) | 1, 2, 4      | 2                     | 4      | 2, 3    | 3, 4, 5    | 4        |

| Study   | Introduction  | Theoretical framework | Method  | Result  | Discussion | Abstract |
|---|---------------|-----------------------|---------|---------|------------|----------|
| Qinghai<br>Shao Shu<br>Min Zu<br>Fu...<br>Ge, Y.,<br>(1998) | 1, 2, 4       | 2                     | 1, 4    | 1, 2    | 3, 4       | 2, 3     |
| Liangshan<br>...<br>Pan, Z. &<br>Wu, M.,<br>(1999)          | 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 | 2                     | 1, 2, 4 | 1, 2, 3 | 1, 3, 4    | 2, 3     |
| Xi Bu Pin<br>Kun...<br>Ma, J.,<br>(2000)                    | 1, 2, 3       | 2                     | 1, 2    | 1, 3    | 1, 3, 5    | 2, 3     |
| Zai Lun Xi<br>Bu...<br>Ma, J.,<br>(2000)                    | 1, 2          | 2                     | 4       | 1, 3    | 1, 3, 5    | 4        |
| Mama<br>De...<br>Wu, M.,<br>(2000)                          | 1, 2          | 2                     | 4       | 1       | 5          | 4        |
| Dui Xi<br>Bu...<br>Ma, Y.,<br>(2000)                        | 2, 4          | 2                     | 4       | 1       | 3, 5       | 2, 3     |
| Tu Zu<br>Nu...<br>Ren, Y.,<br>(2001)                        | 1, 4          | 2                     | 4       | 1       | 5          | 4        |
| Guizhou<br>Sheng...<br>Chen, Z.,<br>(2003)                  | 1, 2, 4, 6    | 2                     | 1, 4    | 1, 2    | 2, 3, 4, 5 | 2, 3     |

*Discussion (Table 3-2)*

*Introduction.* In this group, under introduction, 1 means that there is a statement of the problems or a qualitative topic of study; 2 means that the problem or topic indicates a particular focus of study; 3 means that the problem can be investigated in the way the author is proposing; 4 means that background information on the problems is presented; 5 means that the educational significance of the problem is discussed; and 6 means that there is a literature review or this part educates the reader about the problem or topic.

Focus and statement of research problems seem to be the better-finished areas in this group. Only two studies from this group show that the problem can be investigated in the way the author is proposing. Background information presentation is well done and most of these studies have it. Literature review is found in only one study and it is not formally stated as literature review.

*Theoretical framework.* Under theoretical framework, the numbers mean the same thing as they do in Table 3-2. Two studies are found to have no clear theoretical perspective. The rest are all approaching this topic in the name of fulfilling the government goal of universalizing nine-year compulsory education. It is assumed to be good for all the social groups in the country and these studies mainly focus on how to develop a national identity among the minority girls.

*Method.* Under method, 1 means that the size and major characteristics of the

population studied are described; 2 means that the procedures are illustrated and they logically relate to each other; 3 means that the data collection strategies are used appropriately, given the purpose of the study; 4 means that no methodology has been clarified in the study.

The majority of the studies do not have methodology clarified anywhere in the studies. Three studies are found to have procedures illustrated and these procedures logically relate to each other.

*Results.* Under results, 1 means that appropriate statistics are presented; 2 means that the inductive logic used to produce results is made explicit; 3 means that the results are generalized to the appropriate group; and 4 means that results are not appropriate, not clearly presented, or both.

Appropriate statistics are presented in most studies. Only one study has made the inductive logic used to produce explicit results. Many of the studies do not fall under the column where results are generalized to the appropriate group because they do not answer all the questions that have been stated. Incomplete presentation of the results is the major reason for not having them categorized under 3. Two studies are found to have results that are not appropriate, nor clearly presented.

*Discussion (conclusions and recommendations).* Under discussion, 1 means that the discussion provides logical reasons for the relationship between the research problem and results; 2 means that each result is discussed in terms of its agreement or disagreement

with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies; 3 means that generalizations are consistent with the results; 4 means that theoretical and practical implications of the findings are discussed; 5 means that recommendations for future action are made; and 6 means that no clear theoretical and practical implication or recommendations on actions are made, no consistency is identified in the study, or both.

Most generalizations in these studies are consistent with the results. But few of them provide logical reason for the relationship between the research problem and results. Results are seldom discussed in terms of their agreement or disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies. This might be so because there are no such results obtained by other researchers in other studies, which indicates that this field is a new field. Or there is a lack of communication among researchers so that these studies turn out to be independent from one another.

*Abstract or summary.* The numbers under abstract: 1 means that there is an abstract or summary; 2 means that the problem is restated; 3 means that the major results and conclusions are restated; 4 means that no abstract is presented.

Five studies have their abstracts available. These abstracts all have the problems restated and the major results and conclusion restated.

Table 3-3 shows the results of studies from applying the criteria on studies in Group III, the group made up of research studies on specific problems.

Table 3-3.

| Study  | Introduction | Theoretical framework | Method | Result | Discussion | Abstract |
|--|--------------|-----------------------|--------|--------|------------|----------|
| Cong Ningxia...<br>Yang, J.,<br>(1994)                                       | 1            | 4                     | 1, 10  | 4      | 1          | 6        |
| Qinghai Sheng<br>Shao Shu<br>Min Zu<br>Chu<br>Zhong...<br>Liu, L.<br>(1994)  | 1            | 4                     | 1      | 1, 2   | 1, 3       | 6        |
| Shao Shu<br>Min Zu<br>Xue<br>Sheng...<br>Sun, R. &<br>Guo, C.<br>(1994)      | 1, 2, 4      | 4                     | 1, 10  | 1, 4   | 5          | 6        |
| Qinghai<br>Shao Shu<br>Min Zu Di<br>Qu...<br>Zhou, Y. &<br>Mao, X.<br>(1994) | 1            | 4                     | 1, 10  | 4      | 4          | 6        |



| Study   | Introduction | Theoretical framework | Method | Result | Discussion | Abstract |
|---|--------------|-----------------------|--------|--------|------------|----------|
| Zhong Guo<br>Shao Shu<br>Min Zu Fu<br>Nu Wen<br>Hua Su<br>Zhi...<br>Zhang, T.<br>& Chen,<br>X.,<br>(1995) | 1            | 4                     | 1, 10  | 1, 3   | 5          | 1, 3, 5  |
| Shao Shu<br>Min Zu Nu<br>Tong...<br>Peng, Y.,<br>(2004)   | 1            | 4                     | 10     | 1, 3   | 1, 3       | 1        |

*Discussion (Table 3-3)*

*Introduction.* In Table 3-3, under the column of introduction, 1 means that the topic to be studied describe a general sense of the study focus; 2 means that there is a literature review or some part equivalent to a literature review in fulfilling the role of educating the reader about the research problem; 3 means that references are cited completely and accurately; and 4 means that specific questions to be answered in the study are listed.

This table shows that the weak point in introduction for these studies is the literature review. Only one study is found to fulfill the role of educating the reader about the research problems. No citations of references are available. One study lists specific questions to be answered.

*Theoretical framework.* Under the column of theoretical framework, the same numbers mean the same things as they do in Table 3-1.

The studies in this group are found to have no clear theoretical framework specified. This again makes it harder to evaluate the strength and weakness of the studies in that some of those are innate with the theoretical paradigms.

*Method.* Under method, 1 means that the size and major characteristics of the population studied are described; 2 means that the rationale for the selection of the instruments used is given; 3 means that the researcher examine the possibility of personal bias in the study analysis and conclusion; 4 means that the procedures are described in sufficient detail to permit them to be replicated by another researcher when necessary; 5, 6, 7, 8, and 9 are all about different instruments, sampling, control procedures, questionnaire validation procedures, the responses obtained from questionnaire, and interview procedures respectively; and 10 means that no clear methodology has been illustrated.

It was hoped when this study first started that there would be some concrete methods described in the studies. Questions concerning the specific research designs and instruments were asked. It was found out that what the studies from this group did best was to describe the size and major characteristics of the population studied. The authors did not provide the reader with any kind of rationale or procedures. Hence, these studies are not replicable. This is not good for further development for this field.

*Results.* Under result, 1 makes sure that every hypothesis is tested; 2 means that appropriate descriptive statistics were presented clearly; 3 means that the report of the study is an integrated, synthesized, and chronological presentation of the results; 4 means that results are not clearly and/or not appropriately presented.

Clear and appropriate results are presented in half of the studies in this group. In four of these six studies, every question asked in the previous parts is answered. Two studies have done well in integrating, synthesizing, and presenting the results chronologically. But this is rare.

*Discussion (conclusions and recommendations).* Under discussion, 1 makes sure that each result is discussed in terms of the original hypothesis or topic to which it relates, each result is discussed in terms of its agreement or disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies, and the generalizations are consistent with the results; 2 means that the possible effects of uncontrolled variables on the results are discussed; 3 means that the theoretical and practical implications of the findings are discussed; 4 means that the conclusions made are supported by data; 5 means that no clear theoretical and practical implications or recommendations for future action are made.

It is easy to assume that when presenting the discussion, the authors presume that the readers know many facts about the current status of minority-girl education so that some necessary inductive logic is missing and sometimes generalizations that are inconsistent

with the results are made. Studies fell into this group are expected to give enough practical and theoretical implications, but only one study clearly gives the implications of the results obtained in the study.

*Abstract or summary.* Under abstract, 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5 all mean that there is an abstract for the study available. Among them, 1 means that the problem is restated in the abstract; 2 means that the number and type of participants and instruments are described; 3 means that the design used is identified; 4 means that the procedures are described in the abstract; 5 means that the major results and conclusions are restated. The number 6 means that no abstract is presented in the study.

Two of these six studies have abstracts available. By not fulfilling all the criteria of 1 to 5, these abstracts are found to be of poor quality. It is reflected in the table that abstracts come in as part of the studies that were conducted more recently. So there is improvement of the format of research going on but there is room for more development.

### *Discussion*

It could be reflected that research of this field is at its beginning stage that the earliest publication located in this study was from 1994 and the literature as a whole is sparse. Most of the authors are local educational practitioners. Some researchers from different institutes are gradually attracted to this topic. However, this literature still suffers from a lack of identity and isolation from other relevant disciplines.

Secondly, only one study is considered to have a good introduction section that conveys the focus of the study well enough to educate the reader about the research problem and to give credit to other researchers in terms of having necessary reference points given. Generally, the literature of this field is weak in reliability and relevance of hard data. The majority of the studies do offer an introduction that will accomplish the job of introducing the research problems. But from the personal experiences I have had during the research process, more background information could be obtained from some sources that have been published at a much earlier time. More emphasis should be attached to the significance of this field and acknowledgement of other studies should be made.

Thirdly, the studies are remarkably atheoretical in that they either have no theoretical framework or have nation-building theory as their perspective, which has been presumed in the policies concerning minorities in China. The focus on nation-building theory shows the narrow-mindedness in theoretical paradigms in this field. The studies put the national goal of universalizing nine-year compulsory education as the starting point. Everything that has been done is about how to integrate minority girls into this national goal instead of starting from the specific needs of the minority girls. There are trends of un-acknowledged and uncriticized concepts and cultural bias.

Methodology is another weak point in this field of research. None of the studies satisfy the criteria of having a solid methodology. The procedures are rarely described

and the personal bias was not examined in any of the studies that have been reviewed and analyzed. Missing description of the procedures makes it impossible for other researchers to replicate the studies. It also means that these research studies are not open to criticism. Bias is untested and sources of influence and evaluation of the studies are not articulated explicitly. This will not benefit future research.

Although the majority of the literature does not offer a well-articulated section of introduction in terms of giving citations and literature review, it does a good job in introducing the background information and presenting research problems most of the time. Appropriate results are usually presented. Given the characteristics of these studies, descriptive statistics are presented most often. It is reflected that presenting results is considered to be a more important section of a study by various authors in that in almost all studies there is a separate section dedicated to it. This, at the same time, reflects another problem: most of the sources are not primary. The quality of data directly affects the quality of research. More measures should be taken to improve this situation. However, due to the problem rooted in a poor presentation of introduction and method, it is hard to evaluate whether appropriate results are well presented or not. Therefore, when applying the criteria, it is not the author's goal to spot a clearly stated introduction and methodology. As long as they are reflected, it is accepted as the working introduction and methodology.

The discussion (conclusions and recommendations) is another important section.

Many studies seem to go straight to making recommendations after the research problems are stated. Because there is a fairly good presentation of results, the discussion usually goes well in that it has something to be based on. The major problem in this section is that not every study has a discussion which covers the results thoroughly. And yet, some research problems other than the ones the studies are dealing with are mentioned abruptly in this section in some cases, which reflects a lack of focus in the research.

An abstract or summary is not considered to be necessary until some more recent studies. Thirteen out of these forty studies have abstracts. Six of these thirteen abstracts are found to restate the research problems and main findings well. The other 7 mention the research problems or they just have an abstract. Having an abstract does not guarantee the quality it. It is also noticed that some abstracts are available in both Chinese and English. Having an English abstract in some studies may suggest that there is a gradual awareness and acknowledgement of the issue of China's minority-girl education in the international community. At the same time, there is room for more development.

### *Results (2)*

This part helps to expand out knowledge about minority-women education in China. It suggests what challenges minority women face when it comes to education.

---

Minority-women education is an issue beyond borders. It has different characteristics in different countries. In China, it is intertwined with race and ethnicity distinctions, rural and urban gaps, geographical differences, economic development stages, education system reforms, and social and historical reforms (Bi & Wang, 1999; H. Chen, 1994; Guan, 1994; L. Liu, 1994b; Wencong Liu, 1994; Wenpu Liu, 1994; Pan & Wu, 1999; Peng, 2004; Postiglione & Teng, 1996; Yu Ren, 1996; Suga & Moshi, 1998; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; Xi, 2002; Xiao, 1994, 1995; D. Yang, 2000a, 2000b; X. Yang, 2000; W. Zhou et al., 1995). Different aspects of this issue lead to the same phenomenon: minority women have lower educational attainment and higher illiteracy rate. Since education is the major path for social mobility in China, minority women are not likely to enjoy a proportionate level of social participation. Their voice is hardly ever heard and they are rarely seen in public. This translates into the following problems in educational practice.

Minority girls are disadvantaged in gaining access to education. They have lower school enrollment compared to both their male counterparts in the same ethnic groups and female counterparts in the Han ethnic group (H. Chen, 1994; Z. Chen, 2003; Ge, 1998; Guan, 1994; Huang, 1996; L. Liu, 1994b; Wencong Liu, 1994; Wenpu Liu, 1994; J. Ma, 2000a; Y. Ma, 2000; Pan & Wu, 1999; Yu Ren, 1996; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994). Minority girls suffer from higher dropout rates and lower completion rates (H. Chen, 1994; Ge, 1998; Guan, 1994; L. Liu, 1994b; Wenpu Liu, 1994; Y. Ma, 2000; Pan & Wu, 1999; Yu Ren, 1996; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994). Because of limited access to schooling and



---

leaving school too early, minority women's educational opportunity is reduced so their educational attainment and literacy rates are negatively impacted (Z. Chen, 2003; Guan, 1994; Huang, 1996; Y. Ma, 2000; W. Zhou et al., 1995).

Minority girl students are also found to have lower school achievement which is illustrated through their higher repetition rates and lower graduation rates (H. Chen, 1994; Z. Chen, 2003; Wencong Liu, 1994; Wenpu Liu, 1994; J. Ma, 2000a; Pan & Wu, 1999; Peng, 2004; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994). Researchers have found that the current education system is not accommodating minority girls' special needs enough to provide them with the conditions to succeed (H. Chen, 1994; Ge, 1998; Guan, 1994; Huang, 1996; Jiang et al., 1994; J.-Q. Liu, 1998; L. Liu, 1994b; Wencong Liu, 1994; Niu, 1993; Peng, 2004; Postiglione & Teng, 1996; Yu Ren, 1996; Rong & Shi, 2001; Z. Sha, 1997; Suga & Moshi, 1998; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; D. Yang, 2000b; Yin & Li, 2002; Yin & Zhang, 2002). Current teacher supply, unified school curriculum, inflexible pedagogy, and old school management styles all play a role in minority girls' poor school performance (J. Ma, 2000a, 2000b; Peng, 2004).

As a result, minority girls' chances for obtaining higher levels of education and appropriate career placement after graduation from high school are adversely affected (Z. Ma, 1994). Going into educational institutions of higher levels is a mere chance for Chinese students in general<sup>19</sup>, which makes career placement for the graduates really

---

<sup>19</sup> According to Pixies (2001), 10% of primary graduates, 50% of junior high graduates, and 75% of high school

---

critical (Pixies, 2001). This in turn has negative effects on their school enrollment rates.

Various reasons lead to these problems. These challenging factors affecting minority-girl education result from economic, social, cultural, and political aspects.

First of all, the economic development in most minority areas is still at a primitive stage compared to the rest of the country. This has influenced minority girls' chance of going to school to a great extent in terms of capabilities of paying for schooling with limited financial sources from governments, from families, or from individual savings. The level of productivity of minority areas also remains low (H. Chen, 1994; Pan & Wu, 1999; Peng, 2004; Yu Ren, 1996; Yugui Ren, 2001). People from these areas do not enjoy a reasonable standard of living. Until 1998, about 20 million minorities still suffered from lack of enough food, which makes up more than a half of the nation's total population that did not have enough food (China Association For Science & Technology, 2003). Minority areas host 81% of the poverty-stricken counties<sup>20</sup> of the country as of 1993 (China Association For Science & Technology, 2003). The productivity activities in minority areas are of little flexibility and low level and researchers have found that it has resulted in poor local governments, poor local population, and poor local families in those areas (Guan, 1994; A. Guo, 1994; L. Liu, 1994b; Wencong Liu, 1994; W. Ma, 1994; Y. Ma, 1994; Yugui Ren, 1994b; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; Wu, 2000; W. Zhou et al., 1995).

---

graduates cannot go to schools at higher levels.

<sup>20</sup> The poverty-stricken counties are those with an average income lower than ¥300 per person/year. This is equal to US\$ 52 against 1993 exchange rate.

The poor local governments in minority areas cannot invest sufficiently into minority-girl education (A. Guo, 1994; L. Liu, 1994b; W. Ma, 1994; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; W. Zhou et al., 1995). Most schools in minority areas are equipped with very poor facilities (H. Chen, 1994; A. Guo, 1994; W. Ma, 1994; Y. Ma, 1994; Peng, 2004; Yugui Ren, 1994b; Yu Ren, 1996; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994). Another source of investment, the poor minority families, cannot find extra resources to allow their girls to go to school either. As a way of improving productivity, education has not been developed to a satisfactory degree in minority areas thereby (Guan, 1994; Peng, 2004). Their present status and level of education are far from adequate in relation to the legal status and education to which they are entitled and in relation to their potential contribution to the national development (X. Yang, 2000). This puts minority-girl education, as well as the development process of minority areas, into a vicious cycle.

Secondly, the social mentality in minority areas does not provide a favorable circumstance for minority girls to obtain an education. There is a wide-spread unawareness of the significance of girl education in minority areas so that many researchers have found that it is very hard to convince the minority community and parents into sending their girls to schools (Wencong Liu, 1994; W. Ma, 1994). Sometimes girls are called back home from school because their parents find the pressure from the community unbearable (Wencong Liu, 1994). Some minority girls do not dare to go back home after they graduate from school yet find no job or are unable to pass the

---

entrance examinations to schools of higher levels because they are afraid of the pressure they might feel from the communities (Wencong Liu, 1994). Some religious beliefs discourage minority girls to participate in any activities that take place outside the households, including going to schools (Z. Wang & Ma, 1994). Schools located close by will help the minority parents make decisions on their girls' education. However, due to some historical reasons, there was no official school system for the general population in most minority areas (Guan, 1994; Z. Ma, 1994; Peng, 2004). In addition to that, minorities usually reside in a dispersed manner and most of them live in remote areas, which makes it hard to find enough students if schools are to be built in each area where they live. This situation remains almost the same so that the school availability is not sufficient enough for all. Therefore, the distance between households and schools remains a big issue in that minority parents will find it easier to accept the idea of sending their daughters to school which are not too far so that they can still keep an eye on them to make sure that they are safe (L. Liu, 1994b; W. Ma, 1994; Y. Ma, 1994; Pan & Wu, 1999; Yugui Ren, 1994b; Yu Ren, 1996; Yugui Ren, 2001; Wu, 2000; W. Zhou et al., 1995).

Communities and families work together to increase or decrease minority girls' chances to obtain an education. The family decision makers, parents in most cases, usually consider girls' education as the lowest priority among all the family investment decisions to be made (H. Chen, 1994; E. Hannum, 2003; L. Liu, 1994b; W. Ma, 1994;

---

Pan & Wu, 1999; Yugui Ren, 1994b; Z. Sha, 1997; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; Wu, 2000). They would rather spend money on superstitious practices than pay for school fees for their girls (Pan & Wu, 1999; Z. Sha, 1997; Suga & Moshi, 1998). Due to the gender roles and the limited horizons the parents might have from their low or non educational attainment, they do not think highly of gaining knowledge from schools. Consequently, minority parents do not hold very high expectations for their girls (H. Chen, 1994; Wencong Liu, 1994; W. Ma, 1994; Y. Ma, 1994; Peng, 2004; Yu Ren, 1996; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; W. Zhou et al., 1995). The practice of early marriage in most minority areas is also critical in lowering parental expectations for girls because everything they spend on their girls today will not be paid off for the girls barely get out of school by the time they get married (H. Chen, 1994; L. Liu, 1994b; Wencong Liu, 1994; W. Ma, 1994; Y. Ma, 1994; Pan & Wu, 1999; Yugui Ren, 1994b; Yu Ren, 1996; Z. Sha, 1997; Suga & Moshi, 1998; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; Wu, 2000; W. Zhou et al., 1995). With low expectations from both the communities and families, minority girls find it hard to gain enough self-esteem or high enough self-expectations to fight against the social rules. This makes it hard for them to psychologically adjust well enough at school and thus contributes to their lower school achievement (Peng, 2004). They are educated into the traditional gender roles generation after generation (Peng, 2004). As a result, when their parents find that there is a lack of labor to carry out the household chores and call them back from schools, they would obey.

Thirdly, there are some cultural factors affecting minority girls' educational opportunity. Minority women are shouldering the responsibility of keeping with the traditions of their own ethnic groups (Brown & Park, 2002; F. Guo, 2000; Stromquist, 1994). To make the education system work for them, this responsibility of minority girls' has to be respected. At present, China has a unified national school curriculum. Bilingual education is offered with translated textbooks and with the primary goal of enabling the minority students to eventually do their studies in Han language (Dai & Dong, 1996). The unified curriculum does not offer as much variety as the minorities would like to see in schools where they are sending their girls (H. Chen, 1994; L. Liu, 1994b; Peng, 2004; Yu Ren, 1996; W. Zhou et al., 1995). The more educated the minority girls become, the more integrated into the majority culture they will be (Mackerras, 1995). Thereby a decline in a sense of ethnic identities among them is to be felt. At the same time, they might not get what they need to live around their local communities after they graduate from schools. The parents would rather not pay for the girls' schooling to have them capable of doing very little to fulfill their gender roles in the future.

In addition to the need to keep with their own cultures, minority girls have their own ways of thinking and making decisions. Xing Yang (2000) states that "gender equality must be built on the basis of full recognition of the differences between men and women." The differences between men and women have not been recognized well enough in China. Although the level of development of minority education varies with

---

different ethnic groups, the current educational system is not accommodating minority girls' specific needs well enough, sometimes due to the ignorance of the differences (L. Ma & Wang, 1998). The school curriculum, as it is nationally unified, is not gender-sensitive, neither ethnicity-sensitive (H. Chen, 1994; L. Liu, 1994b; Mackerras, 1995; Peng, 2004; Yu Ren, 1996; W. Zhou et al., 1995). Many minority girls find what is taught at school is too far away from their daily life and find it hard to comprehend. School management is another issue. Having minority girl students is a new event for most schools in minority areas, yet the schools are not necessarily adopting a new style of management to accommodate these new students (H. Chen, 1994; A. Guo, 1994; Y. Ma, 1994; Peng, 2004; W. Zhou et al., 1995). What is more important to minority girls is that there is a lack of female minority teachers and school principals (H. Chen, 1994; L. Liu, 1994b; Yugui Ren, 1994b; Yu Ren, 1996; W. Zhou et al., 1995). This is partly because there is a shortage of teachers and school staff (H. Chen, 1994; A. Guo, 1994; Y. Ma, 1994; Peng, 2004; Wu, 2000). It is also partly because of the narrow goals of education presumed by the current mentality that the students have to pass the entrance examinations to schools at higher levels (A. Guo, 1994; L. Liu, 1994b; Yugui Ren, 1994b; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994). The minority girls have to adjust to this whole new world at school almost all by themselves. They already have low expectations from parents and communities and low level of self-esteem from themselves; it is very unlikely that they could succeed in such environments.

Fourthly, political will plays a very important role in determining minority girls' equal chances to education. The Chinese government has made specific policies concerning minority women education. It has to be credited with having made sincere, sustained, and often creative efforts to deal with China's minorities in all aspects (Dreyer, 1976; Mackerras, 1994). Dreyer (1976) also points that "policy toward minority nationalities under the Chinese People's Republic has been motivated by a desire to integrate the life patterns and institutions of these groups with those of China, both Han and Communist" (p. 261). It is not surprising that a framework within which the process of integration might reasonably be expected to take place has been set up. Policies regarding minority-women education are thereby in line with the constitution, education laws, laws concerning minorities, and the women's rights protection law.

Minority women, being affected by all the above, are restricted from exercising many of their rights. It is presumed that all the minority ethnic groups should be integrated into the Han by the government. This will inevitably encounter resistance from minority communities with the wish of preserving their own cultures and distinct identities. Women, as the vehicle of passing down their traditions, will consequentially be prevented from taking part in this process. The women's rights protection law was passed in 1992 in China. Serving as a milestone in achieving women's equal rights to men in the country, this law still put limits on the types of work women are allowed to perform (Haiplik, 2001). Women are treated solely along biological lines in the law, thus



---

reinforcing the stereotype that the primary role of women is reproduction (Haiplik, 2001). Gender discrimination continues especially in the minority areas. Significance of minority-girl education is yet to be recognized.

This is correlated with the implementation process of the policies. Resistance from minority communities to implement these policies is often witnessed (Johnson & Chhetri, 2000). This might put the policies into question. Chinese minority policies have been along the line of “national in form, socialist in content”. There might be a contradiction in the first place (Dreyer, 1976; Johnson & Chhetri, 2000). Investment in minority-girl education has not been sufficient (L. Liu, 1994b; Wu, 2000; W. Zhou et al., 1995). The allocation and usage of the available resources have not been satisfactory (H. Chen, 1994). The development of minority-girl education has been further restricted due to this (J. Ma, 2000a, 2000b; Y. Ma, 2000; Peng, 2004). Some successful educational practices for minority girls such as boarding school, girl schools, girl classes, “moving classrooms<sup>21</sup>”, flexible school hours<sup>22</sup>, and so on, are more costly than regular schools. With limited funding, it is not likely that there will be sufficient education for minority girls to begin with. There is also misuse of available funds for minority-girl education (J. Ma, 2000a, 2000b). School facilities and teacher salaries are usually the things to suffer more from this problem. This results in instability in both material and human resources

---

<sup>21</sup> In some nomadic areas, teachers follow the minority girls to teach them classes wherever they need to go to look after their stock. In this way, they have a kind of “moving classrooms”.

<sup>22</sup> Since many of the minority girls need to take care of their younger siblings while their parents are working in the field or sometimes they need to work in the field, some schools offer flexible school hours for them so that they can go to school after their parents get back from the field work.

for minority-girl education.

Another problem occurring in implementing policies lies in the goals of the educational system. When students get enrolled in China, they are educated to graduate to go on to schools at a higher level, including minority girls. They become the weapon for schools to compete with each other in graduation rates (Duo, 1994). The sole goal of graduating from schools does not serve minority girls. They need to graduate from school with some skills that are going to help them participate in the development process in their communities. Therefore, political will to develop minority-girl education in China needs to be strengthened and reformed.

### *Summary*

Forty studies on minority-girl education in total have been located through all the searches. These studies were classified into three different groups according to their ways of approaching the research problems. The exact classification of these groups is available in Appendix 8, 9, and 10. Another group of literature which was on background information was also located. They can be seen in the references. The results obtained from applying the criteria named in the methodology chapter were also presented. A basic narrative discussion on the results was provided. The major weak points about these studies are found to be concerning literature review, theory, and the data. Following this was a review of the literature in terms of the topics of the studies. Even

though these studies do not have solid methodology available, they still serve as the preliminary sources for understanding the current status of minority-girl education in China.

## CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

### *Introduction*

This chapter answers the research questions by presenting findings and making recommendations on future research orientations in the field of minority-girl education in China. All the findings and recommendations will be provided with explicit reasoning and based on the results presented and the discussions made in the previous chapter. The research questions this study seeks to answer are:

1. In what ways does the literature present information or insights which will contribute positively towards the development of relevant, effective, sustainable appropriate policy and practice concerning minority-girl education in China?
2. What does the literature contribute to our knowledge about the education of minority girls in China?
3. What are the possible future research orientations in minority-women education in China?

The first question will be answered by presenting findings from the results obtained from applying the criteria. The second question will be answered by presenting the challenges minority girls face when it comes to education and the general status of

education for minority girls in China. The third question will be answered in the form of making recommendations.

### *Findings*

The first four findings are about the first research question. Findings number 5 and number 6 are the answers to the second research question.

*Finding (1).* This field is still young and it is worth researching. From the time of publication and the quality of research, it can be learned that both the number and quality of research in this field are improving along the timeline. Among the located literature for this study, the earliest publication was in 1994. Although I believe that the issue of minority-girl education in China always existed before that, this publication and later ones showed that this issue was recognized by more and more researchers.

*Finding (2).* There is a lack of networking and teamwork among the researchers in this field. Except for the book that consists of 17 studies on minority-girl education, the other studies were located from various journals. A field of research on minority-girl education in China is still at its beginning stage. Lack of teamwork among researchers is mainly reflected in the references. Little literature review or reference sources have been mentioned. There are very few primary sources identified in the studies. A willingness to be open-minded and cooperative among the researchers should be in place to help with this situation.

*Finding (3).* It is found in these studies that there is no clear theoretical paradigm employed. There is a fixed framework of thinking when it comes to the values of developing minority-girl education: it is the key and difficult point in universalizing nine-year compulsory education. It is assumed by this approach that what is good for the nation would also benefit the social groups. If gender and ethnicity are thought to make no difference, minority women's lives, experiences, activities are overlooked and an ideal is formulated in terms of men and the Han, and the roles for which they have traditionally been considered to be suited (Martin, 1981). Research that has been done under this perspective is of limited benefit to minority-girl education thereby.

As a result, it seems to be the only goal of the government and the researchers that minority girls ought to be at school and formal schools only. Formal schools are where the national unified curriculum is taught, even in the schools in minority areas. It is strongly indicated in the government policies, textbooks, pedagogy, and so on, that minority cultures are inferior to that of the Han. Even though all the minorities have been entitled to equal rights to develop their cultures as stated in Chinese Constitution, there is a striking contradiction in the Chinese education system (Hansen, 1999).

Consequentially, even though minority women/girls are supposed to have equality in all aspects of life, their needs are little known. Sometimes they are not even known by themselves. Inequality will remain until these needs are known and catered to. This fact indicates that minority girls might have been put in an awkward position where they

must either give up their own way of experiencing and looking at the world thus alienating themselves from their cultures or remain uneducated. It is thus suggested that minority-girl education should not rely solely on formal schools. Some deeper reform into the current educational system might be needed.

*Finding (4).* The research methodology is weak in terms of the absence of description of procedures and good hard data. The studies are thus not critique-sensitive. This is another reason why the researchers in this field seem to be independent of one another. Research designs that are suitable for minority-girl-education research in China should be made.

*Finding (5).* Some innovative approaches to improve the situation of minority-girl education in China have been found to be of help. Minority-girl education has attracted interests from local communities, governments, schools, researchers, etc. This has helped with the improvement of the educational practices concerning minority-girl education. Innovative approaches such as “flexible school hours” and “moving classrooms” have been adopted. The mindset of traditional educational workers is being opened up.

*Finding (6).* A better understanding of minority-girl education is not separable from a good grasp of the constraints that prevent minority girls from obtaining education. These constraints and challenges are found to be from political, economic, social, and cultural aspects (Bi & Wang, 1999; H. Chen, 1994; Guan, 1994; L. Liu, 1994b; Wencong Liu, 1994; Wenpu Liu, 1994; Pan & Wu, 1999; Peng, 2004; Postiglione & Teng, 1996;

Yu Ren, 1996; Suga & Moshi, 1998; Z. Wang & Ma, 1994; Xi, 2002; Xiao, 1994, 1995; D. Yang, 2000a, 2000b; X. Yang, 2000; W. Zhou et al., 1995). Current status of minority-girl education in China is found to be both oppressing and liberating. Minority girls have to sacrifice their ethnic identity to adjust into the dominant society. Yet minority girls are still hoping that they could become equipped with some necessary skills that they need for their survival. To improve the situation of minority-girl education better, it is desired to have a total approach from all these four aspects.

### *Recommendations*

Based on the findings, some recommendations on future research orientations can be made. A comprehensive approach to build a more equitable educational atmosphere for minority girls should be taken. Before any further steps are taken, valuing of all students including minority-girl students must be in place. Provision of support services and development of new interrelationships among home, school, and community should be incorporated into future programs concerning minority-girl education. The research field of minority-girl education should simultaneously grow with the practice containing these elements, fulfilling each other along the way.

*Recommendation (1).* Since this field is improving, opportunity to develop this field is there and should be grasped. To guide this field to the right direction and to attract more interest groups into this field, research on the educational significance of



minority-girl education should be conducted. Valuing all students will be a good cut-through into this topic.

*Recommendation (2).* There is a deep-rooted assumption in the minority-girl-education research field in China. Without questioning, the researchers consider sending the minority girls to school the priority way of providing them education; however, other forms of education are neglected. There needs to be a change of this assumption from the researchers. To change the deep-rooted assumptions and to be more open-minded will allow more non-formal education forms to cater to the real needs of minority girls'. Honesty in academics is desired in this field in that only truthful research could be useful. Ways to obtain primary data should be encouraged and a network among researchers in this field should be established. Some real hard work on changing paradigms needs to be done. In this way, what minority girls' needs are could be identified and thus be utilized in daily educational practice.

In China, the government's version of ethnic categorization, as transmitted in the state school system, is categorical and definite even though ethnic identities, as well as other social identities, are fluid, overlapping, and multifaceted (Hansen, 1999). Therefore, the study of minority education in China is also a study of power relations. Future research should therefore also have a focus on this aspect.

*Recommendation (3).* Future research could be built upon the basis of the current literatures. That is to say that research into the suggestions made in these studies should

be conducted to allow future practice some guidance from research. Also, more specific research on constraints that shape obstacles in minority girls' education should be carried out. This will help to identify what their specific needs are and to establish new perception of women's roles in modern educational paradigms. The adaptation of all aspects of school operation to the unique characteristics and needs of female students will be the key to the development of an equitable system of education (Cardenas, 1994).

*Recommendation (4).* There is a need for a more clarified methodology if this field is to develop. The issue of minority-girl education research requires a joint and continuous effort from all the parties involved. By offering a clear methodology, future researchers are allowed to see very clearly how the research has been conducted so that they will be able to critique it. Methodology will be refined in this way and improvement will be achieved in this critiquing process.

*Recommendation (5).* The literature shows that there is little attention paid to scientific research methodology in the field. Most of the studies try to cover all the problems in minority-girl education. An in-depth knowledge in any single problem is still absent. Therefore, more studies specified on certain problems are desired. More statistical analysis will help to define to what level certain variables are associated with one another. Suppose minority girls' special needs in education are one of the variables, some quantitative studies will help to determine to what level they are significant. Qualitative research will help to define what exactly the minority girls' needs are, or

what the problems in this field are. If worked well, a combination of these two research approaches will help with making the current educational system work better for minority girls.

### *Summary*

The research field of minority-girl education in China has been improving in terms of the number and quality of research studies. However, there is a lack of networking and teamwork among researchers in this field. It is desirable to have not only some good circumstances for researchers to conduct more research in this field, but also the inner drive from the researchers themselves to explore deeper into their assumptions and have a nice reform in this research field.

Minority girls face many challenges when it comes to education. More research is needed to explore what their needs are to meet the challenges. In order to have more research on this, the dominant ideology on minority-girl education should be reformed and a network among the researchers in this field should be established.



## REFERENCES

- Akande, B. E. (1987). Rural-Urban comparison of female educational aspirations in South-Western Nigeria. *Comparative Education*, 23(1), 75-83.
- Alderman, H., Orazem, P. F., & Paterno, E. M. (2000). School quality, school cost, and the public/private school choices of low-income households in Pakistan. *The Journal of Human Resources*, 36(2), 304-326.
- Arnot, M. (2000). Gender relations and schooling in the new century: Conflicts and challenges. *Compare*, 30(3), 293-302.
- Bellow, R. T., & King, E. M. (1993). Educating women: lessons from experience. In E. M. King & M. A. Hill (Eds.), *Women's education in developing countries: Barriers, benefits, and policies* (pp. 285-326). Baltimore, Maryland: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Bi, S., & Wang, Y. (Eds.). (1999). *Dang jin shi jie jiao yu si chao (Prevailing trends of educational thoughts of contemporary world)*. Beijing, China P.R.: Ren Min Jiao Yu Chu Ban She (People's Education Press).
- Brown, P. H., & Park, A. (2002). Education and poverty in rural China. *Economics of Education Review*, 21(6), 523-541.
- Burbridge, L. C. (1991). *The Interaction of race, gender, and socioeconomic status in education outcomes*. MA: Center for Research on Women.

- 
- Cardenas, J. A. (1994). A Comprehensive approach to gender equity. *Intercultural Development Research Association Newsletter (IRDA Newsletter)*, 21(3), 3-4.
- Chen, H. (1994). Wulan xian Menggu zu nu tong jiao yu diao cha bao gao (Research report on Mongolian girl education in Wulan Mongolian Autonomous County) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 67-77). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Chen, Z. (2003). Guizhou sheng Bijie di qu Miao Zu nu tong jiao yu fa zhan de ruo gan si kao (Some reflections on the development of Miao-girl education in Bijie, Guizhou Province). *Bijie Shi Fan Gao Deng Zhuan Ke Xue Xiao Xue Bao (Journal of Bijie Teachers College)*, 21(3), 18-25.
- China Association For Science & Technology. (2003). *Shao shu minzu ji dian qing kuang*. Retrieved November 27, 2003, from <http://new.cast.org.cn/popularization/struct/folk/106723827264.shtml>
- Chua, P., Bhavnani, K.-K., & Foran, J. (2000). Women, culture, development: a new paradigm for development studies? *Ethnic and Racial Studies.*, 23(5), 820-841.
- Colley, A. (1998). Gender and subject choice in secondary education. In J. Radford (Ed.), *Gender and Choice in Education and Occupation* (pp. 18-36). London and New York: Routledge.
- Connelly, R., & Zheng, Z. (2003). Determinants of school enrollment and completion of

- 
- 10 to 18 year olds in China. *Economics of Education Review*, 22(4), 379-388.
- Dai, Q., & Dong, Y. (1996). Zhongguo Shaoshu Minzu Shuangyu Jiaoyu de Lishi Yange (The Historical evolution of bilingual education for ethnic minorities in China). *Minzu Jiaoyu Yanjiu (Journal of Research on Education for Ethnic Minorities)*, 52(4).
- Dreyer, J. T. (1976). Minorities policy: An Overview. In *China's forty millions: Minority nationalities and national integration in the People's Republic of China* (pp. 261-276). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Duo, T. (1994). Hui zu nu xue sheng zhi chu lu chu tan (Preliminary exploring into the career placement for the Hui female students) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 111-117). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Fox, C. (2003). No place for girls? Gender, ethnicity and citizenship education in the Lao People's Democratic Republic. *Compare*, 33(3), 401-412.
- Gay, L. R., & Airasian, P. (2000). *Educational research: Competencies for analysis and application*. (6 ed.). Upper Saddle river, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall Inc.
- Ge, Y. (1998). Qinghai shao shu min zu fu nu jiao yu xian zhuang ji dui ce si kao (Current state of minority-women education in Qinghai and some reflections). *Qinghai Minzu Xueyuan Xuebao: She Hui Ke Xue Ban (Journal of Qinghai Institute for Nationalities: Social Sciences)*(3), 87-90.

- Glewwe, P., & Jacoby, H. (1993). Student achievement and schooling choice in low-income countries: evidence from Ghana. *The Journal of Human Resources*, 29(3), 843-864.
- Guan, G. (1994). Ti gao min zu zheng ti su zhi, Bi xu qiang hua nu zi jiao yu (Female education must be emphasized to improve the overall quality of the nation) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 191-207). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Guo, A. (1994). Gonghe xian Zang zu nu tong jiao yu diao cha bao gao (Research report on Tibetan girl education in Gonghe Tibetan Autonomous County) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 58-66). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Guo, F. (2000). The historical track of the Chinese ancient female personality. *Chinese Education and Society*, 33(6), 6-14.
- Haiplik, B. M. (2001). *Unheard voices, open eyes: A Study of ethnic minority women in higher education in Northwest China.*, University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada.
- Hannum, E. (2003). Poverty and basic education in rural China: Villages, households, and girls' and boys' enrollment. *Comparative Education Review*, 47(2), 141-159.
- Hannum, E. C. (1998). *Educational inequality: Hidden consequences of the reform era in*



---

*rural China*. Unpublished dissertation, The University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan.

Hansen, M. H. (1999). *Lessons in being Chinese: Minority education and ethnic identity in Southwest China*. Seattle, WA: University of Washington Press.

Hill, M. A., & King, E. M. (1993). Women's education in developing countries: An Overview. In E. M. King & M. A. Hill (Eds.), *Women's education in developing countries: Barriers, benefits, and policies* (pp. 1-50). Baltimore, Maryland: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Huang, M. (1996). *Lianheguo nu tong jiao yu ce lue ji zhong guo min zu di qu shi shi jian kuang (UN strategy for girl education and its application in minority areas in China)*. Retrieved October 12, 2003, from <http://www.cbe21.com/zhuanti/minzujy/jiaodians/nvtongjy/0003.htm>

Hyde, K. (1999). Barriers to educational opportunity in Malawi. In S. Erskine & M. Wilson (Eds.), *Gender issues in international education: Beyond policy and practice* (pp. 131-147). New York: Falmer Press.

Jackson, T. (2000). *Equal access to education: A Peace imperative for Burundi* (report evaluative). London, England: International Alert.

Jiang, H., Liu, W., Ren, Y., Liu, L., Wang, Z., & Liu, W. (Eds.). (1994). *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)*. Xining, Qinghai, P.R. China: Qinghai People's Press.

- 
- Johnson, B., & Chhetri, N. (2000). Exclusionary policies and practices in Chinese minority education: The case of Tibetan education. *Current Issues in Comparative Education.*, 2(2), 1-12.
- Kelly, G., & Altbach, P. (1986). Comparative education: Challenges and responses. *Comparative Education Review*, 30(1), 89-107.
- Kelly, G. P. (1987). Setting state policy on women's education in the Third World: perspectives from comparative research. *Comparative Education*, 23(1), 95-102.
- Kiluva-ndunda, M. M. (2001). *Women's Agency and Educational Policy: The Experiences of the women of Kilome, Kenya*. New York: State University of New York Press.
- Kwong, J., & Xiao, H. (1989). Educational equality among China's minorities. *Comparative Education*, 25(2), 229-243.
- Lee, M. B. (2001). *Ethnicity, education and empowerment: How minority students in Southwest China construct identities*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing Company.
- Lin, J. (1997). Policies and practices of bilingual education for the minorities in China. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development.*, 18(3), 193-205.
- Liu, J.-Q. (1998). Education of females in China: Trends and issues. *Journal of Educational Thought*, 32(1), 43-55.
- Liu, L. (1994a). Qinghai sheng shao shu min zu chu zhong sheng shu xue xue fa xing bie cha yi de bi jiao yan jiu (A Comparative study on the gender difference in minority

- 
- junior high school students' mathematics learning) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu* (*Minority girl education research in Qinghai*) (pp. 142-167). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Liu, L. (1994b). Qinghai sheng shao shu min zu nu tong jiao yu diao cha bao gao (Research report on minority girl education in Qinghai province) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu* (*Minority girl education research in Qinghai*) (pp. 1-25). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Liu, W. (1994). Hualong Hui zu zi zhi xian nu tong jiao yu diao cha bao gao (Research report on Hui-girl education in Hualong Hui Autonomous County) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu* (*Minority girl education research in Qinghai*) (pp. 87-96). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Liu, W. (1994). Quan she hui dou yao gao du zhong shi nu tong jiao yu (High level of importance should be attached to girl education) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu* (*Minority girl education research in Qinghai*) (pp. 104-110). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Liu, W. (2000). The Dilemma in Chinese women's receiving an education. *Chinese*

---

*Education and Society*, 33(2), 37-43.

Lucidi, A. D. (1994). *Gender equity in education: A Review of the literature* (information analyses No. ED 374044).

Ma, J. (2000a). Xibu pin kun shao shu min zu di qu nu tong jiao yu de fa zhan (The development of girl education in poverty-stricken minority areas in West China).

*Minzu Jiaoyu Yanjiu (Journal of Research on Education for Ethnic Minorities)*, 56(4), 64-68.

Ma, J. (2000b). Zai lun xi bu pin kun shao shu min zu di qu nu tong jiao yu de fa zhan (On The Development of girl education in poverty-stricken minority areas in West

China: II). *Gansu Jiao Yu (Journal of Education Research in Gansu Province)*(3), 6-7.

Ma, L., & Wang, Q. (1998). Qinghai shaoshu minzu di qu fu nu jiao yu wen ti tan xi (Explorations and analysis on women education in minority areas in Qinghai

province). *Qinghai Minzu Yanjiu (Nationalities Research in Qinghai)*, 9(2), 58-63.

Ma, W. (1994). Menyuan Huizu zi zhi xian Malian xiang nu tong jiao yu diao cha bao gao (Research report on girl education in Malian Xiang in Menyuan Hui Autonomous

County) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.),

*Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)*

(pp. 78-86). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.

Ma, Y. (1994). Huzhu Tu zu zi zhi xian nu tong jiao yu yan jiu diao cha bao gao

(Research report on Tu-girl education in Huzhu Tu Autonomous County) (J. Luo,

- 
- Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 41-57). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Ma, Y. (2000). Dui xi bu min zu di qu fu nu jiao yu de si kao (Reflections on minority-women education in West China). *Zhong hua nu zi xue yuan xue bao (Journal of Women's Academy in China)*, 43(5), 37-40.
- Ma, Y. (Ed.). (1984). *Zhong guo shao shu min zu chang shi (Common knowledge concerning Chinese ethnic minority groups)*. Beijing, China: Zhong Guo Qing Nian Chu Ban She (China Youth Press).
- Ma, Y., & Chen, Y. (Eds.). (1981). *Zhong guo shao shu min zu (China's ethnic minority groups)*. Beijing, China: Ren Min Chu Ban She (People's Press).
- Ma, Z. (1994). Tan tan Qinghai Hui zu nu zi jiao yu (On Hui women/girl education in Qinghai) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 183-190). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Mackerras, C. (1994). Policies towards the minority nationalities, 1949-1993. In *China's minorities: Integration and modernization in the twentieth century* (pp. 139-166). Hong Kong: Oxford University Press.
- Mackerras, C. (1995). *China's minority cultures: Identities and integration since 1912*. New York: St. Martin's Press.

- 
- Martin, J. R. (1981). The ideal of the educated person. *Educational Theory*, 31(2), 97-109.
- Niu, X. (1993). Gender inequality in Chinese education. *Education and Society*, 11(2), 19-30.
- Palmer, K. (2000). China's nationalities and nationality areas. In C. Hudson (Ed.), *The China Handbook: Prospects onto the 21st Century*. (pp. 276-285). Chicago: Glenlake Publishing.
- Pan, Z., & Wu, M. (1999, July 19, 2002). *Liangshan Yi Zu nu tong jiao yu cun zai de wen ti ji dui ce jian yi (Yi girls' education in Liangshan: existing problems, possible solutions, and recommendations)*. Retrieved October 5, 2003, from <http://ethnic.eastedu.com/ziliaoku/2002/20020719-02.htm>
- Peng, Y. (2004). Shaoshu minzu nu tong di xue ye cheng jiu de gui yin fen xi yu dui ce (The Analysis of minority girls' low school achievement and possible solutions). *Minzu Jiaoyu Yanjiu (Journal of Research on Education for Ethnic Minorities)*, 60(1), 28-34.
- Persson, T., & Tabellini, G. (1994). Is inequality harmful for growth? *American Economic Review*, 84(3), 600-621.
- Pixies. (2001, November 29, 2001). *Zhongguo wei yi yi ge gong bu ying qiu de hang ye da gai jiu shi jiao yu ( Education is probably the only profession that has a larger demand than supply in China)*. Retrieved May 15, 2004, from

---

<http://www3.ccw.com.cn/club/essence/200111/7315.htm>

- Postiglione, G. A. (1992). The Implications of modernization for the education of China's national minorities. In R. Hayhoe (Ed.), *Education and modernization: The Chinese experience*. (pp. 307-336). Oxford: Pergamon Press.
- Postiglione, G. A., & Teng, X. (1996). Zhong guo bian jiang min zu di qu de ji chu jiao yu yu chuo xue wen ti (The Issue of basic education and dropout in ethnic minority areas on China borders). *Minzu Jiaoyu Yanjiu (Journal of Research on Education for Ethnic Minorities)*, 52.
- Ren, Y. (1994a). Min zu di qu nu tong chuo xue wen ti de tan tao (Discussion on the issue of minority girl student dropout in minority areas). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 118-130). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Ren, Y. (1994b). Minzu diqu nu tong chuo xue wenti de tan tao (Discussions on the issue of girls' dropout in minority areas) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 118-130). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Ren, Y. (1996). *Cong kun jing zhong jue qi- zhongguo xi bu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu shi yan (Rise above the difficulties- The Research experiment on girl education in West*

- 
- China*). Retrieved October 12, 2003, from <http://www.cbe21.com/zhuanti/minzujiy/jiaodians/nvtongji/0001.htm>
- Ren, Y. (2001). *Tu Zu nu tong yi wu jiao yu de xian zhuang ji dui ce (The Current State of compulsory education for Tu girls and reflections)*. Retrieved May 31, 2004, from <http://61.184.198.202/RESOURCE/Article/JYLW/2/211/lw017080.htm>
- Reyes, P., & Capper, C. A. (1991). Urban Principals: A critical perspective on the context of minority student dropout. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 27(4), 530-557.
- Rong, X. L., & Shi, T. (2001). Inequality in Chinese Education. *Journal of Contemporary China*, 10(26), 107-124.
- Sha, L. (1998, 08/16/2001). *Di yi deng ji de ai (The First class love)*. Retrieved March 26, 2004, from <http://xernet.xj.cninfo.net/redian/huati7.htm>
- Sha, Z. (1997). *Meigu Yi Zu nu tong ru xue nan zhi wo jian (My reflections on the difficulty for Yi girls to go to school in Meigu County)*. Retrieved October 5, 2003, from <http://www.cbe21.com/zhuanti/minzujiy/jiaodians/nvtongji/0005.htm>
- Sperling, G. B. (2001). Toward universal education: Making a promise, and keeping it. *Foreign Affairs.*, 80(5), 7-13.
- Stromquist, N. P. (1989). Determinants of educational participation and achievement of women in the Third World: a review of the evidence and a theoretical critique. *Review of Educational Research*, 59(2), 143-183.
- Stromquist, N. P. (1990). Gender inequality in education: accounting for women's



- subordination. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 11(2), 137-153.
- Stromquist, N. P. (1994). Gender and education. In T. Husen & T. N. Postlethwaite (Eds.), *The International Encyclopedia of Education* (2 ed., Vol. 4, pp. 2407-2412). Oxford: Pergamon.
- Stromquist, N. P. (1995). Romancing the state: Gender and power in education. *Comparative Education Review*, 39(4), 423-454.
- Stromquist, N. P. (1996). Gender delusions and Exclusions in the Democratization of Schooling in Latin America. *Comparative Education Review*, 40(4), 404-425.
- Stromquist, N. P. (2001). What poverty does to girls' education: the intersection of class, gender and policy in Latin America. *Compare*, 31(1), 39-56.
- Stromquist, N. P. (2002). Gender issues, international. In J. W. Guthrie (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of Education* (Vol. 3, pp. 919-921). New York: Thomson Gale.
- Suga, L., & Moshi, G. (1998, June 3, 2002). *Shan qu yi zu nu tong ru xue nan zhi wo jian* (Reflections on the difficulty in Yi-girl attending school in mountainous areas). Retrieved October 5, 2003, from <http://ethnic.eastedu.com/ziliaoku/>
- Summers, L. H. (1994). *Investing in all the people: Educating women in developing countries*. Washington D. C.: The World Bank.
- Sun, R., & Guo, C. (1994). Shao shu min zu xue sheng jue ce xing si wei xing bie cha yi yan jiu (A Study on gender difference of minority students in decision making) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu*

*nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 168-174).

Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.

Tao, X. (1936). *Sheng huo jiao yu zhi te zhi (Characteristics of life education)*. Retrieved

March 25, 2004, from

<http://www.china-village.org/ReadNews.asp?NewsID=3431&newsnameID=18&newsname=>

The Lustrum Office of the State Council, & Population and Social Science and

Technology Division of National Bureau of Statistics of China. (2002). *Zhongguo*

*2000 nian ren kou pu cha zi liao (The 2000 Census of The People's Republic of China)*

(J. Luo, Trans. 1th ed.). Beijing, China: Zhongguo tong ji chu ban she (China

Statistical Press).

Tsai, K. S. (2002). State ideology and women in rural China. In R. Datta & J. Kornberg

(Eds.), *Women in Developing Countries*. (pp. 47-74). Boulder, Colorado: Lynne

Rienner Publishers.

UNESCO Bangkok Principal Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific. (2000). *Girls' and*

*women's education: Policies and implementation mechanisms. Synthesis of five case*

*studies. (evaluative/feasibility)*. Bangkok, Thailand: UNESCO.

Vijverberg, W. P. M. (1992). Educational investments and returns for women and men in

Cote d'Ivoire. *The Journal of Human Resources*, 28(4), 933-974.

Wang, G. (1994). Guan yu Hui zu Sala zu nu zi zhong xue xian zhuang ji wen ti de diao

- cha (Research on the current status and problems of high schools for Hui and Salar girls) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 97-103). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Wang, Y. (2003, 05/01/2003). *Liu sheng "San Nong" diao cha bao gao: Shang xue pian (Report on Agriculture, rural area, and farmers in six provinces: Education)*. Retrieved Mar 26, 2004, from <http://www.aweb.com.cn/2003/5/1/200351101058.htm>
- Wang, Z., & Liu, Z. (1994). *Zai gai ge he tan suo zhong fa zhan shao shu min zu nu tong jiao yu (Developing minority girl education in the process of reform and exploration)* (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 131-141). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- Wang, Z., & Ma, J. (1994). *Xunhua Sala zu zi zhi xian nu tong jiao yu diao cha bao gao (Research report on Sala girl education in Xunhua Sala Autonomous County)*. In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (Jiesu Luo ed., pp. 26-40). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.
- World Bank. (1992). *Educating girls has a high payoff*. Retrieved 03 02, 2004, from <http://www.worldbank.org/html/dec/Publications/Briefs/DB2.html>
- Wu, M. (2000). *Mama de nu er yao du shu: Guan yu Liangshan Yi Zu nu tong ru xue wen*

- ti de bao gao (Moms' daughters want to go to school: Report on the situations of Yi girls' schooling in Liangshan)*. Retrieved October 25, 2003, from <http://www.jdedu.net:8080/RESOURCE/Article/JYLW/2/211/lw017040.htm>
- Xi, C. (2002). *Jiu shi nian dai yi lai wo guo nu tong jiao yu yan jiu shu ping (Summary on girl education research of China since 1990)*. Retrieved 10 20, 2003
- Xiao, H. (1994). Girls strive for equal education. *Women of China (Zhong Guo Fu Nu)*, 38(10), 14-16.
- Xiao, H. (1995). Education: The First step to equality. *Women of China (Zhong Guo Fu Nu)*, 39(8), 29-31.
- Xu, L. (1998). *Jie jue shao shu min zu di qu nu tong ru xue de shi jian yu tan suo (Practices and explorations to solve the issue of minority-girl education in minority areas)*. Retrieved October 12, 2003, from <http://www.cbe21.com/zhuanti/minzujy/jiaodians/nvtongjy/0002.htm>
- Yang, D. (2000a). Dui wo guo jiao yu gong ping wen ti de ren shi he si kao: Shang. (Awareness and considerations on educational equality in China: I). *Jiao Yu Fa Zhan Yan Jiu (Educational Development Research)*, 21(8), 5-8.
- Yang, D. (2000b). Dui wo guo jiao yu gong ping wen ti de ren shi he si kao: Xia. (Awareness and considerations on educational equality in China: II). *Jiao Yu Fa Zhan Yan Jiu (Educational Development Research)*, 21(9), 14-17.
- Yang, X. (2000). Psychological obstacles to female education in China, and our

---

counterpolicy. *Chinese Education and Society*, 33(3), 84-96.

Yin, H., & Li, W. (2002, 2002 12 30). *Wo guo yi xing cheng bi jiao wan zheng de min zu jiao yu ti xi (China has developed a holistic educational system for minorities)*.

Retrieved March 05, 2004, from

[http://big5.xinhuanet.com/gate/big5/news.xinhuanet.com/zhengfu/2002-12/30/content\\_674240.htm](http://big5.xinhuanet.com/gate/big5/news.xinhuanet.com/zhengfu/2002-12/30/content_674240.htm)

Yin, H., & Zhang, J. (2002, 2002 07 29). *Wo guo min zu jiao yu ti xi ji ben xing cheng 19,000,000 duo wan shao shu min zu xue sheng zai xiao jiu du (China's minority educational system has formed, more than 19,000,000 minority students are being enrolled in school)*. Retrieved March 05, 2004, from

[http://big5.xinhuanet.com/gate/big5/news.xinhuanet.com/zhengfu/2002-07/29/content\\_501467.htm](http://big5.xinhuanet.com/gate/big5/news.xinhuanet.com/zhengfu/2002-07/29/content_501467.htm)

Zheng, Z. (2003, December 12, 2003). *Cong di wu ci ren kou pu cha kan wo guo de sao mang wen ti (Issue of literacy in China: Viewed from the fifth national census)*.

Retrieved March 28, 2004, from

<http://www.cass.net.cn/webnew/file/2003121210721.html>

Zhou, M. (2000). Language policy and illiteracy in ethnic minority communities in China. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development.*, 21(2), 129-148.

Zhou, M. (2001a). The politics of bilingual education and educational levels in ethnic minority communities in China. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and*

---

*Bilingualism.*, 4(2), 125-149.

Zhou, M. (2001b). The politics of bilingual education in the People's Republic of China since 1949. *Bilingual Research Journal.*, 25(1&1), 147-171.

Zhou, W., Zhang, T., & Liu, W. (1995). *Zhong guo xi bu nu tong jiao yu de kun jing yu chu lu (The Difficulties and path out for girl education in West China)*. Retrieved March 05, 2004, from <http://www.edu.cn/20011012/3004714.shtml>

Zhou, Y., & Mao, X. (1994). Qinghai shao shu min zu di qu nu jiao zhi gong su zhi xian zhuang jian xi (A Brief analysis of the current situation of minority female teachers in Qinghai Province) (J. Luo, Trans.). In H. Jiang, W. Liu, Y. Ren, L. Liu, Z. Wang & W. Liu (Eds.), *Qinghai min zu nu tong jiao yu yan jiu (Minority girl education research in Qinghai)* (pp. 175-182). Xining, Qinghai, P. R. China: Qinghai People's Press.

## APPENDIX 1: FIFTY-SIX ETHNIC GROUPS IN CHINA

The fifty-six ethnic groups and their populations are shown in the table below. Han ethnic group is the majority ethnic group and all the rest are minority ethnic groups.

| Ethnic Group              | Population<br>(10,000) | Ethnic Group                                    | Population<br>(10,000) |
|---------------------------|------------------------|---|------------------------|
| National Population Total | 124261.22              | Han   | 113738.61              |
| Minority Population Total | 10449.07               | Minority 's Percentage of<br>the National Total | 8.41%                  |
| Mongolian                 | 581.39                 | Hui   | 981.68                 |
| Tibetan                   | 541.60                 | Uyгур   | 839.92                 |
| Miao                      | 894.01                 | Yi  | 776.23                 |
| Zhuang                    | 1617.88                | Bouyei  | 297.15                 |
| Korean                    | 192.38                 | Manchu  | 1068.23                |
| Dong                      | 296.63                 | Yao   | 263.74                 |
| Bai                       | 185.81                 | Tujia   | 802.81                 |
| Hani                      | 143.97                 | Kazak   | 125.05                 |
| Dai                       | 115.90                 | Li  | 124.78                 |
| Lisu                      | 63.49                  | Va  | 39.66                  |
| She                       | 70.96                  | Gaoshan   | 0.4461                 |

|           |        |        |        |
|-----------|--------|--------|--------|
| Lahu      | 45.37  | Shui   | 40.69  |
| Dongxiang | 51.38  | Naxi   | 30.88  |
| Jingpo    | 13.21  | Kirgiz | 16.08  |
| Tu        | 24.12  | Daur   | 13.24  |
| Mulam     | 20.74  | Qiang  | 30.61  |
| Blang     | 9.19   | Salar  | 10.45  |
| Maonan    | 10.72  | Gelao  | 57.94  |
| Xibe      | 18.88  | Achang | 3.39   |
| Pumi      | 3.36   | Tajik  | 4.10   |
| Nu        | 3.87   | Ozbek  | 1.24   |
| Russian   | 1.56   | Ewenki | 3.05   |
| De'ang    | 1.97   | Bonan  | 1.65   |
| Yugur     | 1.37   | Jing   | 2.25   |
| Tatar     | 0.4890 | Drung  | 0.7426 |
| Oroqen    | 0.8196 | Hezhen | 0.4640 |
| Moinba    | 0.8923 | Lhoba  | 0.2905 |
| Jino      | 2.09   |        |        |

Source: Zhongguo 2000 nian ren kou pu cha zi liao (The 2000 Census of the People's Republic of China)



## APPENDIX 2: FIVE AUTONOMOUS REGIONS IN CHINA

| Name           | Capital  | Date of foundation | Major Minority Ethnic Groups  |
|----------------|----------|--------------------|---|
| Inner Mongolia | Hohhot   | May 1, 1947        | Mngolian, Manchu, Hui, Korean,<br>Daur, Ewenki, Oroqen, Xibe,<br>Russian                      |
| Xinjiang       | Urumqi   | October 1, 1955    | Uygur, Kazak, Daur, Hui, Kirgiz,<br>Ozbek, Mongolian, Xibe, Tajik,<br>Tartar, Russian, Manchu |
| Guangxi        | Nanning  | March 15, 1958     | Zhuang, Yao, Miao, Dong, Mulam,<br>Maonan, Hui, Yi, Shui, Jing, Gelao                         |
| Ningxia        | Yinchuan | October 25, 1958   | Hui, Dongxiang, Bonan, Salar, Tu,<br>Manchu   |
| Tibet          | Lhasa    | September 1, 1965  | Tibetan, Moinba, Lhoba, Hui   |

Source: [http://www.cnmuseum.com/intro/zizhi\\_intro.asp](http://www.cnmuseum.com/intro/zizhi_intro.asp)

## APPENDIX 3: PICTURE OF THE TWO YI GIRLS IN STORY #3



Source: provided by Qianlai Luo.

## APPENDIX 4: THE MINORITY AUTONOMOUS PREFECTURES IN CHINA

|    | Province | Name                      | Capital  | Date of Foundation |
|----|----------|---------------------------|----------|--------------------|
| 1  | Jilin    | Yanbian Korean            | Yanji    | September 3, 1952  |
| 2  | Gansu    | Gannan Tibetan            | Hezuo    | October 1, 1953    |
| 3  | Gansu    | Linxia Hui                | Linxia   | November 19, 1956  |
| 4  | Qinghai  | Yushu Tibetan             | Jiegu    | December 25, 1951  |
| 5  | Qinghai  | Hainan Tibetan            | Qiabuqia | December 6, 1953   |
| 6  | Qinghai  | Huangnan Tibetan          | Longwu   | December 22, 1953  |
| 7  | Qinghai  | Haibei Tibetan            | Haomen   | December 31, 1953  |
| 8  | Qinghai  | Guoluo Tibetan            | Dawu     | January 1, 1954    |
| 9  | Qinghai  | Haixi Mongolian & Tibetan | Delingha | January 25, 1954   |
| 10 | Xinjiang | Bayinguoleng Mongolian    | Kuerle   | June 23, 1954      |
| 11 | Xinjiang | Boertala Mongolian        | Bole     | July 13, 1954      |
| 12 | Xinjiang | Kezilesu Kirgiz           | Atushi   | July 14, 1954      |
| 13 | Xinjiang | Changji Hui               | Changji  | July 15, 1954      |
| 14 | Xinjiang | Yili Kazak                | Yining   | November 27, 1954  |
| 15 | Sichuan  | Ganzi Tibetan             | Kangding | November 24, 1950  |
| 16 | Sichuan  | Liangshan Yi              | Xichang  | October 1, 1952    |
| 17 | Sichuan  | Aba Tibetan & Qiang       | Maerkang | January 1, 1953    |

|    |         |                         |            |                    |
|----|---------|-------------------------|------------|--------------------|
| 18 | Yunnan  | Xishuangbanna Dai       | Yuntaihong | January 24, 1953   |
| 19 | Yunnan  | Dehong Dai & Jingpo     | Mangshi    | July 24, 1953      |
| 20 | Yunnan  | Nujiang Lisu            | Liuku      | August 23, 1954    |
| 21 | Yunnan  | Dali Bai                | Dali       | November 22, 1956  |
| 22 | Yunnan  | Diqing Tibetan          | Zhongdian  | September 13, 1957 |
| 23 | Yunnan  | Honghe Hani & Yi        | Gejiu      | November 18, 1957  |
| 24 | Yunnan  | Wenshan Zhuang & Miao   | Wenshan    | April 1, 1958      |
| 25 | Yunnan  | Chuxiong Yi             | Chuxiong   | April 15, 1958     |
| 26 | Guizhou | Qiandongnan Miao & Dong | Kaili      | July 23, 1956      |
| 27 | Guizhou | Qiannan Bouyei & Miao   | Duyun      | August 8, 1956     |
| 28 | Guizhou | Qianxinan Bouyei & Miao | Xingyi     | May 1, 1982        |
| 29 | Hunan   | Xiangxi Tujia & Miao    | Jishou     | September 20, 1957 |
| 30 | Hubei   | Exi Tujia & Miao        | Enshi      | December 1, 1983   |

Source: [http://www.cnmuseum.com/intro/zizhi\\_intro1.asp](http://www.cnmuseum.com/intro/zizhi_intro1.asp)

## APPENDIX 5: THE MAP OF CHINA WITH MARKED WEST CHINA

The green part is West China.



## APPENDIX 6: URBANIZATION OF MINORITIES AND HAN

The table below shows the calculations which show that minorities are less urbanized than the Han in China. This table shows the populations of minorities and of the Han by province. The data source is the 2000 Census of The People's Republic of China. The urbanization rates are obtained by dividing the urban population by the provincial population, minority against minority, Han against Han. It is shown that the minorities are less urbanized in all the provinces in West China except Shanxi province, where the minority population is insignificant. All the provinces in West China are italicized and the minority autonomous regions are bolded.

|                        | Urban Population      |                       | Provincial Population |                        | Urbanization       |                    |
|------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
|                        | Minority              | Han                   | Minority              | Han                    | Minority           | Han                |
| Total                  | 24491814              | 434195336             | 104490735             | 1137386112             | 0.23               | 0.38               |
| Beijing                | 489212                | 10033147              | 585381                | 12983696               | 0.84               | 0.77               |
| Tianjin                | 221617                | 6868159               | 266918                | 9581775                | 0.83               | 0.72               |
| Hebei                  | 807365                | 16752688              | 2902669               | 63781603               | 0.28               | 0.26               |
| Shanxi                 | 78645                 | 11353323              | 103018                | 32368083               | 0.76               | 0.35               |
| <i>Inner</i>           |                       |                       |                       |                        |                    |                    |
| <b><i>Mongolia</i></b> | <b><i>1787549</i></b> | <b><i>8171217</i></b> | <b><i>4857633</i></b> | <b><i>18465586</i></b> | <b><i>0.37</i></b> | <b><i>0.44</i></b> |

|                  |                |                 |                 |                 |             |             |
|------------------|----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-------------|-------------|
| Liaoning         | 2485614        | 20480384        | 6718332         | 35105991        | 0.37        | 0.58        |
| Jilin            | 1290232        | 12020289        | 2453212         | 24348815        | 0.53        | 0.49        |
| Heilongjiang     | 761035         | 17910915        | 1772411         | 34465039        | 0.43        | 0.52        |
| Shanghai         | 99666          | 14390033        | 103639          | 16303862        | 0.96        | 0.88        |
| Jiangsu          | 162455         | 30699617        | 258489          | 72783674        | 0.63        | 0.42        |
| Zhejiang         | 148320         | 22206442        | 392049          | 45535266        | 0.38        | 0.49        |
| Anhui            | 220724         | 15545648        | 397712          | 58602112        | 0.55        | 0.27        |
| Fujian           | 198539         | 14107893        | 582822          | 33514147        | 0.34        | 0.42        |
| Jiangxi          | 37756          | 11147241        | 125356          | 40271881        | 0.30        | 0.28        |
| Shandong         | 403137         | 33922712        | 632591          | 89339046        | 0.64        | 0.38        |
| Henan            | 631412         | 20753935        | 1143375         | 90093286        | 0.55        | 0.23        |
| Hubei            | 478160         | 23610842        | 2596839         | 56911968        | 0.18        | 0.41        |
| Hunan            | 1079995        | 16317748        | 6410512         | 56863479        | 0.17        | 0.29        |
| Guangdong        | 774305         | 46655810        | 1266186         | 83955870        | 0.61        | 0.56        |
| <b>Guangxi</b>   | <b>3434811</b> | <b>8915220</b>  | <b>16827705</b> | <b>27024974</b> | <b>0.20</b> | <b>0.33</b> |
| Hainan           | 265576         | 2809017         | 1313521         | 6245329         | 0.20        | 0.45        |
| <i>Chongqing</i> | <i>218312</i>  | <i>9877096</i>  | <i>1973448</i>  | <i>28539156</i> | <i>0.11</i> | <i>0.35</i> |
| <i>Sichuan</i>   | <i>418062</i>  | <i>21892241</i> | <i>4118424</i>  | <i>78229697</i> | <i>0.10</i> | <i>0.28</i> |
| <i>Guizhou</i>   | <i>1985322</i> | <i>6385289</i>  | <i>12625500</i> | <i>21911687</i> | <i>0.16</i> | <i>0.29</i> |

---

|                        |                |                |                 |                |             |             |
|------------------------|----------------|----------------|-----------------|----------------|-------------|-------------|
| <i>Yunnan</i>          | 2063743        | 7837869        | 14151343        | 28201274       | 0.15        | 0.28        |
| <b><i>Tibet</i></b>    | <b>381027</b>  | <b>126069</b>  | <b>2453942</b>  | <b>158570</b>  | <b>0.16</b> | <b>0.80</b> |
| <i>Shannxi</i>         | 146355         | 11222080       | 176385          | 35188651       | 0.83        | 0.32        |
| <i>Gansu</i>           | 376643         | 5641749        | 2199180         | 22925063       | 0.17        | 0.25        |
| <i>Qinghai</i>         | 395102         | 1164349        | 2216888         | 2606050        | 0.18        | 0.45        |
| <b><i>Ningxia</i></b>  | <b>419950</b>  | <b>1360078</b> | <b>1895830</b>  | <b>3590563</b> | <b>0.22</b> | <b>0.38</b> |
| <b><i>Xinjiang</i></b> | <b>2231173</b> | <b>4016236</b> | <b>10969425</b> | <b>7489919</b> | <b>0.20</b> | <b>0.54</b> |



---

## APPENDIX 7: PER PUPIL EXPENDITURE IN URBAN AND RURAL AREAS

The source of these numbers is Yadan Wang (2003). Wang reports that elementary and secondary school students from rural areas account for 75% of the national total. The investment in these rural areas accounts for less than 30% of the national total. Suppose  $X$  = the national total number of elementary and secondary school students, then rural students =  $75\%X$ , the urban students =  $25\%X$ ; suppose the total investment is  $Y$ , investment goes to rural schools is  $30\%Y$ , urban investment =  $70\%Y$ . Per pupil expenditure in rural areas is  $30\%Y : 75\%X$ ; per pupil expenditure in urban areas is  $70\%Y : 25\%X$ . Divide the per pupil expenditure in urban area by that of the rural area, the result is 7. Therefore the ratio between the rural and urban per pupil expenditure is 1 : 7.

## APPENDIX 8: STUDIES IN GROUP I

This table shows which studies are in Group I, in the order of publication time. A basic introduction on the major idea of the studies is also provided. This is the group of practice summaries. The titles will be presented in *pinyin* and followed by the English translation in the brackets. They are all listed chronologically.

| Title   | Author   | Year | Content  |
|---|----------|------|--|
| Wu Lan Xian Menggu Zu<br>Nu Tong Jiao Yu Diao Cha<br>Yan Jiu Bao Gao<br>(Research Report on<br>Mongolian Girl Education in<br>Wulan Mongolian<br>Autonomous County) | Chen, H. | 1994 | This is a summary of what has been done about Mongolian girl education in Wulan county in Qinghai province. The practices were aiming at problems including low school enrollment, high dropout rates, and high repeating rates. The author lists factors affecting minority-girl education in Wulan County. |

---

| Title  | Author  | Year | Content  |
|--|---------|------|--|
| Qinghai Sheng Shao Shu<br>Min Zu Nu Tong Jiao Yu<br>Diao Cha Bao Gao<br>(Research Report on<br>Minority Girl Education in<br>Qinghai Province) | Liu, L. | 1994 | This study reports the status of<br>minority girl education in Qinghai<br>and factors affecting girl education in<br>this province, in the light of what has<br>been done in the field. Current<br>education system is found to be<br>restricting minority-girl education<br>from further development. |

| Title  | Author         | Year        | Content  |
|--|----------------|-------------|--|
| <p>Hualong Hui Zu Zhi Xian<br/>Nu Tong Jiao Yu Diao Cha<br/>Bao Gao<br/>(Research Report On Hui<br/>Girl Education In Hualong<br/>Hui Autonomous County)</p> | <p>Liu, W.</p> | <p>1994</p> | <p>Current problems in Hui-girl education concentrates on low school enrollment, high illiteracy rates, high dropout rates, low completion rates, rural and urban gap. Besides family economic decisions, social cultural forces, early marriage practice, illiterate parents, and weak possibility of career placement after graduation, the author discovers that the present education system has not formed a favorable atmosphere for girls to go to school. It is suggested by the author that laws should be enforced, some preferable policies should also be launched, which are also what is needed in current practice.</p> |

| Title   | Author | Year | Content  |
|---|--------|------|--|
| Menyuan Huizu Zi Zhi Xian<br>Malian Xiang Nu Tong Jiao<br>Yu Diao Cha Bao Gao<br>(Research Report on Girl<br>Education in Malian Xiang<br>in Menyuan Hui Zu<br>Autonomous County) | Ma, W. | 1994 | Problems concerning Hui girl education in Menyuan county are listed. The reasons for having these problems are also analyzed and discussed. This is done in the aim of introducing the reasonability of the current practice in terms of Hui girl education. An introduction of current practices to improve Hui girl education follows. |

| Title  | Author | Year | Content  |
|--|--------|------|--|
| Hu Zhu Tu Zu Zhi Xian Nu<br>Tong Jiao Yu Diao Cha Yan<br>Jiu Bao Gao<br>(Research Report on Tu Girl<br>Education in Huzhu Tu<br>Autonomous County) | Ma, Y. | 1994 | This article lists the practical problems facing minority girls in Huzhu county when it comes to education. It tries to give some reasons for the poor situation of minority-girl education. Then it talks about the current preferable policies over minorities now in practice in China. In the end, some suggestions on further practices are made. |

| Title  | Author                                    | Year        | Content   |
|--|---|-------------|---|
| <p>Zai Gai Ge He Tan Suo<br/>Zhong Fa Zhan Shao Shu<br/>Min Zu Nu Tong Jiao Yu<br/>(Developing Minority Girl<br/>Education in The Process of<br/>Reform And Exploration)</p> | <p>Wang,<br/>Z.<br/>&amp;<br/>Liu, Z.</p> | <p>1994</p> | <p>Current educational practices on minority girls vary with the specific situations of the areas in Qinghai province. In the areas where Tibetan and Mongolians concentrate, some concentration schools and boarding schools are set up to attract minority girls to go to school. in the areas where Hui and Salar concentrate, girl schools and girl classes are set up to help with girl education. Teaching in mother tongues and reforming school curriculum to cater to minority girls' needs also are adopted to help with minority-girl education.</p> |

| Title   | Author                  | Year | Content   |
|---|-------------------------|------|---|
| Xun Hua Sala Zu Zi Zhi<br>Xian Nu Tong Jiao Yu Diao<br>Cha Bao Gao<br>(Research Report on Sala<br>Girl Education in Xunhua<br>Sala Autonomous County) | Wang,<br>Z. &<br>Ma, J. | 1994 | This article discusses the situation of education for Salar girls in Xunhua County. High schools and classes specifically for Salar girls have been established. Salar girls from poverty-stricken areas have also been given vouchers. A more tolerating policy concerning recruiting students from minority groups has also been adopted. |



| Title   | Author                                   | Year        | Content  |
|---|--|-------------|--|
| <p>Tan Tan Qinghai Hui Zu Nu Zi Jiao Yu (On Hui Women/Girl Education in Qinghai)</p>  | <p>Ma, Z.</p>                            | <p>1994</p> | <p>Five girl schools' experiences on how to improve education situation/status for minority girls are discussed in this article. These include preferable admission policy, a total involvement of society, school, and family into improving minority girl education, and some vocational courses set up in these girl schools so it will be easier for the graduates to find jobs.</p> |
| <p>Zhong Guo Xi Bu Nu Tong Jiao Yu De Kun Jing Yu Chu Lu (The Difficulties And Path Out For Girl Education In West China)</p> | <p>Zhou, W., Zhang, T. &amp; Liu, W.</p> | <p>1995</p> | <p>The major problems and factors harmful for minority girl education were discussed; a holistic approach of bettering social, family, and school environments needs to be installed.</p>  |

| Title  | Author               | Year        | Content  |
|--|----------------------|-------------|--|
| <p>Lian He Guo Nu Tong Jiao<br/>Yu Ce Lue Ji Zhong Guo<br/>Min Zu Di Qu Shi Shi Jian<br/>Kuang<br/>(An Strategy For Girl<br/>Education and Its<br/>Application in Minority<br/>Areas in China)</p> | <p>Huang,<br/>M.</p> | <p>1996</p> | <p>This article discusses how the strategy for girl education is applied in minority areas in China. Some suggestions on how to reform the current education system are made.</p>  |
| <p>Zai Gai Ge He Tan Suo<br/>Zhong FA Zhan De Tu Zu<br/>Nu Tong Jiao Yu<br/>(Improving in the Process of<br/>Reform and Exploration:<br/>Tu—Girl Education</p>                                     | <p>Cai, X.</p>       | <p>1996</p> | <p>This article discusses the practical problem of school enrollment in minority-girl education, taking the educational practices on Tu girls in Huzhu Tu Autonomous County in Qinghai province as a case. The author focuses on how this problem is dealt with.</p> |

| Title   | Author  | Year | Content  |
|---|---------|------|--|
| <p>Cong Kun Jing Zhong Jue Qi —Zhong Guo Xi Bu Nu Tong Jiao Yu Yan Jiu Shi Yan</p> <p>(Rise Above The Difficulties—The Research Experiment On Girl Education in West China)</p> | Ren, Yu | 1996 | <p>Current education system needs to be reformed to accommodate minority girls' needs. School curriculum, more investment, laws, informal education, etc. This conclusion is reached after a summary of current practices has been made.</p>   |
| <p>Jie Jue Shao Shu Min Zu Di Qu Un Tong Ru Xue De Shi Jian Yu Tan Suo</p> <p>(Practices and Explorations To Solve The Issue of Minority-Girl Education In Minority Areas)</p>  | Xu, L.  | 1998 | <p>Minority-girl education is considered to be a problem and also a political task by the central government of China, as part of universalizing basic education in minority areas. This is a particular problem in Yunnan province, Funing County. This article is a basic summary of the practices concerning minority-girl education in terms of school enrollment.</p> |

| Title   | Author                         | Year        | Content  |
|---|--------------------------------|-------------|--|
| <p>Pin Kun Di Qu Nu Tong<br/>           Jiao Yu Fa Zhan Mo Shi Tan<br/>           Tao<br/>           (Supporting Girl-Pupils<br/>           Education in Poverty<br/>           Minorities Areas Through<br/>           Privilege And Measures)</p> | <p>Wang,<br/>           Z.</p> | <p>2000</p> | <p>A case study of Qinghai about the development model for girl education in poverty-stricken areas. It focuses on the practices of developing girl education in the areas. Emphasis is attached to teaching in mother tongues and bilingual education, which are found to be helpful in relieving girls' study burden. Reform in school curriculum to accommodate the local ethnic and girl characteristics is desired.</p> |

| Title  | Author              | Year        | Content   |
|--|---------------------|-------------|---|
| <p>Zai Gai Ge He Tan Suo<br/>Zhong FA Zhan Shao Shu<br/>Min Zu Nu Tong Jiao Yu<br/>(Developing Minority Girl<br/>Education in The Process of<br/>Reform And Exploration)</p> | <p>Wang,<br/>Z.</p> | <p>2001</p> | <p>In Tibetan-Mongolian-inhabited pastoral areas in Qinghai, the form of concentration schools or boarding schools has been adopted to attract female children to go to school. In the eastern agricultural regions inhabited by Hui and Salar, there are middle schools or classes especially for female children. Special policies have been adopted to attach importance to education for native language and to reform contents of courses so as to encourage and help female children to start school.</p> |

## APPENDIX 9: STUDIES IN GROUP II

This table shows which studies are in Group I, in the order of publication time. A basic introduction on the major idea of the studies is also provided. This is the group of speculations. The titles will be presented in *pinyin* and followed by the English translation in the brackets. They are all listed chronologically.

| Title  | Author  | Year | Content   |
|--|---------|------|---|
| Gonghe Xian Zang Zu Nu<br>Tong Jiao Yu Diao Cha Bao<br>Gao<br>(Research Report on Tibetan<br>Girl Education in Gonghe<br>Tibetan Autonomous<br>County) | Guo, A. | 1994 | The author first lists the current state of girl education in Gonghe county. Then he gives the reasons for girl education lagging behind. Based on the reasons he talks about, some suggestions are made. |

| Title   | Author      | Year | Content   |
|---|-------------|------|---|
| Guan Yu Hui Zu Sala Zu Nu<br>Zi Zhong xue Xian Zhuang<br>Ji Wen Ti De Diao Cha<br>(Research on the Current<br>Status and Problems of High<br>Schools for Hui and Sala<br>Girls) | Wang,<br>G. | 1994 | This article provides a view of the<br>current state of girl high schools for<br>the Hui and Salar girls in Qinghai.<br>The author and the research team talk<br>about the current situation, analyze<br>the problems, and then made some<br>suggestions. |

| Title   | Author   | Year | Content  |
|---|----------|------|--|
| Ti Gao Min Zu Zheng Ti Su<br>Shi, Bi Xu Qiang Hua Nu Zi<br>Jiao Yu<br>(Female Education Must Be<br>Emphasized to Improve the<br>Overall Quality of the<br>Nation) | Guan, G. | 1994 | This article talks about the significance of minority girl education taking a Qinghai perspective. Contemporary issues and problems in minority girl education are mentioned. The reasons for these problems are explored. By showing such problems regarding minority girl education, the author is hoping to call for emphasis to be attached to development of minority girl education. |



---

| Title  | Author  | Year | Content   |
|--|---------|------|---|
| Hui Zu Nu Xue Sheng Zhi<br>Chu Lu Chu Tan<br>(Preliminary Exploring into<br>the Career Placement for the<br>Hui Female Students) | Duo, T. | 1994 | This article talks about the career placement after graduation for the Hui. The author suggests that Hui girls' special living styles should be accommodated to make the current education system work better for them. |

| Title  | Author  | Year | Content   |
|--|---------|------|---|
| Quan She Hui Dou Yao Gao<br>Du Zhong Shi Nu Tong Jiao<br>Yu<br>(High Level of Importance<br>Should Be Attached to Girl<br>Education) | Liu, W. | 1994 | This article reviews the major problems regarding minority girl education, provides speculations based on the findings on the correlation between fathers' educational attainment, mothers' educational attainment, and parents' attitude toward their kids' getting schooling, and the school enrollment of minority girls. It is found in the provinces of Ningxia, Gansu, and Qinghai that these three pairs of variables are positively correlated with each other. |

| Title   | Author   | Year | Content   |
|---|----------|------|---|
| <p>Min Zu Di Qu Nu Tong<br/>Chuo Xue Wen Ti De Tan<br/>Tao<br/>(Discussions on the Issue of<br/>Girls' Dropout in Minority<br/>Areas)</p>   | Ren, Y.  | 1994 | <p>The author first ascertains that high dropout rate is a problem in minority-girl education. Then he proceeds to provide some possible explanations to the formation of this problem and the reasons. He proposes suggestions on how to deal with this issue in the end.</p>                  |
| <p>Zhong Guo Shao Shu Min<br/>Zu Fu Nu Ji Chu Jiao Yu De<br/>Zhong Dian Wen Ti: Nu<br/>Tong Shi Xue Yu Chuo Xue<br/>(The Key Issue in Basic<br/>Education for Minority<br/>Women in China: Girl<br/>Dropouts)</p> | Fang, S. | 1995 | <p>This article focuses on the practical problem of dropouts in minority-women education in China. The author discusses the factors that affect girl dropouts in minority areas and then suggests some measures through which to improve the current situation of minority-women education.</p> |

| Title  | Author  | Year | Content   |
|--|---------|------|---|
| <p>Xi Bu Shao Shu Min Zu Fu<br/>Nu Jiao Yu Xian Zhuang Ji<br/>Qi Si Kao<br/>(The Current State of<br/>Minority-women Education<br/>in West China and Some<br/>Reflections)</p> | Ren, Y. | 1996 | <p>Personal opinions are provided on<br/>the issue of high illiteracy rate<br/>among minority women in West<br/>China.</p>  |
| <p>Meigu Yi Zu Nu Tong Ru<br/>Xue Nan Zhi Wo Jian (My<br/>Reflections on the Difficulty<br/>for Yi<br/>(Girls to go to School in<br/>Meigu County)</p>                         | Sha, Z. | 1997 | <p>The author gives reasons why Yi<br/>girls in Meigu county in Sichuan<br/>province do not have equal<br/>opportunity to have access to school<br/>out of his own speculations and<br/>personal experiences.</p> |

| Title   | Author                                      | Year        | Content  |
|---|---|-------------|--|
| <p>Shan Qu Yi Zu Nu Tong Ru<br/>Xue Nan Zhi Wo Jian<br/>(My Reflections on the<br/>Difficulty for Yi Girls to go<br/>to School in Meigu County)</p>                           | <p>Suga, L.<br/>&amp;<br/>Moshi,<br/>G.</p> | <p>1998</p> | <p>This study talks about the Yi girl education in Liangshan prefecture, Butuo county in particular. Many factors contribute to the low school enrollment for Yi girls, which is only 13.9%. These factors are given as a product of the author's personal speculations.</p> |
| <p>Qinghai Shao Shu Min Zu<br/>Di Qu Fu Nu Jiao Yu Wen Ti<br/>Tan Xi<br/>(Explorations and Analysis<br/>on Women Education in<br/>Minority Areas in Qinghai<br/>Province)</p> | <p>Ma, L.<br/>&amp; Wang,<br/>Q.</p>        | <p>1998</p> | <p>This article states that type of education, school curriculum and the poor school management all contribute to the weak state of minority-girl education in Qinghai, in addition to the other common problems mentioned by other researchers.</p>                         |

| Title  | Author | Year | Content  |
|--|--------|------|--|
| Qinghai Shao Shu Min Zu<br>Fu Nu Jiao Yu Xian Zhuang<br>Ji Dui Ce Si Kao<br>(Current State of<br>Minority-women Education<br>in Qinghai and Some<br>Reflections) | Ge, Y. | 1998 | It is stated by the author that inequality minority women face in education has great impacts on healthy development of minority women's psychology. The inequality in education also causes inequality in their social status and chance of employment because the level of their educational attainment determines their extent of participation in social life. As a consequence, it also influences the quality of the whole nation. |

| Title   | Author                              | Year        | Content   |
|---|-------------------------------------|-------------|---|
| <p>Liangshan Yi Zu Nu Tong<br/>Jiao Yu Cun Zai De Wen Ti<br/>Ji Dui Ce Jian Yi<br/>(Yi Girls' Education in<br/>Liangshan: Existing<br/>Problems, Possible<br/>Solutions, and<br/>Recommended Actions)</p> | <p>Pan, Z.<br/>&amp; Wu,<br/>M.</p> | <p>1999</p> | <p>The current problems in Liangshan Yi girls' education include: low school enrollment; high mobility (due to dropouts); poor education quality; limited school type and inflexible teaching pedagogy. They provide the reasons for these problems out of their working experiences and personal opinions.</p> |
| <p>Xi Bu Pin Kun Shao Shu<br/>Min Zu Di Qu Nu Tong Jiao<br/>Yu De Fa Zhan<br/>(On the Development of<br/>Education for Minority Girls<br/>in the Povety-stricken Areas<br/>in West China)</p>             | <p>Ma, J.</p>                       | <p>2000</p> | <p>Girl education is the key and difficult point in universalizing basic education in the poverty-stricken areas in West China. Education should serve the sustainable development of girls, especially minority girls.</p>   |

| Title  | Author | Year | Content   |
|--|--------|------|---|
| <p>Zai Lun Xi Bu Pin Kun<br/>Shao Shu Min Zu Di Qu Nu<br/>Tong Jiao Yu De Fa Zhan<br/>(On the Development of<br/>Girl Education in<br/>Poverty-stricken Areas in<br/>West China: II)</p>                                   | Ma, J. | 2000 | <p>The author lists some major achievements in terms of girl education in minority areas in West China. Then describes the major difficulties they face. These issues are logically explored rather than supported by certain data.</p>                                 |
| <p>Mama De Nu Er Yao Du<br/>Shu: Guan Yu Liangshan Yi<br/>Zu Nu Tong Ru Xue Wen Ti<br/>De Bao Gao<br/>(Moms' Daughters Want to<br/>Go to School: Report on the<br/>Situations of Yi Girls'<br/>Schooling in Liangshan)</p> | Wu, M. | 2000 | <p>This article discusses the practical problem of low school enrollment in the issue of minority-girl education, taking Yi girls in Liangshan prefecture as a case. This report is done on the basis of the author's working experiences and his own speculations.</p> |



| Title   | Author        | Year        | Content  |
|---|---------------|-------------|--|
| <p>Dui Xi Bu Min Zu Di Qu Fu<br/>Nu Jiao Yu De Si Kao<br/>(Reflections on<br/>Minority-women Education<br/>in West China)</p> | <p>Ma, Y.</p> | <p>2000</p> | <p>Education for women in West China has influences on economic and social development in the area. The current problems concerning education for women in this area include: minority women have lower educational attainment and higher illiteracy rates; minority women have lower self-expectations; minority girls have lower school enrollment and higher dropout rates; there has been little development in adult education programs for minority women; and the investment into minority education is insufficient.</p> |

| Title  | Author   | Year | Content   |
|--|----------|------|---|
| <p>Tu Zu Nu Tong Yi Wu Jiao<br/>Yu De Xian Zhuang Ji Dui<br/>Ce<br/>(The Current State of<br/>Compulsory Education For<br/>Tu Girls and Reflections)</p>   | Ren, Y.  | 2001 | <p>Discusses the current problems facing Tu girls in terms of compulsory education. Problems include: low school enrollment; high dropout rates; low school-attendance rates; high illiteracy and semi-illiteracy rates.</p>  |
| <p>Guizhou Sheng Bijie Di Qu<br/>Miao Zu Nu Tong Jiao Yu<br/>Fa Zhan De Ruo Gan Si Kao<br/>(Some Reflections on the<br/>Development of Miao-girl<br/>Education in Bijie, Guizhou<br/>Province)</p> | Chen, Z. | 2003 | <p>This study apprehends the importance of the education of girls in Bijie prefecture in the perspective of education for all. The education of girls in Bijie prefecture is the logical requirement of development and the necessary step in the strategy of sustainable and the massive drive of exploiting the west.</p> |

## APPENDIX 10: STUDIES IN GROUP III

This table shows which studies are in Group I, in the order of publication time. A basic introduction on the major idea of the studies is also provided. This is the group of research reports on specific problems. The titles will be presented in *pinyin* and followed by the English translation in the brackets. They are all listed chronologically.

| Title   | Author   | Year | Content  |
|---|----------|------|--|
| Cong Ningxia Kan Fu Nu<br>Zai Min Zu Di Qu Jiao Yu<br>Zhong De Jiao Se<br>(Women's Role in Education<br>in Minority Areas, Ningxia) | Yang, J. | 1994 | The author uses questionnaire and survey, and some statistics from other sources, to explore into the role of women teachers in education in minority areas. |

| Title  | Author  | Year | Content   |
|--|---------|------|---|
| <p>Qinghai Sheng Shao Shu<br/>Min Zu Chu Zhong Sheng<br/>Shu Xue Xue Fa Xing Bie<br/>Cha Yi De Bi Jiao Yan Jiu<br/>(A Comparative Study on<br/>the Gender Difference in<br/>Minority Juniors High<br/>School Students'<br/>Mathematics Learning)</p> | Liu, L. | 1994 | <p>This article is about gender differences in mathematics acquisition. This is a sampled study. It is found that:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. high school students from different ethnic groups do not have significant statistical difference in mathematics learning;</li> <li>2. the ways of learning math does not improve along with the grades. It is somehow negatively correlated with the grades;</li> <li>3. girls' motivation to learn mathematics is greatly influenced by the educational circumstances they are in. therefore it is important to make the society more favorable to girls;</li> <li>4. teaching pedagogy plays an important role in students' achievement in math learning;</li> </ol> |

| Title   | Author                              | Year        | Content  |
|---|-------------------------------------|-------------|--|
| <p>Shao Shu Min Zu Xue<br/>Sheng Jue Ce Si Wei Xing<br/>Bie Cha Yi Yan Jiu<br/>(A Study on Gender<br/>Difference of Minority<br/>Students in<br/>Decision-making)</p> | <p>Sun, R<br/>&amp;<br/>Guo, C.</p> | <p>1994</p> | <p>This article is about the gender differences in decision-making process. It states that the younger the girls and boys are, the better the girls are than the boys. The advantage over the boys at early age gradually becomes a disadvantage over the boys as they grow. This, according to the author, is due to the thought pattern of boys are superior to girls. Girls are in some way educated into their roles of being “inferior” to boys and it doesn't take effect until girls grow older. Therefore, getting rid of the traditional belief that boys are superior to girls will make a very critical influence over the girls' ability in decision-making.</p> |

| Title  | Author                                | Year        | Content   |
|--|---------------------------------------|-------------|---|
| <p>Qinghai Shao Shu Min Zu<br/>Di Qu Nu Jiao Zhi Gong Su<br/>Zhi Xian Zhuang Jian Xi<br/>(A Brief Analysis of the<br/>Current Situation of<br/>Minority Female Teachers in<br/>Qinghai Province)</p> | <p>Zhou, Y.<br/>&amp;<br/>Mao, X.</p> | <p>1994</p> | <p>This article looks into women teachers in minority areas. Issues that are looked at in this study include teacher qualifications, educational attainment, and so on. After analyzing the data, some suggestions on how to improve women teachers' qualities are made. The suggestions include the social support and the individual effort from the women teachers themselves.</p> |

| Title   | Author                        | Year | Content  |
|---|-------------------------------|------|--|
| Zhong Guo Shao Shu Min<br>Zu Fu Nu Wen Hua Su Zhi<br>Fen Xi<br>(Analysis on the<br>Qualifications of Chinese<br>Minority Women) | Zhang,<br>T.<br>&<br>Chen, X. | 1995 | This article mainly talks about illiteracy and literacy rates of minority women, which is used as the symbol of quality in this article. Women's family and social status are partly dependent on their educational level. Therefore, to raise their status in families and society, to get rid of illiteracy among them and improve their general educational attainment should be the right way to go. This study uses graphs to illustrate the research problems. |

| Title   | Author   | Year | Content   |
|---|----------|------|---|
| Shao Shu Min Zu Nu Tong<br>Di Xue Ye Cheng Jiu De<br>Gui Yin Fen Xi Yu Dui Ce<br>(The Analysis of Minority<br>Girls' Low School<br>Achievement and Possible<br>Solutions) | Peng, Y. | 2004 | Minority girls face inequality in educational opportunities all the way along their academic pursuits. They are found to suffer from lower level of school performance. Current education system is not favorable to develop minority girl education. It needs reforming. |



## APPENDIX 11: DETAILED RESULTS

These are the detailed results obtained by applying the criteria. They are in the same order of the tables that show the group articles.

### A11-1: Group I-Introduction

| Author          | Year | Introduction  |
|-----------------|------|---|
| Hengxun<br>Chen | 1994 | <p>The title indicates the focus of this study to be Mongolian-girl education in Wulan County. There is a statement of the problem.</p> <p>This problem is confirmed through a demonstration of figures.</p> <p>Background information on the problem is presented. The educational significance is not discussed well enough. This study aims at the decision makers. Most of the sources are primary.</p> |

| Author    | Year | Introduction  |
|-----------|------|---|
| Lihui Liu | 1994 | <p>The focus of this study is indicated to be minority-girl education in Qinghai province. There is a statement of problem. In this case, there are three major problems to be discussed in this report. They are: low school enrollment, high dropout rate, school attendance rate. These problems are confirmed through data obtained by the author. Background information is presented. The educational significance of the problem is not discussed.</p> |

| Author         | Year | Introduction  |
|----------------|------|---|
| Wencong<br>Liu | 1994 | <p>The title suggests that this report is about the overall status of girl education in Hualong county and the focus turns out to be education for the minority girls and the rural girls. It is stated in the beginning part that recommendations on policies toward minority-girl education are to be made. A summary of current practices on developing education for minority girls is provided in the end. The problems are introduced into four categories: girl school enrollment is low and women have a high illiteracy rate; Hui girls are rarely found in school and the in-school ones are subject to dropout all the time; Hui girls of school age have low school enrollment rate, high dropout rate, fewer could make it to graduate; there is a gap of school enrollment and graduation rate between rural girls and urban girls. By using some statistics obtained from the annual reports done by the local educational bureau, these four problems are well illustrated. Little is about the educational significance of the problems being discussed.</p> |

| Author     | Year | Introduction  |
|------------|------|---|
| Wenwei Ma  | 1994 | <p>The title sets the focus of this study to be girl education in Malian Township (<i>Malian Xiang</i> in Chinese). Background information of this township is given at the beginning. Then the author situates the problem in this township so that background information on the problem is presented and also the problem is confirmed. Educational significance of this problem is not discussed. It looks like this study is aiming at the decision-making agencies.</p>   |
| Yanming Ma | 1994 | <p>The title indicates the focus of the study to be girl education in Huzhu Autonomous County. There is a statement of the problem. The research confirms this is a problem through demonstrating some figures obtained from local education bureaus. It is also explicitly stated that the purpose of this study is to better understand what the problems are facing minority girls in obtaining education in this county. Background information on the problem is presented. Educational significance of this problem is not well discussed. The background of the problem is presented after the research results are presented.</p> |

| Author                             | Year | Introduction  |
|------------------------------------|------|---|
| Zhenling<br>Wang<br>&<br>Zhong Liu | 1994 | This is an article on the successful practices to improve the status of minority-girl education. The title indicates that this is a summary of some effective practice in developing and reforming minority-girl education in minority areas in Qinghai province.   |
| Zhenling<br>Wang<br>&<br>Jincai Ma | 1994 | The title indicates the focus of this study to be girl education in Xunhua Salar Autonomous County. It is presumed that girl education in this county is the same as Salar-girl education in the county without any statistics provided. By demonstrating some graphs and figures as background information, the researchers confirm this is a problem. The audience seems to be the government or the policy-making agencies. The educational significance of the problem is not discussed. Most of the sources are primary. |
| Zhong Ma                           | 1994 | The focus of the study is Hui women education in Qinghai province. The overall status of Hui education, including historical background, current status, school curriculum, student composition, and some school management, is introduced and summarized.  |

| Author  | Year | Introduction  |
|---|------|---|
| Wei Zhou,<br>Tiedao<br>Zhang,<br>&<br>Wenpu Liu | 1995 | <p>The authors focus their study on the experiment on the education of minority girls in West China. But the word “minority” does not appear in the title of their study. The statement of problems is reached after a group of statistics obtained from the national education statistics in 1993 and the 1990 Chinese census is presented at the beginning of the report. The major problems being discussed here are low elementary school enrollment rate of school-aged minority girls, low girl student ratio at the graduating grades in elementary schools, and high percentage of illiterate and semi-illiterate population among minority women.</p> <p>Then the authors use data from the national project entitled “Investigation of Rural Girl’s Education: Problems and Countermeasures” to confirm the problems.</p> |

| Author             | Year | Introduction  |
|--------------------|------|---|
| Mingguang<br>Huang | 1996 | <p>This article is an introduction of how the UN strategy on girl education is carried out in minority areas in China. This focus is well indicated in the title. Some background information on why there is such a strategy on girl education from UN but it is not enough to educate the readers about how serious this problem is or why it is a problem. What the strategy is is not clearly illustrated in this article either.</p> |
| Xiangde Cai        | 1996 | <p>This issue of Tu-girl education is situated in Huzhu county in Qinghai province. This article serves as a guideline for practices in developing Tu-girl education. The research problem is confirmed through a presentation of a set of numbers showing how many schools of different levels are available and how many minority students are enrolled at school.</p>  |

| Author | Year | Introduction   |
|--------|------|--|
| Yu Ren | 1996 | <p>The title does not offer a clear focus of this report. It is later made clear in the article that this is a summary of some policies adopted by Ningxia, Qinghai, and Gansu provincial governments to improve the state of minority-girl education in their provinces. Background information is provided by the author. The research problems are contextualized well enough to make the readers aware that girl education in West China is an issue worth digging into in that it easily gets involved into a vicious cycle of “it is hard to get girls enrolled into schools—the uneducated girls become uneducated mothers—these uneducated mothers remain poor and less informative—they tend to have more kids than educated mothers—it becomes more difficult to enroll girls into school”. The factors affecting girl education are also listed to serve as the rationale behind the policies to be discussed later on.</p> |



---

| Author | Year | Introduction   |
|--------|------|--|
| Lan Xu | 1998 | The problem being investigated is subject to the government policy goals of universalizing nine-year compulsory education and eliminating illiterate rates. No educational significance of the research problem is provided. The author does not offer a literature review either. An introduction of background information is present. |

| Author        | Year | Introduction  |
|---------------|------|---|
| Zhenling Wang | 2000 | <p>The author offers a summary of the measures that have been used in Qinghai province and some suggestions on future actions based on them. This report also serves as a follow-up of Zhenling Liu &amp; Zhong Liu (1994). The title indicates the focus of this study to be an exploration of the measures on developing girl education in poverty-stricken areas. This focus is narrowed down to that of minority-girl education in poor areas in the statement of the problem at the very beginning of the report.</p> <p>Background information of the province is provided to educate the readers about this problem. The existence of this problem is confirmed thereby. A very brief discussion on the educational significance of the problem is presented. Developing minority-girl education is considered to be a political task to a greater extent. Minority-girl education is said to be the key in universalizing basic education in China. China's experience in Qinghai, as Wang proposes, is worth learning. This serves a good reason to make a summary of the practices.</p> |

| Author           | Year | Introduction  |
|------------------|------|---|
| Zhenling<br>Wang | 2001 | <p>This is a summary of what have been done to improve minority-girl education in Qinghai province. This article is very much like the author's co-authored article with Zhong Liu which was published in 1994 and another one in 2000<sup>23</sup> in content, style. The only two distinctions are that this one has an abstract and some more updated statistics are used. This does not necessarily mean that this article is not good. This actually shows that following up is considered important to a certain degree. In addition to this, as an issue of research, minority-girl education is also shown to begin to gain notice.</p> |

<sup>23</sup> Both of these articles are talked about in this appendix. They belong to the same group. Their titles are: "Zai gai ge he tan suo zhong fa zhan shao shu min zu nu tong jiao yu (Developing minority girl education in the process of reform and exploration)" for the 1994 one and "Pin kun di qu nu tong jiao yu fa zhan mo shi tan tao (Supporting girl-pupils education in poverty minorities areas through privilege and measures) for the 2000 one.

## A11-2: Group I-Method

| Author          | Year | Method   |
|-----------------|------|--|
| Hengxun<br>Chen | 1994 | <p>Since this study aims at the decision makers who are thought to attach more importance to the research results, not too much methodology is mentioned here. The characteristics of the population being studied are discussed, but procedures are not presented. It is not clear whether the procedures are logically related to each other or not. Data coding strategies are not described either. Points of reference are missing. Even though most of the sources are primary, some of the research design must have some reference, which is not listed anywhere in the article.</p> |
| Lihui Liu       | 1994 | <p>No particular methodology is specified in this report. But the major characteristics of the minority girls are described. The procedures are not explicitly described. The data coding strategies are not described either. No point of reference is given anywhere in the report.</p>  |

| Author         | Year | Method   |
|----------------|------|--|
| Wencong<br>Liu | 1994 | <p>As what is mentioned, survey is the major methodology employed in this study. However, no detailed description of the methods is available. The size and major characteristics of the population studied are not described. The procedures are not provided anywhere in the study either. There is not a point of reference given when necessary. Therefore, this research is not conducted in a manner of making it replicable to other researchers.</p> |
| Wenwei Ma      | 1994 | <p>There is a preliminary discussion about methodology. The size and major characteristics of the population studied are described. The procedures are not described, not the data coding strategies. No point of reference is given when necessary.</p>   |

| Author                             | Year | Method  |
|------------------------------------|------|---|
| Yanming<br>Ma                      | 1994 | <p>There is a preliminary discussion about methodology available as a separate part in this article. Size of the population studied is described. The main methodology is provided, but not described.</p> <p>The procedures are not provided in enough details to see whether they logically relate to each other. Points of reference are missing when discussing about the research design. Details are also missing.</p>  |
| Zhenling<br>Wang<br>&<br>Zhong Liu | 1994 | <p>No clear procedures of conducting the research indicated. But it can be seen that this summary does not try to generalize one good way to develop minority-girl education. For example, boarding schools are better in nomadic areas, girl classes and girl schools are better in areas where certain minorities densely reside, special preferable policies are needed to help with minority-girl's school enrollment in other areas, etc. Teaching pedagogy, language of instruction, and school curriculum are all suggested to be reformed to better cater to minority girls' needs because they are proven to be helpful.</p> |

| Author                              | Year | Method   |
|-------------------------------------|------|--|
| Zhenling Wang & Jincai Ma           | 1994 | There is no specific part in this article talking about method. The size and major characteristics of the population studied are described and demonstrated with graphs and descriptive statistics. The procedures are not described at all. No data coding strategies are described. A point of reference is missing. The authors do not discuss about the limitations of the method either.  |
| Zhong Ma                            | 1994 | Summarizing the practices to improve Hui-woman education in Qinghai.   |
| Wei Zhou, Tiedao Zhang, & Wenpu Liu | 1995 | The authors provide the size and major characteristics of the population being studied. Questionnaire and interviews are mentioned as the major research methodology. However, no detailed description of the procedures or the content of the questionnaire and interviews are described. A point of reference is also missing when necessary. No clear introduction of methodology is identified in this study, it cannot be clear whether the procedures logically relate to each other or not. |

| Author             | Year | Method  |
|--------------------|------|---|
| Mingguang<br>Huang | 1996 | No specific method of this study is illustrated. But this article follows the line of introducing the current state of girl education in minority areas→introducing the policies adopted by Chinese government to deal with the issue of girl education in minority areas. When introducing these policies, some factors affecting minority-girl education are reflected. And a comparison between what the state of education for minority girl is like before and after the policies are adopted is formed. |
| Xiangde Cai        | 1996 | No specific method of this study is illustrated.  |
| Yu Ren             | 1996 | No specific method is illustrated.  |
| Lan Xu             | 1998 | No specific method is illustrated.  |
| Zhenling<br>Wang   | 2000 | No separate section is dedicated to describing the size and major characteristics of the minority girls in poor areas in the province. This information is offered in different places because this report is about all the minority ethnic groups in poor areas in Qinghai province and the size and characteristics of each group vary. The logic here is very clear and simple: keep with what has been successful and try to make what has been working work better.                                      |



---

| Author           | Year | Method   |
|------------------|------|--|
| Zhenling<br>Wang | 2001 | <p>No separate section is dedicated to describing the size and major characteristics of the minority girls in poor areas in the province.</p> <p>This information is offered in different places because this report is about all the minority ethnic groups in poor areas in Qinghai province and the size and characteristics of each group vary. The logic here is very clear and simple: keep with what has been successful and try to make what has been working work better.</p> |

## A11-3: Group I-Results

| Author          | Year | Results   |
|-----------------|------|---|
| Hengxun<br>Chen | 1994 | <p>The appropriate statistics are presented. Graphs on Mongolian girls' school enrollment, dropout rates, number of school-aged children are all presented in comparison to all girls so that problems can be easily seen to be existing. Based on this, factors affecting Mongolian-girl education in Wulan County are listed. The logic applied is not made explicit enough. But it is enough for the readers to follow. The author tries to draw causation between the factors listed and the research problems in that "causes" instead of "possible factors" are used to explain the current problems of Mongolian-girl education.</p> |
| Lihui Liu       | 1994 | <p>Factors affecting minority-girl education are reached as the causes for the current state of minority-girl education in Qinghai province. This is correlation instead of causation. Things found to be correlated to the current state of minority-girl education include: socio-historical influences; influences from some ethnic customs and religious beliefs; limitations from the weak foundation of economy, cultural development, and education</p>  |

---

| Author | Year | Results  |
|--------|------|--|
|        |      | system in the province; restrictions set by natural, geographical conditions; weakness of government policies and weak political power. Appropriate descriptive statistics are presented. Some inductive logic is specified to a certain degree. The results are generalized to the appropriate group. |

| Author         | Year | Results  |
|----------------|------|--|
| Wencong<br>Liu | 1994 | <p>Research results are presented as descriptive statistics, in the form of introducing the factors affecting minority-girl education in the county of Hualong. They are demonstrated under six different groups: the influences from family SES; the influences from unawareness of the significance of educating girls; the influences from practicing early marriages in the Hui areas; influences from illiterate parents' low expectations toward both education and their children; the influences from the current education system which is not favorable to girls' pursuit in education; the influences from the difficulty to find jobs after their graduation. When discussing each and every of the six groups of factors, the author specify the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results and the results are generalized to the appropriate group.</p> |

| Author                             | Year | Results  |
|------------------------------------|------|--|
| Wenwei Ma                          | 1994 | Appropriate descriptive statistics are not presented. The researcher does not specify the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results. In fact, part III and IV in this article serve as a preliminary discussion about methodology and presentation of results combined. The results are generally generalized to the appropriate group. |
| Yanming<br>Ma                      | 1994 | Appropriate statistics are presented. The researcher does not specify the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results. The results are generalized to the appropriate groups.   |
| Zhenling<br>Wang<br>&<br>Zhong Liu | 1994 | No separate section is dedicated to present the research results. The authors somewhat present these results with descriptive statistics obtained from these educational practices to better illustrate the effectiveness of the programs, which suggests a need to keep with developing minority education.   |

| Author                              | Year | Results  |
|-------------------------------------|------|--|
| Zhenling Wang & Jincai Ma           | 1994 | <p>The author uses the concept of Salar-girl education. But when presenting the descriptive statistics, statistics about all the minority girls in the county are used. The researcher does not specify the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results.</p> <p>The results are generalized to the appropriate group to a great extent.</p>   |
| Zhong Ma                            | 1994 | <p>Presented in descriptive statistics. Vocabulary is not strictly used.</p> <p>Unclear terms such as “most”, “some”, “partly”, etc. are used when more clear terms are preferred.</p>   |
| Wei Zhou, Tiedao Zhang, & Wenpu Liu | 1995 | <p>This study is along the line of introducing the problem and solving the problem. Thereby the results are presented and new practice to improve the current status of minority-girl education in West China is situated and described. A presentation of the descriptive statistics is available. The authors however, do not specify the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results.</p> <p>It is not guaranteed whether the results have been generated for the appropriate group thereby.</p> |

| Author             | Year | Results   |
|--------------------|------|---|
| Mingguang<br>Huang | 1996 | No separate section is dedicated to presenting results. When introducing the policies, the author shows how effective these policies are by demonstrating some statistics, both numbers and descriptive ones. There is a mixed use of minority-girl education and education for girls in minority areas in presenting the statistics. No inductive logic to produce the results is specified. |
| Xiangde Cai        | 1996 | Two major approaches are presented as summary: preferable policies and strengthened research work. The former is there to encourage more minority girls to get enrolled into schools and the latter is there to explore which ways would be better in encouraging them to go to school, stay at school and do well in school.   |

| Author | Year | Results  |
|--------|------|--|
| Yu Ren | 1996 | <p>The policies and some programs are presented as results in this article. Four major approaches are summarized: to establish a more favorable social environment for minority girls in terms of attending schools; to make bigger investments into minority-girl education; to improve quality of education in terms of teacher quality, employing female teachers, reforming school curriculum, helping minority girls to prepare better for school, and flexible school hours; to stick every educational practice to the laws. Some achievements gained through such practices are listed. They include higher minority-girl school enrollment, strengthened communications with international community, a trained research team was established, some research products were published, some model school are established so that more schools could learn from them.</p> |
| Lan Xu | 1998 | <p>A presentation of past experiences is available. There is not a rationale for introducing these experiences thus it is not clear whether these experiences will be reproducible or generalizable.</p>   |



| Author           | Year | Results   |
|------------------|------|---|
| Zhenling<br>Wang | 2000 | <p>The author uses some data to show the success of the measures that have been employed and to illustrate how they have worked.</p> <p>There is a point of reference missing here. It is obvious that not all the sources are primary but there is an absence of pointing out the reference when necessary. However, the results are presented clearly in a descriptive way so that the readers would have a clear idea that certain educational practices work in certain places and may not be as successful at other places.</p> <p>These practices include flexible hours and moving classrooms for minority girls, more relevant school curriculum, involving parents especially mothers into school activities, strengthening female teachers training programs, carrying out bilingual education programs, and so on. The author also mentions the possibility of career placement of minority girl graduates after the curriculum has been tailored to their specific needs.</p> |

---

| Author           | Year | Results  |
|------------------|------|--|
| Zhenling<br>Wang | 2001 | Some data from the year 2000 are used here yet a clear point of referencing is missing. Certain data are used specifically to certain places to make it clear that these educational practices do not have generalizability. |

## A11-4: Group I-Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)

| Author          | Year | Results   |
|-----------------|------|---|
| Hengxun<br>Chen | 1994 | <p>The appropriate statistics are presented. Graphs on Mongolian girls' school enrollment, dropout rates, number of school-aged children are all presented in comparison to all girls so that problems can be easily seen to be existing. Based on this, factors affecting Mongolian-girl education in Wulan County are listed. The logic applied is not made explicit enough. But it is enough for the readers to follow. The author tries to draw causation between the factors listed and the research problems in that "causes" instead of "possible factors" are used to explain the current problems of Mongolian-girl education.</p> |
| Lihui Liu       | 1994 | <p>Factors affecting minority-girl education are reached as the causes for the current state of minority-girl education in Qinghai province. This is correlation instead of causation. Things found to be correlated to the current state of minority-girl education include: socio-historical influences; influences from some ethnic customs and religious beliefs; limitations from the weak foundation of economy, cultural development, and education</p>  |

---

| Author | Year | Results  |
|--------|------|--|
|        |      | system in the province; restrictions set by natural, geographical conditions; weakness of government policies and weak political power. Appropriate descriptive statistics are presented. Some inductive logic is specified to a certain degree. The results are generalized to the appropriate group. |

| Author         | Year | Results  |
|----------------|------|--|
| Wencong<br>Liu | 1994 | <p>Research results are presented as descriptive statistics, in the form of introducing the factors affecting minority-girl education in the county of Hualong. They are demonstrated under six different groups: the influences from family SES; the influences from unawareness of the significance of educating girls; the influences from practicing early marriages in the Hui areas; influences from illiterate parents' low expectations toward both education and their children; the influences from the current education system which is not favorable to girls' pursuit in education; the influences from the difficulty to find jobs after their graduation. When discussing each and every of the six groups of factors, the author specify the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results and the results are generalized to the appropriate group.</p> |

| Author                             | Year | Results  |
|------------------------------------|------|--|
| Wenwei Ma                          | 1994 | Appropriate descriptive statistics are not presented. The researcher does not specify the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results. In fact, part III and IV in this article serve as a preliminary discussion about methodology and presentation of results combined. The results are generally generalized to the appropriate group. |
| Yanming<br>Ma                      | 1994 | Appropriate statistics are presented. The researcher does not specify the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results. The results are generalized to the appropriate groups.   |
| Zhenling<br>Wang<br>&<br>Zhong Liu | 1994 | No separate section is dedicated to present the research results. The authors somewhat present these results with descriptive statistics obtained from these educational practices to better illustrate the effectiveness of the programs, which suggests a need to keep with developing minority education.   |

| Author                              | Year | Results  |
|-------------------------------------|------|--|
| Zhenling Wang & Jincai Ma           | 1994 | <p>The author uses the concept of Salar-girl education. But when presenting the descriptive statistics, statistics about all the minority girls in the county are used. The researcher does not specify the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results.</p> <p>The results are generalized to the appropriate group to a great extent.</p>   |
| Zhong Ma                            | 1994 | <p>Presented in descriptive statistics. Vocabulary is not strictly used.</p> <p>Unclear terms such as “most”, “some”, “partly”, etc. are used when more clear terms are preferred.</p>   |
| Wei Zhou, Tiedao Zhang, & Wenpu Liu | 1995 | <p>This study is along the line of introducing the problem and solving the problem. Thereby the results are presented and new practice to improve the current status of minority-girl education in West China is situated and described. A presentation of the descriptive statistics is available. The authors however, do not specify the inductive logic applied to the data to produce results.</p> <p>It is not guaranteed whether the results have been generated for the appropriate group thereby.</p> |

| Author             | Year | Results   |
|--------------------|------|---|
| Mingguang<br>Huang | 1996 | No separate section is dedicated to presenting results. When introducing the policies, the author shows how effective these policies are by demonstrating some statistics, both numbers and descriptive ones. There is a mixed use of minority-girl education and education for girls in minority areas in presenting the statistics. No inductive logic to produce the results is specified. |
| Xiangde Cai        | 1996 | Two major approaches are presented as summary: preferable policies and strengthened research work. The former is there to encourage more minority girls to get enrolled into schools and the latter is there to explore which ways would be better in encouraging them to go to school, stay at school and do well in school.   |



| Author | Year | Results  |
|--------|------|--|
| Yu Ren | 1996 | <p>The policies and some programs are presented as results in this article. Four major approaches are summarized: to establish a more favorable social environment for minority girls in terms of attending schools; to make bigger investments into minority-girl education; to improve quality of education in terms of teacher quality, employing female teachers, reforming school curriculum, helping minority girls to prepare better for school, and flexible school hours; to stick every educational practice to the laws. Some achievements gained through such practices are listed. They include higher minority-girl school enrollment, strengthened communications with international community, a trained research team was established, some research products were published, some model school are established so that more schools could learn from them.</p> |
| Lan Xu | 1998 | <p>A presentation of past experiences is available. There is not a rationale for introducing these experiences thus it is not clear whether these experiences will be reproducible or generalizable.</p>   |

| Author           | Year | Results   |
|------------------|------|---|
| Zhenling<br>Wang | 2000 | <p>The author uses some data to show the success of the measures that have been employed and to illustrate how they have worked.</p> <p>There is a point of reference missing here. It is obvious that not all the sources are primary but there is an absence of pointing out the reference when necessary. However, the results are presented clearly in a descriptive way so that the readers would have a clear idea that certain educational practices work in certain places and may not be as successful at other places.</p> <p>These practices include flexible hours and moving classrooms for minority girls, more relevant school curriculum, involving parents especially mothers into school activities, strengthening female teachers training programs, carrying out bilingual education programs, and so on. The author also mentions the possibility of career placement of minority girl graduates after the curriculum has been tailored to their specific needs.</p> |

---

| Author           | Year | Results  |
|------------------|------|--|
| Zhenling<br>Wang | 2001 | Some data from the year 2000 are used here yet a clear point of referencing is missing. Certain data are used specifically to certain places to make it clear that these educational practices do not have generalizability. |

## A11-5: Group I-Abstract or Summary

| Author                             | Year | Abstract or Summary                        |
|------------------------------------|------|--|
| Hengxun<br>Chen                    | 1994 | No separate abstract or summary presented. |
| Lihui Liu                          | 1994 | No separate abstract or summary presented. |
| Wencong<br>Liu                     | 1994 | No separate abstract or summary presented. |
| Wenwei Ma                          | 1994 | No separate abstract or summary presented. |
| Yanming<br>Ma                      | 1994 | No separate abstract or summary presented. |
| Zhenling<br>Wang<br>&<br>Zhong Liu | 1994 | No separate abstract or summary presented. |
| Zhenling<br>Wang<br>&<br>Jincai Ma | 1994 | No separate abstract or summary presented. |
| Zhong Ma                           | 1994 | No separate abstract or summary presented. |

| Author  | Year | Abstract or Summary  |
|---|------|--|
| Wei Zhou,<br>Tiedao<br>Zhang,<br>&<br>Wenpu Liu | 1995 | No separate abstract or summary presented.   |
| Mingguang<br>Huang                              | 1996 | No separate abstract or summary presented.   |
| Xiangde Cai                                     | 1996 | No separate abstract or summary presented.   |
| Yu Ren  | 1996 | No separate abstract or summary presented.   |
| Lan Xu  | 1998 | No separate abstract or summary presented.   |
| Zhenling<br>Wang                                | 2000 | The problem is restated in the abstract. The conclusions are restated as well. An abstract in English is also provided.  |
| Zhenling<br>Wang                                | 2001 | The focus of the study is restated in the abstract. Neither the conclusions nor the procedures are restated in the abstract. An English version of the abstract is provided. |

## A11-6: Group II-Introduction

| Author        | Year | Introduction   |
|---------------|------|--|
| Aiting<br>Guo | 1994 | <p>The focus of this study is well indicated in the title: Tibetan-girl education in Gonghe county. It does have a particular focus: school enrollment. This cannot be seen from the topic of the study. The author is proposing to state what the current status of Tibetan-girl education in terms of school enrollment is like, to analyze what the reasons are that lead to this problem, and based on that, some suggestions on policies are made. Suggestions made according to the analyzed factors affecting Tibetan-girl education should be valid. Background information on the problem is presented very briefly. Educational significance of this study is restricted to fulfilling goals set by government policies of universalizing nine-year compulsory education and that it is “not favorable” to the national development. There is not a literature review.</p> |

| Author            | Year | Introduction   |
|-------------------|------|--|
| Guangya<br>o Wang | 1994 | <p>From what is indicated in the title, this study is dedicated to school management of Hui and Salar girl high schools. The problem can be investigated through the way the author is proposing. The researcher tries to identify the current problems in girl-school management and then proposes to solve them. Background information on this problem is provided so that the readers have an idea that this problem is worth researching. Educational significance of this problem is well demonstrated in the introduction. An accurate point of reference is missing so it is hard to tell what sources the researcher mainly is using. There is not a literature review.</p> |

| Author         | Year | Introduction  |
|----------------|------|---|
| Guixia<br>Guan | 1994 | <p>There is a statement of problems to be discussed in this study. The problem indicates a particular focus of study: to improve the overall quality of population, women education must be strengthened. The problem can be investigated through the way the author is proposing. Background information on the problem is presented. The educational significance of the problem should be discussed. It is missing. A literature review is preferred to educate the reader about the problem. But the author does not provide a literature review. The provision of background information still does the job to educate the reader about the problem. Points of reference are missing although there is a reference list at the very end of this study.</p> |



| Author        | Year | Introduction  |
|---------------|------|---|
| Tianyu<br>Duo | 1994 | <p>The focus of this study is shown to be career placement of Hui girls after they graduate from high schools. The author is proposing some explorative ideas on how to make the post-school plans work better for Hui-girl students. Background information on this problem of career placement is provided. Educational significance of this problem is also illustrated. Many Hui girls do not get the chance to go to school because their parents do not see their chance of working after they graduate from high school if they cannot pass the college entrance examinations. This is going to help with Hui girls' school enrollment indirectly. There is not a literature review.</p> |
| Wenpu<br>Liu  | 1994 | <p>This article does not have subtitles. The focus indicated in the title is the educational significance of girl education. It is not clear that the focus is actually that of minority-girl education until background information on this problem is presented. Some figures are used to confirm that this is a problem worth researching. There is not a literature review.</p>   |

---

| Author       | Year | Introduction   |
|--------------|------|--|
| Yugui<br>Ren | 1994 | <p>The focus of this study is the issue of dropouts among girls in minority areas. The concepts of girls in minority areas and minority girls are equally treated in this article. The statement of problem is available. Background information on the problem is presented in details enough to educate the readers about the problem. There is not a literature review.</p> |

| Author        | Year | Introduction   |
|---------------|------|--|
| Sumei<br>Fang | 1995 | <p>The title indicates that the focus of this study is the issue of dropouts in minority-girl education. This is a particular focus of study. The author confirms that high girl dropouts will be the difficult point in universalizing nine-year compulsory education by briefly using the sentence “lots of materials show that...”. Then background information on this problem is given, including the current status of minority-girl education in some places and current policies that are being employed. Some successful experiences are discussed. Based on this, the author proposes her own reflections on how to help with the situation of high minority-girl dropouts. This problem can be investigated through the way the author is proposing. Educational significance of the problem is mentioned along the line of universalizing nine-year compulsory education.</p> <p>There is not a literature review.</p> |

| Author                          | Year | Introduction  |
|---------------------------------|------|---|
| Yugui<br>Ren                    | 1996 | There is a statement of problems: minority women have very high illiteracy rates. The title does not indicate a specific focus of study until background information on this problem is given. Little is about educational significance of the problem. No literature review is available. Instead, the author uses some numerical statistics obtained by other researchers to educate the readers about the problem. |
| Zhengron<br>g Sha               | 1997 | The title of this study indicates very clearly what the focus of this study is going to be: Yi-girl school enrollment in Meigu County. Background information on the problem is presented. There is not a literature review.  |
| Laqu<br>Suga &<br>Guri<br>Moshi | 1998 | The focus of this study is indicated to be low school enrollment of the Yi girls in the mountainous areas. Background information is not presented to a sufficient degree. The problems are not confirmed before the results are presented. There is not a literature review.   |

| Author                            | Year | Introduction   |
|-----------------------------------|------|--|
| Lijun Ma<br>&<br>Qingfeng<br>Wang | 1998 | <p>The title indicates that the focus of the study is going to be women education in minority areas in Qinghai Province. This report is an analysis. The authors provide statements of problems first. Then they confirm the problems by giving enough background information. It is not their point that every minority ethnic group has the same level of low education development. It varies with different groups. The authors then offer their analysis on the factors affecting minority-women education. Yet, they use the word “causes” instead of “related factors”. No discussion on educational significance is available. There is not a literature review.</p> |

| Author       | Year | Introduction  |
|--------------|------|---|
| Yuqing<br>Ge | 1998 | <p>A statement of problems is provided after some background information on the problems is given. The particular focus is indicated in the title: reflections on minority-girl education in Qinghai province. The researcher does not try to solve the problems mentioned. Instead, some proposals on how to solve the problems are made based on the author's reflections. A literature review is not available as a separate part. However, the readers can be well educated about the problem by what is presented. The author follows the line of presenting the problem → figuring out the impact of not doing anything to deal with minority-girl education → some reflections on what to do to deal with the issue of minority-girl education. In illustrating what the impact will be, the educational significance of the problem is discussed.</p> |

| Author                              | Year | Introduction   |
|-------------------------------------|------|--|
| Zhengyun<br>Pan &<br>Mingxian<br>Wu | 1999 | <p>There is a statement of the problems. The researchers confirm that these are problems by presenting some numerical statistics obtained from the local education bureau. The focus of the study is well indicated in the title to be Yi-girl education in Liangshan. The major thing the researchers are going to focus on includes Yi-girls' low school enrollment, high flow rates, poor education quality, and inflexible pedagogy. They will offer what they think should be the reasons for such problems and their suggestions on how to deal with them. As far as a reflection style article is concerned, what the researchers are doing here should be enough to investigate into the problem. They are only proposing some possibility to solve the problems they stated. No literature is provided. The problems are well educated into the readers because there is a comprehensive introduction of background information on the problems. Most of the sources used here in the article are primary. The educational significance is discussed, but not to a sufficient degree. The researchers are being conclusive on this issue while more data should be presented to demonstrate the significance.</p> |

| Author         | Year        | Introduction   |
|----------------|-------------|--|
| Jinling<br>Ma  | 2000<br>(a) | <p>There is a problem statement in the article. Focus of this study is well indicated in the title: girl education in minority areas in West China. Since this is a reflection, the researcher provides logic and proposes on how to solve the problems. The problems can be investigated through the way the researcher proposes.</p>   |
| Jinling<br>Ma  | 2000<br>(b) | <p>There is a problem statement available in this article. The topic indicates a particular focus of study on girl education in minority areas in West China. From the title, it can also be seen that this study is a follow-up to the same author's an earlier article the same year.</p>  |
| Mingxian<br>Wu | 2000        | <p>The topic indicates a particular focus of the study: Yi-girl's low school enrollment in Liangshan Prefecture. There is a statement of problems but the statement is not clearly explained in enough details, i.e. the provision of background information on this problem is not sufficient to educate the readers about the problem. The educational significance of this problem is not well illustrated. There is not a literature review.</p> |



| Author    | Year | Introduction   |
|-----------|------|--|
| Yan Ma    | 2000 | <p>The title indicates a focus of the study: reflections on women education in minority areas in West China. To investigate the problem, what the author proposes to do is not sufficient in that a connection between results and conclusions is not well established.</p> <p>Background information is provided so that the readers are educated about the problem. There is not a literature review.</p>  |
| Yugui Ren | 2001 | <p>It is indicated in the title that Tu-girl education is what is going to be discussed in the study. But this article does not really offer a focus to be the summary of educational practices on Tu-girl education until it was self-clear later in the article. The current problems are listed first and current approaches to deal with these issues are discussed and the author makes recommendations on future actions. It is set in the context of universalizing basic education that the question of Tu-girl education is talked about. Tu girls' low school enrollment, high dropout rates, low school attendance, and high illiteracy and semi-illiteracy rates are considered as the current problems.</p> |

| Author         | Year | Introduction   |
|----------------|------|--|
| Zhongyong Chen | 2003 | <p>This title indicates the focus to be Miao-girl education in Bijie Prefecture, Guizhou Province. There is a statement of the problems. Background information of Miao in Bijie is provided. Background information on the problem is also presented. The author tries to approach to this problem through discussing the significance of Miao-girl education, discussing the rights of Miao girls, and discussing the good timing of developing Miao-girl education now. This serves as the literature review of the study, except it is not under a separate subtitle. It educates the reader about the problem in terms of the current state and the educational significance.</p> |

## A11-7: Group II-Method

| Author            | Year | Method  |
|-------------------|------|---|
| Aiting<br>Guo     | 1994 | No part is dedicated to methodology at all. Some statistics are presented without points of reference given.  |
| Guangya<br>o Wang | 1994 | No part is dedicated to methodology at all. Some statistics are presented without points of reference given.  |
| Guixia<br>Guan    | 1994 | The size and major characteristics of the population studied are described. It is not specified how the figures have been obtained. So it is not easy to tell whether these procedures are logically related to each other or not. Therefore, it cannot be told whether the data bolection strategies are used appropriately. Points of reference are missing in this part. |
| Tianyu<br>Duo     | 1994 | No clear methodology is presented. This author goes directly to proposing ways to deal with career placement for Hui girl high school graduates.  |
| Wenpu<br>Liu      | 1994 | No clear methodology is presented. Since the data used to confirm the research problem in the article are obtained from some sources not mentioned, data collection strategies cannot be judged here.   |

| Author            | Year | Method   |
|-------------------|------|--|
| Yugui<br>Ren      | 1994 | No part is dedicated to methodology at all. Some statistics are presented without points of reference given. The author provides an analysis on the reasons for high dropout rates among minority girls based on his own working experience.   |
| Sumei<br>Fang     | 1995 | No part is dedicated to methodology at all. Some statistics are presented without points of reference given. A statement of the problem, a presentation of the current status of the problem, and a brief discussion on which current practices are successful serve as the basis for the author's personal reflections. This is what is shown to be data collection and coding strategies. Basic logic applies in this process so the strategies are basically appropriate. |
| Yugui<br>Ren      | 1996 | No clear methodology, i.e. data collection and coding strategies, is presented. Some data from other research activities are used without giving reference points.   |
| Zhengron<br>g Sha | 1997 | No part is dedicated to methodology at all. Some statistics are presented without points of reference given.   |

| Author                            | Year | Method   |
|-----------------------------------|------|--|
| Laqu<br>Suga &<br>Guri<br>Moshi   | 1998 | No part is dedicated to methodology at all. Some statistics are presented without points of reference given.   |
| Lijun Ma<br>&<br>Qingfeng<br>Wang | 1998 | No clear methodology is presented. It cannot be made sure what data collection and coding strategies are used.   |
| Yuqing<br>Ge                      | 1998 | The size and characteristics of the population studied are described.<br><br>No clear methodology is presented. The procedures, identified as proposing the problem → analyzing the problem → solving the problem, are logically related to each other. The problem is not really solved. it is proposed to be solved in the author's ways in the end. |

| Author                              | Year        | Method   |
|-------------------------------------|-------------|--|
| Zhengyun<br>Pan &<br>Mingxian<br>Wu | 1999        | <p>The researchers use their analytical skills to carry out this study.</p> <p>They use primary sources to give a critique on the current state of Yi-girl education in Liangshan. The size and characteristics of the population being studied are described well enough for the readers to see that the problems they are proposing are real problems. No methodology on how the data used to base the analysis on is described. The procedures are not described at all. Methodology is not implied anywhere.</p> |
| Jinling<br>Ma                       | 2000<br>(a) | <p>The size and major characteristics of the population studied are described. Procedures, as what is seen in the flow of the article, follow one another in a logical order. The data collection strategies are not part of this article's concern. But the presentation of the data collection is used appropriately, given the purpose of the study. The limitation of this study might not lie in the methodology. It might be the focus of the study.</p>   |
| Jinling<br>Ma                       | 2000<br>(b) | <p>There is no methodology procedures made clear in this article. They flow in the article with a logic. No data collection strategies specified.</p>  |

| Author         | Year | Method  |
|----------------|------|---|
| Mingxian<br>Wu | 2000 | No part is dedicated to methodology at all. Some statistics are presented without points of reference given.  |
| Yan Ma         | 2000 | The size of the population being studied is not provided. The major characteristics of the population are described. Procedures are not explicitly described in a separate part of methodology. But they are reflected as the article unfolds. A brief discussion on the current problems in minority-women education is provided. Some factors affecting minority-women education are listed when discussing about these problem. After this, the researcher provides some reflections on how to deal with these problems. |
| Yugui<br>Ren   | 2001 | No methodology of this study itself is presented.   |

| Author         | Year | Method  |
|----------------|------|---|
| Zhongyong Chen | 2003 | <p>The major characteristics of the Miao girls in Bijie, Guizhou are described. No methodology is provided as a separate part. The flow of the author's logic follows the order of: stating the problem → analyzing the problem → recommending on how to solve the problem. The data in this article are used appropriately according to the purpose. But no specific strategies are illustrated on how the data are collected.</p> |



## A11-8: Group II-Results

| Author            | Year | Results   |
|-------------------|------|---|
| Aiting<br>Guo     | 1994 | <p>A presentation of descriptive results is offered to identify the reasons why Tibetan girls suffer from low school enrollment rates. Statistics presented are not specifically illustrated as about Tibetan girls. It cannot be made sure whether results are generalized to the appropriate group or not.</p>  |
| Guangya<br>o Wang | 1994 | <p>The author goes directly to presenting the results without providing enough procedures on how these results have been obtained. Results are generalized to the appropriate group.</p>  |
| Guixia<br>Guan    | 1994 | <p>According to the focus of this study, appropriate descriptive statistics are presented. The logic used to produce results are made clear in the part where factors affecting minority-girl education are listed. The results are generalized to the appropriate group. The terms for the results are subject to discussion. Causation instead of correlation is being used to present the results.</p> |

| Author        | Year | Results  |
|---------------|------|--|
| Tianyu<br>Duo | 1994 | <p>Appropriate descriptive statistics are presented. The logic applied to produce the results is made explicit through identifying the three major problems restricting Hui girls' career placement after they graduate from high schools. The first thing listed here is political will to reform the idea of competing graduation rates among schools and considering graduating and entering into schools of higher levels to be the only way for Hui girls. Secondly, local education management personnel should be aware of the difference between minorities and the Han in terms of education. Thirdly, educational goals of schools and school curriculum should be reformed to prepare the Hui girls better with their different needs to either go on to schools of higher levels or go back and be "independent" in their communities.</p> |

---

| Author       | Year | Results  |
|--------------|------|--|
| Wenpu<br>Liu | 1994 | <p>To have a better look into what makes it harder for minority girls to obtain education the author uses the statistics obtained from survey conducted by some researchers not mentioned here. A necessary point of reference is needed here. The results in this article are showing some factors from family perspective that affects minority girls' chances of going to school. Fathers' educational attainment level, mothers' educational attainment level, parents' attitudes toward education are all shown to be correlated to less opportunity for minority girls when it comes to education.</p> |

| Author        | Year | Results   |
|---------------|------|---|
| Yugui<br>Ren  | 1994 | <p>The author uses personal experiences and inductive skills, trying to identify the reasons that affect girls in minority areas to drop out from school. His possible explanation includes those from cultural and social values and those from inside the educational system.</p> <p>Cultural and social values not favoring to girl's education include: preference of boys to girls; religious taboos; practice of early marriages; poor families; the common idea among many parents that knowledge is not worthwhile learning in that how much one's income is cannot be determined by how much knowledge one has.</p> <p>Those from inside the school system include: the school availability is not equitably spread; low quality of school facilities; lack of female teachers; the irrelevant purpose of education; chance of career placement. The inductive logic applied to produce such results is made clear and the results are generalized to the appropriate group.</p> |
| Sumei<br>Fang | 1995 | <p>Since this is about all the minorities, a description of major characteristics of all of the minorities is not quite probable. Examples found in different minority ethnic groups are used to</p>  |

| Author                            | Year | Results   |
|-----------------------------------|------|---|
|                                   |      | describe what the problem being dealt with is like. The inductive logic applied to produce results is not made explicit. But the results are generalized to the appropriate group: the minorities.  |
| Yugui<br>Ren                      | 1996 | There is no part specifically dedicated to results.   |
| Zhengron<br>g Sha                 | 1997 | The descriptive statistics are presented. No inductive logic applied to produce the results is made clear. Whether the results are generalized to the appropriate group or not is subject to more examination which is not possible to carry out based on the information from this article only. |
| Laqu<br>Suga &<br>Guri<br>Moshi   | 1998 | The descriptive statistics are presented. Some inductive logic is applied to produce the results. The results are generalized to the appropriate group according to the logic presented together with the results.  |
| Lijun Ma<br>&<br>Qingfeng<br>Wang | 1998 | The part about the “reasons” to the underdevelopment of minority-women education can be viewed as results. Not much statistics is presented. The inductive logic used to produce results is made clear. The results are generalized to the appropriate group.                                     |

| Author                              | Year        | Results  |
|-------------------------------------|-------------|--|
| Yuqing<br>Ge                        | 1998        | The researcher tries to present the results in the way of introducing the impacts might happen if this problem is not dealt with. This is showing some educational significance of this problem. The level of minority women's quality determines their capability and status in social economic activities. These descriptive statistics are appropriate to the group. The inductive logic used to produce the results are made explicit along the way. |
| Zhengyun<br>Pan &<br>Mingxian<br>Wu | 1999        | Appropriate descriptive statistics are presented. The inductive logic used to produce results are made explicit in the presentation of results, which are generalized to the appropriate group too.  |
| Jinling<br>Ma                       | 2000<br>(a) | The results are divided into two parts, one about successful experiences and one about some obstacles in developing minority-girl education. The appropriate results are presented. The results are generalized to the appropriate group.  |

| Author         | Year        | Results   |
|----------------|-------------|---|
| Jinling<br>Ma  | 2000<br>(b) | Research results are divided into two parts, one about successful experiences and one about some obstacles to in developing minority-girl education. This article follows the same style of the same author's earlier one (2000 a). |
| Mingxian<br>Wu | 2000        | The descriptive statistics are presented. No inductive logic applied to produce the results is made clear. Whether the results are generalized to the appropriate group or not is subject to more examination.                      |
| Yan Ma         | 2000        | Results are presented in the discussion about the current problems of minority-women education. Appropriate descriptive statistics are presented. But the inductive logic used to produce results is not made explicit.             |
| Yugui<br>Ren   | 2001        | Descriptive statistics of the achievements gained through some current educational practices are presented as results. This shows the possibility to deal with the issue of minority-girl education well enough.                    |

---

| Author         | Year | Results   |
|----------------|------|---|
| Zhongyong Chen | 2003 | Appropriate results are presented in the article to show that the problems are worth dealing with and should be taken care of. The logic applied to produce results is made explicit. Data collection strategies are not explicit but reflected in the presentation of the results. It is reflected that lots of literature is reviewed here. |



## A11-9: Group II-Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)

| Author            | Year | Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)  |
|-------------------|------|--|
| Aiting<br>Guo     | 1994 | <p>Not each result is discussed in terms of either its agreement or disagreement with results obtained by other researchers in other studies. The generalizations are not all consistent with results in that they are presented to Tibetan girls only while the results obtained earlier are for the minority areas. Practical implications of the findings are discussed in the form of suggestions on future policies.</p>  |
| Guangya<br>o Wang | 1994 | <p>The current problems of girl-school management are related to student sources, education quality, insufficient investment, management, no guidance from research, and so on. The researcher provides some theoretical and practical implications of these findings. Generalizations are consistent with the results. However, the results are not discussed in terms of its agreement or disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies.</p> |

| Author         | Year | Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)  |
|----------------|------|--|
| Guixia<br>Guan | 1994 | Discussion is presented as suggestions. This part does not provide logical connections for the relationship between the research problems and results. It looks like it is starting a new discussion disregard of what has been discussed and presented previously in the report. Generalizations are not really consistent with the results.  |
| Tianyu<br>Duo  | 1994 | Generalizations are consistent with the results. Theoretical and practical implications of the results are both discussed in the form of recommendations on future action.   |
| Wenpu<br>Liu   | 1994 | <p>The author provides numerical statistics to show the correlation between parents' educational attainment levels, parents' attitudes toward education and minority girls' chances to obtain education.</p> <p>These results are discussed in terms of agreement and disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies.</p> <p>After this discussion, some theoretical implications of these findings are presented. By doing so, it is hoped by the author that minority-girl education would gain the appropriate status that it is supposed to have.</p> |

| Author        | Year | Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)   |
|---------------|------|---|
| Yugui<br>Ren  | 1994 | Not each result is discussed in terms of either its agreement or disagreement with results obtained by other researchers in other studies. The author proposes reasons from both outside the education system and inside the system, yet only suggestions on education system reform are made. Thus there is an inconsistency between generalizations and results.  |
| Sumei<br>Fang | 1995 | The logical reasons for the relationship between the problems and the results are not provided in this part. The result is discussed in terms of its agreement with results obtained from experiences and practices, but not with results obtained by other researchers in other studies. The generalizations are consistent with the results in that each piece of the researcher's suggestion is made into certain part of the results presented previously in the article. At the same time, theoretical and practical implications of the findings are discussed in the suggestions on future action. |

| Author            | Year | Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)  |
|-------------------|------|--|
| Yugui<br>Ren      | 1996 | <p>The author goes directly from listing the problems to solving them.</p> <p>There is no part specifically dedicated to results. Therefore, the discussion does not provide logical reasons for the relationship between research problems and results. Also, results are not discussed in terms of agreement or disagreement with results obtained by other researchers in other previous studies. Third, generalizations are made without results. The author takes personal reflections as recommendations for future action and theoretical and practical implications of the findings discussed.</p> |
| Zhengron<br>g Sha | 1997 | <p>All the recommendations made by the author on future action are concerned with political will, from policies to coordination among government agencies, from government's awareness of the problem to the willingness to deal with it positively. Not all the generalizations here are consistent with the results.</p>   |

| Author                            | Year | Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)   |
|-----------------------------------|------|---|
| Laqu<br>Suga &<br>Guri<br>Moshi   | 1998 | <p>In addition to what Sha (1997) and Wu (2000) suggest, the author also suggests a social reform in terms of superstition practices and early marriage. It is suggested by the author that all the interest groups concerned with minority-girl education should get involved into developing it. Not all generalizations are consistent with the results. This study talks about low parental expectations toward the minority girls but no suggestions on this point is given in the end of the article.</p> |
| Lijun Ma<br>&<br>Qingfeng<br>Wang | 1998 | <p>Logical reasons are reflected in the recommendations on future action. Every piece of recommendation made in the last part has a relationship with what was listed as results in the previous part.</p> <p>Yet, results are not discussed in terms of agreement or disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies. Generalizations are consistent with the results.</p> <p>Theoretical and practical implications of the findings are not discussed.</p>                  |

| Author                              | Year | Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)  |
|-------------------------------------|------|--|
| Yuqing<br>Ge                        | 1998 | Some recommendations on future action are made. The author is for the idea of having not only formal education, but also informal education. Literacy programs should be developed and women education should be greatly improved.   |
| Zhengyun<br>Pan &<br>Mingxian<br>Wu | 1999 | The discussion provides logical reasons for the relationship between the research problems and results. Since most of the sources are primary or hard to tell whether it is primary or not, a literature review is hardly established in this article. But theoretical and practical implications of the findings are discussed. The generalizations, in this case are the suggestions made on future actions and policies, are consistent with the results reached earlier in this article. |

| Author         | Year        | Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)   |
|----------------|-------------|---|
| Jinling<br>Ma  | 2000<br>(a) | <p>This part provides logical reasons for the relationship between problems and results. The results are not discussed in terms of its agreement or disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies although many of the results are the same to each other. Generalizations are consistent with the results. Recommendations for future action are made. They are based on the results presented previously.</p> |
| Jinling<br>Ma  | 2000<br>(b) | <p>The discussion provides logical reasons for the relationship between the research problems and results. The results obtained by the author are not discussed in terms of agreement, or disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies. Generalizations are consistent with the results. Recommendations for possible future action are made.</p>  |
| Mingxian<br>Wu | 2000        | <p>In addition to Zhengrong Sha (1997), Wu makes some further recommendations on educational investment and bilingual education.</p>  |

| Author         | Year | Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)   |
|----------------|------|---|
| Yan Ma         | 2000 | Recommendations on future action are made in the last part of the article. Results are not discussed in terms of their agreement or disagreement with results obtained by other researchers in other studies. The generalizations are consistent with the results.  |
| Yugui Ren      | 2001 | Some recommendations on future actions are made in the ending part of this article. Some connections between the results and this part are shown in that the recommendations are made along the line of some successful experiences mentioned in the previous part.   |
| Zhongyong Chen | 2003 | The recommendations on action concerning Miao-girl education in Bijie are made. Results are discussed in terms of agreement with results obtained by other researchers in other studies, but not clearly enough. Generalizations are consistent with the results. Both theoretical and practical implications of the results are discussed. The author suggests that democracy, “endogenous development centered on men”, ethnicity studies, efficiency and effectiveness should all be considered so that education efficiency should be achieved. |



## A11-10: Group II-Abstract or Summary

| Author            | Year | Abstract and Summary              |
|-------------------|------|-----------------------------------|
| Aiting<br>Guo     | 1994 | No abstract or summary presented. |
| Guangya<br>o Wang | 1994 | No abstract or summary presented. |
| Guixia<br>Guan    | 1994 | No abstract or summary presented. |
| Tianyu<br>Duo     | 1994 | No abstract or summary presented. |
| Wenpu<br>Liu      | 1994 | No abstract or summary presented. |
| Yugui<br>Ren      | 1994 | No abstract or summary presented. |
| Sumei<br>Fang     | 1995 | No abstract or summary presented. |
| Yugui<br>Ren      | 1996 | No abstract or summary presented. |

| Author  | Year | Abstract and Summary  |
|---|------|---|
| Zhengron<br>g Sha                               | 1997 | No abstract or summary presented.   |
| Laqu<br><br>Suga &<br><br>Guri<br><br>Moshi     | 1998 | No abstract or summary presented.   |
| Lijun Ma<br><br>&<br><br>Qingfeng<br><br>Wang   | 1998 | No abstract or summary presented.   |
| Yuqing<br><br>Ge                                | 1998 | There is an abstract for this article. The problem is restated. The major results are also restated. The major conclusions are not restated. A list of keywords is also provided. |
| Zhengyun<br><br>Pan &<br><br>Mingxian<br><br>Wu | 1999 | There is an abstract. The problem is restated. The major results and conclusions are also restated. A list of keyword is also provided.   |

| Author             | Year        | Abstract and Summary  |
|--------------------|-------------|---|
| Jinling<br>Ma      | 2000<br>(a) | There is an abstract for this article. The problem is restated. Major recommendations are restated. A list of keywords is also provided.  |
| Jinling<br>Ma      | 2000<br>(b) | No abstract or summary presented. But there is a list of keywords.  |
| Mingxian<br>Wu     | 2000        | No abstract or summary presented.   |
| Yan Ma             | 2000        | There is an abstract for this article. The problem is restated. The major results and the major conclusions are not restated. A list of keywords is also provided.                                |
| Yugui<br>Ren       | 2001        | No abstract or summary presented.   |
| Zhongyo<br>ng Chen | 2003        | There is an abstract for this article. The problems are restated. The major conclusions are also restated. A list of keywords is provided.<br><br>The same abstract is also available in English. |

## A11-11: Group III-Introduction

| Author        | Year | Introduction   |
|---------------|------|--|
| Jing Yang     | 1994 | This is a case study of Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region in terms of women teachers' role in education in minority areas. There is not a literature review but there is current background information on the research problem available. The references have been analyzed in the form of introducing the current status and the role of women teachers in Ningxia. Specific questions to be answered are not listed.  |
| Lihui Liu     | 1994 | The topic to be studied describes a sense of the study focus: gender difference among minority junior high school students in learning mathematics. There is not a literature review. Points of references are also missing. This study aims at improving education quality for minority girls. So, questions concerning minority girls' learning method, psychological adjustment, and mathematics capability will be investigated. Specific questions to be answered are not listed. |
| Rongguo Sun & | 1994 | This is a summary of the research on gender difference in decision making process. The topic to be studied describes a general sense of the study focus. There is a brief review on what decision making   |

| Author          | Year | Introduction   |
|-----------------|------|--|
| Chuanyan<br>Guo |      | <p>process is. This educates the reader about the problem. The implications of the problem: minority students' capability of decision making directly influences their adjustability and creativity in social activities in the future. Due to the limitations of the library supplies, whether references are cited completely and accurately is not clear. The relevancy of each reference is not explained. Not all the references have been analyzed and critiqued. The results of various studies have not been compared and contrasted. Specific questions to be answered are listed. The answers obtained are to be compared with those of the Han students. Since data for Han students, for both Han boys and Han girls, are available and also presented in this study, this goal is achievable. In this way, not only the difference lies between genders can be identified, but also that between the Han and the minorities. So minority girls' specific styles in decision making can be identified.</p> |
| Yongde<br>Zhou  | 1994 | <p>The topic to be studied describes a general sense of the study focus: the current state of women teachers' qualifications in</p>  |

| Author                                  | Year | Introduction   |
|---|------|--|
| &<br>Xuling<br>Mao                      |      | <p>minority areas in Qinghai province. There is not a literature review. Points of reference are also missing. Specific questions to be answered are not listed. But it is indicated that what the study is trying to achieve is an analysis of the women teachers' qualifications.</p>  |
| Tianlu<br>Zhang<br>&<br>Xiuying<br>Chen | 1995 | <p>The topic of this study describes a general sense of the focus of the study: minority women. It is made clear later in this article that illiteracy of minority women makes the focus of the study. There is not a separate part of literature review available. Specific questions to be answered are not listed but are reflected to be the illiteracy rates of women of different minority ethnic groups, the illiteracy models of different groups, comparing women's illiteracy rates to men's, and how to improve the situation of minority women's illiteracy.</p> |
| Yahua<br>Peng                           | 2004 | <p>The topic to be studied describes a sense of the study focus: minority girls' low school achievement. The study proposes to analyze the attribution of minority girls' low school achievement and make some recommendations on future action to improve the</p>   |

---

| Author | Year | Introduction  |
|--------|------|---|
|        |      | <p>situation. There is not a separate part of literature review. There is a discussion of the problem instead. This discussion gives implications which form an empirical rationale for the problem to be researched. Specific questions to be answered are not listed.</p> |

## A11-12: Group III-Method

| Author    | Year | Method  |
|-----------|------|---|
| Jing Yang | 1994 | The size and major characteristics of women teachers in Ningxia are described when providing background information. A separate part introducing methodology of this study is not available. No specification on research instruments is given; no rationale is given for the selection of the instruments used; no clear description of procedures is available. The research does not examine the possibility of personal bias in the study analysis and conclusion either.   |
| Lihui Liu | 1994 | A separate section of this study is dedicated to methodology. The size and major characteristics of the population studied are described. Questionnaire and survey are the major ways to collect data. The rationale is not given for the selection of the instruments used. General content of the questionnaire is described. A point of reference for the questionnaire is given. The validation procedures are not described. The questions asked in the questionnaire are not listed in the study. The percentage of returns is 98%. |
| Rongguo   | 1994 | The size and major characteristics of the population studied are  |



| Author                               | Year | Method   |
|--------------------------------------|------|--|
| Sun<br>&<br>Chuanyan<br>Guo          |      | described. Since this is a random sampling process as mentioned, questions on questionnaire, interviews, and observations will not be applied. There is a brief introduction about the target populations. They are 3,826 students of elementary schools, high schools, and colleges from six major minority ethnic groups in Qinghai province. The method of selecting the sample is not clearly described.   |
| Yongde<br>Zhou<br>&<br>Xuling<br>Mao | 1994 | The size and major characteristics of women teachers in minority areas in Qinghai province are described. The accessible and target populations, women teachers from five schools at elementary level, high school level, and college level, are described. There is not a part specifically for methodology. Therefore, neither rationale on the choice of the sample, nor on selection of the instruments is given. The procedures for data collection and data coding are not described at all. |
| Tianlu<br>Zhang<br>&                 | 1995 | No separate section is dedicated to methodology. Major characteristics of minority women are described. It is reflected that the authors collect the data from China's 1990 census. Procedures   |

| Author          | Year | Method  |
|-----------------|------|---|
| Xiuying<br>Chen |      | of collecting data and coding data are not described. The researchers do not examine the possibility of personal bias in the study analysis and conclusion either.  |
| Yahua<br>Peng   | 2004 | No separate part on methodology is given. As the article flows, it is reflected that the author does not try to confirm minority girls' low school achievement is a problem. The researcher starts from where the problem is already confirmed. Thus a point of reference is missing. It is reflected that the researcher's personal reflections are going to be the results yet the possibility of personal bias in the study analysis and conclusion is not examined. |

## A11-13: Group III-Results

| Author    | Year | Results  |
|-----------|------|--|
| Jing Yang | 1994 | <p>Since the author does not give the specific questions to be asked, whether every question has been asked is subject to more investigation which is not possible using what is available now.</p> <p>Some tables concerning women teachers' self-image; their job satisfaction; their Salaries; their social status; their job titles; their attitudes toward part-time jobs, toward educational reform, and toward political activities are presented. It is indicated that these tables have been obtained by the author from some survey. The tables are not easy to understand because of the absence of research questions for methodology in the previous part. The logic applied to produce results is reflected in discussion, but not enough to be called clear due to the same reason.</p> |
| Lihui Liu | 1994 | <p>Every question is asked and discussed. Appropriate statistics are presented clearly in tables and figures that are pertinent to the research results. The inductive logic used to produce results is not made clear. The tests of significance are interpreted using the appropriate degrees of freedom.</p>  |

| Author                                 | Year | Results   |
|--|------|---|
| Rongguo<br>Sun<br>&<br>Chuanyan<br>Guo | 1994 | <p>Not all the research results are presented in this summary. From what is available, it is shown that every question asked is answered. There is a legend for the tables shown, so they are easier to understand. The logic used to produce results is made explicit.</p> <p>The tests of significance are not interpreted. Not all the results are presented, but the presented ones are well-organized and easy to understand.</p>  |
| Yongde<br>Zhou<br>&<br>Xuling<br>Mao   | 1994 | <p>Some data on the age composition of women teachers, educational attainment levels of women teachers, and on job titles and social involvement are presented without mentioning the procedures to collect them. Some basic discussion on these data is provided, in which some basic logic applied to produce the results is reflected.</p> <p>Whether every question to be answered has been asked is subject to more investigation since the questions are not listed anywhere in this study.</p> |
| Tianlu<br>Zhang<br>&                   | 1995 | <p>It is well presented that the status of illiteracy of minority women varies with different ethnic groups, but it is worse than that of men of the same ethnic groups. The tables and figures are well</p>  |

| Author          | Year | Results   |
|-----------------|------|---|
| Xiuying<br>Chen |      | organized and easy to understand. An interpretation of the tables and figures is given in the text. Every question reflected to be asked is answered.   |
| Yahua<br>Peng   | 2004 | The researcher's personal reflections and analysis are presented as results in this article. The logic applied to produce such results is made well clear. Since the questions to be answered are not listed, whether the results have covered all of them is still subject to question. The report is an integrated and synthesized presentation of the researcher's reflections concerning the issue of minority girls' low school achievement. |

## A11-14: Group III-Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)

| Author    | Year | Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)   |
|-----------|------|---|
| Jing Yang | 1994 | <p>The results, the tables presented, are discussed not in terms of their agreement or disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies but in terms of the original topic to which they relate. Generalizations are not all consistent with the results in that generalizations are not made according to each and every table presented. Practical implications are made. The author predicts that there will be more minority-women teachers in the future and their role in minority education will be even greater. Some implications on government policies are also made in terms of women teachers' Salaries and status in political activities.</p> |
| Lihui Liu | 1994 | <p>Each result is discussed in terms of the original topic to which it relates. The results are not discussed in terms of their agreement or disagreement with other results obtained by other researchers in other studies. Theoretical and practical implications of the findings are discussed. Recommendations for future action are also made. These suggestions are based on statistical significance and practical significance both. The conclusions are based on values of</p>   |

| Author                     | Year | Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)  |
|----------------------------|------|--|
|                            |      | correlation coefficients corrected for attenuation or restriction in range.  |
| Rongguo Sun & Chuanyan Guo | 1994 | Discussion on the results is provided. They are not discussed in terms of its agreement or disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies. Generalizations are consistent with the results. Theoretical and practical implications of the findings are not discussed. It is stated that these results are useful in educational practices.                  |
| Yongde Zhou & Xuling Mao   | 1994 | This part serves the major part of the study. A discussion on the data presented previously is not given. There is a discussion on what to do to deal with some problems not made clear in the previous part. These problems include the social circumstances being not favorable to women teachers and low level of self-esteem. Generalizations thereby are not consistent with the results. |
| Tianlu Zhang &             | 1995 | Results are discussed in terms of the topic to which they relate. They are not discussed in terms of their agreement or disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies.   |

| Author          | Year | Discussion (Conclusion and Recommendations)   |
|-----------------|------|---|
| Xiuying<br>Chen |      | Generalizations are not consistent with the results. Social circumstances and involvement of women's federation are not presented in results yet they are discussed in the conclusion part.   |
| Yahua<br>Peng   | 2004 | Each result is discussed in terms of the original topic to which it relates. Generalizations are consistent with the results. But they are not discussed in terms of their agreement or disagreement with previous results obtained by other researchers in other studies.<br><br>Some practical implications of the findings are discussed and recommendations for future action are made based on it. |



## A11-15: Group III-Abstract or Summary

| Author                                  | Year | Abstract or Summary   |
|---|------|---|
| Jing Yang                               | 1994 | There is not an abstract available.   |
| Lihui Liu                               | 1994 | There is not an abstract available.   |
| Rongguo<br>Sun<br>&<br>Chuanyan<br>Guo  | 1994 | There is not an abstract available.   |
| Yongde<br>Zhou<br>&<br>Xuling<br>Mao    | 1994 | There is not an abstract available.   |
| Tianlu<br>Zhang<br>&<br>Xiuying<br>Chen | 1995 | The problem is restated in the abstract. The design used is identified. Procedures are not described. The major results and conclusions are restated. |

| Author        | Year | Abstract or Summary  |
|---------------|------|--|
| Yahua<br>Peng | 2004 | An abstract of this study is available. Problem concerning minority girls' school enrollment is stated in the abstract. The goal of minority girl education is still about universalizing nine-year compulsory education. The real problem this article is dealing with is not restated in the abstract. Neither the major results nor the conclusions are restated. |